

FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE BOARD

PUBLIC REGULATORY MEETING

VOLUME I

EGAN Convention Center
ANCHORAGE, ALASKA

April 10, 2018

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Anthony Christianson, Chairman
Charles Brower
Rhonda Pitka
Karen Mouritsen, Bureau of Land Management
Greg Siekaniec, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
Bert Frost, National Park Service
Lynn Polacca, Bureau of Indian Affairs
Beth Pendleton, U.S. Forest Service

Ken Lord, Solicitor's Office

Recorded and transcribed by:
Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC
135 Christensen Drive, Second Floor
Anchorage, AK 99501
907-243-0668; sahile@gci.net

Page 2

1 P R O C E E D I N G S
23 (Anchorage, Alaska - 4/10/2018)
45 (On record)
67 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: We'll call this
8 Board meeting to order here this afternoon, the Federal
9 Subsistence Board. Welcome everybody. I'm trying to
10 still digest my lunch, so get my brain here together.
11 So I definitely appreciate everybody coming here today
12 and participating in this public process. With that
13 I'm going to have Gene present a few clearinghouse
14 things as we review and adopt the agenda.
1516 MR. PELTOLA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
17 For the benefit of the public, my name is Gene Peltola,
18 Jr. I'm the Assistant Regional Director for the Office
19 of Subsistence Management. There's a few items that
20 OSM and Staff would like to present to the Board for
21 your consideration for potential agenda changes. I'll
22 go through that list here.
2324 First off is that one would be a
25 request to withdraw Wildlife Proposal 18-54. The
26 proponent of WP18-54, the Upper Tanana Fortymile Fish
27 and Game Advisory Committee submitted a request to
28 withdraw this proposal from consideration. A copy of
29 their request is located in the supplement section
30 number 1 of your Board materials.
3132 The proponent felt that the regulatory
33 change they proposed will, quote, end up being too
34 complicated and could easily cause friction with the
35 Copper River folks that also hunt the Nelchina Herd,
36 close quote. That is one consideration.
3738 The second would be request to remove
39 WP18-24 from the consensus agenda. The Bristol Bay
40 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council requests that
41 WP18-24 be removed from the consensus agenda and added
42 to the non-consensus agenda for Board consideration.
43 The Chair of the Bristol Bay Subsistence Regional
44 Advisory Council or Donald Mike in their absence may
45 have additional information related to this request to
46 share with the Board. That's the second action.
4748 The third request would be to remove
49 agenda item number 13. That's the Alaska Native Science
50

Page 3

1 and Engineering Program or ANSEP student presentation
2 from the agenda. The ANSEP student we asked to make a
3 presentation is unable, due to a prior commitment, to
4 attend the meeting due to school scheduling conflicts.
5

6 So those are the three items
7 administratively that Staff felt would make our process
8 here this week a lot easier if a Board could make a
9 motion to accept those.
10

11 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: All right. So
12 at this time with recommendations from the Staff I open
13 the floor for a motion.
14

15 MR. SIEKANIEC: So moved, Mr. Chair.
16

17 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: We have a
18 motion.
19

20 MS. PITKA: Seconded.
21

22 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: And seconded to
23 accept the recommended changes to the agenda. Any
24 opposition to the motion as presented.
25

26 (No opposing votes)
27

28 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Hearing none,
29 motion carries to accept the changes and we'll reflect
30 that on the agenda. Is there any additional
31 recommended changes before we adopt the agenda as
32 presented from the Board.
33

34 MR. PELTOLA: Mr. Chair, if I may. One
35 thing I'd like the Board to consider is that on the
36 agenda just after the regulatory proposal presentation
37 and prior to the wildlife delegation of authority
38 revision recommendations I'd like to get Board
39 consideration to insert a section called perception of
40 conflict interest and recusal for discussion with the
41 Board.
42

43 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Recommendation
44 by Staff to add to the agenda after 9. Do we have a
45 motion.
46

47 MS. PENDLETON: Go ahead and make a
48 motion through the Chair that we go ahead and add that
49 to the agenda.
50

Page 4

1 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: A motion has
2 been made.

3 MS. PITKA: I'll second it.

4 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: A motion has
5 been made and second. Any discussion.

6 (No comments)

7 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Any opposition
8 to the motion as presented.

9 (No opposing votes)

10 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Hearing no
11 opposition, motion carries to insert there after 9 an
12 agenda item on conflict of interest.

13 Thank you.

14 MR. PELTOLA: Mr. Chair. Earlier on I
15 had a discussion with one of the Council Coordinators
16 about potentially -- since we do have some of our
17 Regional Advisory Council Chairs still in transit and
18 not able to make it today.

19 Karen, did you have any discussion of
20 the Chairs?

21 MS. DEATHERAGE: Thank you, Gene.
22 Through the Chair. Mr. Reakoff has agreed to go ahead
23 and make that request for the agenda change.

24 Thank you.

25 MR. REAKOFF: Mr. Chair. We'd like to
26 have all the Council members here to present their
27 comments to the Board, so I'd request that at this
28 time.

29 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: All right, Mr.
30 Reakoff. I'm looking at the agenda here. Would
31 tomorrow morning suffice to move that?

32 MR. REAKOFF: I think that would
33 suffice. I think the Council members should be here.

34 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Okay. So what

35

Page 5

1 we'll do I guess is go ahead and take, without any
2 opposition from the Board here, the Regional Advisory
3 Chairs discussion and topics of concern and move it
4 down far enough on the agenda that we'll visit it first
5 thing in the morning and we can just make that our
6 agenda item as we come in and continue with our
7 business. I think that's one of the more important
8 aspects of the meeting is listening to our Council
9 Chairs and concerns.

10
11 I'm not too sure where we'll get on the
12 agenda today, but we'll place it 8:30, 9:00 in the
13 morning.

14
15 MR. REAKOFF: Sounds good. Thank you.
16

17
18 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: That way
19 everybody knows. Thanks. Any other additional agenda
20 items.

21
22 MS. LINNELL: Thank you, Mr. Chair. My
23 name is Karen Linnell with the Ahtna Intertribal
24 Resource Commission. I'd like to pull WP 17, 18 and 19
25 from the consent agenda for discussion.

26
27 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Karen, just for
28 clarification on that you would like to pull those from
29 the consensus to the non-consensus for discussion or
30 pull them entirely?

31
32 MS. LINNELL: No, I want to pull them
33 for discussion. Thank you, sir.

34
35 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Okay. So
36 you're requesting that we move it to the non-consensus
37 agenda.

38
39 MS. LINNELL: So that we can discuss
40 them, yes, sir. Again, this is a confusing process,
41 like I discussed in our tribal consultation, so this is
42 foreign to me. It's the first time we put a proposal
43 before the Federal Subsistence Board, so I'd like to
44 have the opportunity to speak to them whenever it's
45 appropriate.

46
47 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: All right.
48 Thank you, Karen.

49
50 MR. PELTOLA: Mr. Chair, if I may.

1 Based on the comments we've heard from Karen Linnell,
2 WP18-18 and 18-19 are already on the non-consensus
3 agenda, so it will be available for Board discussion
4 and deliberation. To effectuate exactly what is
5 requested, it would be more accurate to describe as to
6 pull 18-17 from the consensus and move it to the non-
7 consensus agenda.

9 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Any opposition
0 from the Board on that.

.2 (No opposing votes)

4 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Hearing none.
5 So moved. Any other additions or deletions, discussion
6 on the agenda.

_8 (No comments)

20 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Hearing or
21 seeing none. I'll call for a motion. Oh, an
22 announcement first from Gene.

This announcement pertains to agenda item number 15(a). Some of the previous years the Federal Subsistence Management Program held an art contest for all students in Alaska from grades K through 12 and accepted entries focusing on either wildlife or fish related subsistence activities.

Two winners will be selected, one in each category, fisheries and wildlife. The winners' artwork will be published on the cover of the 2018-20 wildlife regulation book or the 2019-21 fish and shellfish regulation book, both of which are distributed statewide. Student art received through the competition will also be featured inside both booklets.

A total of 315 entries were received from schools across the state of Alaska showcasing amazing student talent and the knowledge of subsistence ways of life. The top submissions from each category

1 are on the art contest table for Board members and
2 Regional Advisory Council Chairs review and to be
3 judged during the meeting.
4

5 Judging forms are on the inside pocket
6 of the Board and RAC members Chairs meeting materials
7 in your booklet. We'd please ask you to take the time
8 to review and, one, enjoy the art and, two, to turn in
9 your judgment forms to Caron McKee, who is our OSM
10 outreach coordinator, by the end of the day Wednesday,
11 which is on April 11th. The two winners will then be
12 announced on Thursday. For any additional information
13 or questions please contact Caron McKee.
14

15 Thank you, Mr. Chair.
16

17 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
18 Gene. So please vote on the art. With that I'll open
19 the floor for a motion to accept the agenda.
20

21 MR. C. BROWER: So moved.
22

23 MS. PENDLETON: Second.
24

25 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: The motion has
26 been made and second to accept the agenda as presented
27 with the recommended changes. Any opposition to the
28 motion to accept the agenda as modified.
29

30 (No opposing votes)
31

32 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Hearing none.
33 Motion carries to accept the new agenda. Now that
34 we've accepted the agenda for the meeting we open up
35 the floor for Federal Subsistence Board information
36 sharing. So before we move on I know that we've had
37 some unfortunate losses this year in connection to the
38 program, OSM and RAC members. At this time I'd like to
39 offer Beth the floor.
40

41 MS. PENDLETON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
42 And in respect to the Southeast RAC and Mr. Hernandez,
43 who has taken up the leadership role there, I would
44 just like to recognize Michael Bangs, who had served in
45 that role for a number of years very honorably, and
46 passed away quite suddenly the end of February. So
47 we'd just like to recognize Mr. Michael Bangs.
48

49 And I know that there's some others
50

Page 8

1 that we've lost and if there's others maybe we could
2 share that and then take a moment of silence. Mr.
3 Chair.

4

5 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
6 Beth. So if there's anybody else who would like to
7 acknowledge someone close to them or close to the
8 program, at this time please step forward and share
9 their name.

10

11 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. My
12 name is Donald Mike. I'm a Council Coordinator for
13 Bristol Bay and Southcentral. I just want to honor Mr.
14 Pete Abraham. He recently passed away. He was one of
15 our original charter members of the Regional Advisory
16 Council and he contributed a lot to this program and to
17 this community and his region.

18

19 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

20

21 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
22 Donald.

23

24 MR. STEVENSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
25 Board members. My name is Zach Stevenson, Subsistence
26 Council Coordinator for the Northwest Arctic and
27 Western Interior Regions.

28

29 I want to take a moment to honor the
30 legacy of Mr. Raymond Stoney, who was with the
31 Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council.
32 Raymond was considered a friend and beloved by many in
33 the Northwest Arctic.

34

35 He dedicated his life to preserving the
36 Inupiat way of life and fighting for subsistence rights
37 throughout his life. He served on the U.S. Fish and
38 Wildlife Service Migratory Bird Co-Management Council
39 as well as serving as a founding member of the
40 Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council.
41 We lost him in 2017, however his memory and inspiration
42 will continue living on in the region.

43

44 Thank you.

45

46 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
47 Zach.

48

49 MR. REAKOFF: I don't know if Greg
50

1 Roczicka has been recognized. He was on the Board of
2 Game when I first met him. He was on the Yukon Delta
3 Regional Advisory Council. Everybody here who has been
4 here very long has known Greg's contribution and it was
5 a huge loss. We worked with Greg in the Western
6 Interior with Yukon Delta on the Kuskokwim issues. So
7 I was shocked when he passed away also.

So I would like the Board to recognize him also.

12 Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
15 Jack.

Eva

MS. PATTON: Members of the Board. I
was also going to recognize Greg Roczicka. Longtime
subsistence advocate in the YK Delta region. A big
heart and caring to everyone in the region. Alissa
Rogers is the new YK Delta RAC Chair and Greg was a
mentor to Alissa for many, many years. So this is a
heartfelt time.

20
27 Thank you

28
29 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you, Eva.
30 Karen

42 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
43 Karen.

45 Enoch

46
47 MR. SHIEDT: Yeah, this is for Raymond
48 Stoney of Kiana. He served well over 20 years on the
49 Federal Advisory Board and at the AC Council too for

Page 10

1 Northwest Alaska. I mean Raymond might have been
2 small, but he has large shoes to fill, I tell you that.
3 I miss him a lot because I'm so used to calling him.
4 Everybody know he won't answer a lot of calls. He'll
5 answer mine. That way we could talk together. He said
6 the reason why I like to answer your calls is we could
7 talk in Eskimo and try to help solve our problems.
8

9 I mean he did a lot for Northwest
10 Alaska. Not only here and with the Migratory Bird also.
11 But he was there and pushing and he'd push to have kids
12 from the school attend when we had meetings in
13 Kotzebue. Made sure we'd try to invite the students to
14 our meetings. That way we could counsel and hopefully
15 someone younger will take over in our shoes. I mean he
16 did a lot and I will say thank you, Raymond.
17

18 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
19 Enoch. Ken.

20
21 MR. LORD: I'd like to recognize Dick
22 Pospahala, who was the Assistant Regional Director for
23 Subsistence back in the 1990s. He also wore a number
24 of other hats, including Assistant Regional Director
25 for Migratory Birds. He passed away on March 15th and
26 did a lot to get this program off on the right foot and
27 his legacy lives on today in what we're doing here
28 today.
29

30 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you, Ken.
31 I definitely appreciate everybody taking the time to
32 recognize those who have fallen and we've lost in our
33 lives this last year. We'll take a moment of silence
34 just to reflect on them and then we'll get started with
35 our meeting.
36

37 (Moment of silence)
38

39 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
40 everybody. Again, this time on our agenda is for
41 Federal Subsistence Board information sharing. So we
42 do again appreciate everybody's time on that and
43 respecting those who have fallen. Now it's time to
44 share information to the Board. If you have anything
45 you'd like to present, information you'd like to share,
46 feel free. The floor is yours.
47

48 MR. C. BROWER: Mr. Chair. Good
49 afternoon, everyone. Charlie Brower, public member. I
50

Page 11

1 just want to welcome everyone here to the Federal
2 Subsistence Board meeting. Also, I don't know why I'm
3 here. I should be home whaling or fishing for big
4 fish. I joke.

5

6 (Laughter)

7

8 MR. C. BROWER: I should be getting
9 ready for whaling, but I'm here, so no problem. I just
10 wanted to make you guys laugh that I was going to go
11 get some big fish, 32-foot, 40-footers, you know. Have
12 a good day.

13

14 Thank you.

15

16 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
17 Charlie. Thank you to the Staff who recognized that I
18 haven't come down from my kung po chicken from lunch
19 yet.

20

21 (Laughter)

22

23 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: A little extra
24 spicy there at the food court. Very good subsistence,
25 fifth floor.

26

27 Beth.

28

29 MS. PENDLETON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
30 Just a couple of personnel announcements for the Forest
31 Service. I think most folks know that I'm retiring the
32 end of the month after eight years as the Alaska
33 Regional Forester, but I did want to note that the
34 long-term acting coming in behind me is Mr. David
35 Schmidt. He's currently serving in Missoula, Montana
36 in our Northern Region and he has -- about two-thirds
37 of his career has been in Alaska on the Chugach
38 National Forest and the Tongass National Forest and
39 he'll be arriving next week to transition with me.
40 He's looking forward to participating with the Federal
41 Subsistence Board in that capacity.

42

43 And then also a couple of other
44 personnel changes. Mr. Ben VanAlen has also retired
45 recently and he served with the Forest Service in the
46 Federal Subsistence Program as staff for a number of
47 years.

48

49 We also have a new Deputy Regional

50

Page 12

1 Forester, Mr. Jerry Ingersoll, who will be also
2 arriving next week. While he will not be serving on
3 the Board, he will have responsibilities for a number
4 of the resources programs in Southeast and
5 Southcentral. He too also comes to Alaska with quite a
6 bit of past experience on the Tongass National Forest,
7 so we'll be welcoming these two new leaders to the
8 region in the next couple of weeks.
9

10 We also have a couple of new folks that
11 work in our law enforcement area that directly
12 contribute to our Forest Service subsistence team.
13 They include Jordan Rymer, who is serving in Moose
14 Pass. He was here this morning and I'm not sure --
15 Jordan is back over there. It's good to have him here
16 and joining the subsistence team on the law enforcement
17 side in Moose Pass on the Chugach. And then Mr. Joe
18 Boggs, who I don't think is here, but he's joining the
19 Tongass National Forest also in law enforcement.
20

21 And then we do have a group of students
22 who are observing the Federal Subsistence Board. I am
23 not seeing them right now, but we'll look for an
24 opportunity to introduce them. They are here to
25 observe the process. So perhaps when they come in we
26 can do an introduction and they're hosted by Ms.
27 Heather Bauscher, who is an adjunct professor at the
28 University of Alaska Southeast in Sitka.
29

30 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
31 Beth. Alissa, did you have something to add to that?
32

33 MS. ROGERS: No, I don't.
34

35 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Okay. She
36 covered it. Thanks. And congratulations on your
37 retirement and thank you for the invitation. I'm
38 supposed to be able to get to go, so I was looking
39 forward to it. Thank you for all your service on this
40 Board, Beth. I definitely learned a lot from your
41 leadership as you sat here. I was just a rural member
42 a few years ago and leaned a lot towards you guys and
43 how the process was run. So definitely appreciate the
44 time I've sat here with you.
45

46 Any other announcements from the Board
47 or Regional Chairs.
48

49 MR. G. BROWER: Mr. Chair.
50

Page 13

1 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Mr. Brower.
2

3 MR. G. BROWER: Gordon Brower from
4 North Slope Council. This would be my first time as a
5 Chair. I've been involved with the Regional Council
6 for about 20 years. I'm kind of new to this part of
7 the scene. I've always looked to Harry or those guys
8 to do this part of it.
9

10 One thing that I just wanted to share
11 and it relates to the current job that I hold as a
12 director of the Planning Department for the Borough in
13 developing community comprehensive plans and those
14 plans are mandated by the State of Alaska. They're
15 required by the North Slope Borough code of ordinances
16 in developing these plans.
17

18 There's a portion of that plan, and
19 about maybe 90 percent of the dialogue is from all of
20 the villages up in the Arctic North Slope, talks about
21 subsistence, preserving traditional use, preserving the
22 way of life and providing for a means for subsistence.
23 There's a portion of that plan that's called a village
24 area of influence that everybody needs to start to
25 understand.
26

27 I would like to make time sometime to
28 the area managers because this is an important feature
29 of developing community plans when food security issues
30 and the needs of the communities are needing to be met
31 and the Federal Subsistence Board I think has a mandate
32 to talk about the rural subsistence priority issues and
33 providing for those kind of needs in communities that
34 need those resources.
35

36 I'm probably going to over-explain if I
37 try to go and dwell in it. I just want to provide that
38 kind of information. The Arctic landscape is now
39 dotted with community comprehensive plans adopted by
40 the Borough assemblies, mandated by the State in
41 developing these plans.
42

43 Thank you. I don't know the
44 implications to the program, but when we're starting to
45 look at resource needs, that's what you all do.
46

47 So thank you.
48

49 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you for
50

1 that insight, Mr. Brower. Any other information
2 sharing, questions.

4 (No comments)

6 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: All right.
7 Hearing none. We'll move on the agenda. We moved the
8 next agenda item until tomorrow morning when all the
9 Chairs are present. With that we'll now open up the
0 public comment period on non-agenda items. So this is
1 the time when we open up the floor to the public to
2 discuss any items of concern that they may have in
3 regards to the subsistence program or resources that we
4 have jurisdiction over.

6 So, with that, we invite the public up.
7 We just ask that you be mindful of time. As well as
8 online. If somebody has called in if you wanted to
9 testify or make a comment to the Board, the floor is
10 open at this time. We'll also make this available at
11 the beginning of each day.

I think there's a lot of uncertainty about our communities and the level of interaction that needs to be understood by the Federal Subsistence Board is important and I don't think we do it justice from the communities that express the concerns. There needs to be a way to convey that in a way that provides examples. If you express through example, you know, it's like a picture says a thousand words.

7 So I just wanted to -- it's in light of
8 a part of what we're doing on the North Slope, but to
9 recognize the concerns about the reasonable

1 availability of subsistence resources. There's laws
2 that exist on the North Slope that say the reasonable
3 availability of subsistence resources from where
4 they're normally found. Those are features of laws
5 that exist on the North Slope that I don't think you
6 have any privy to.
7

8 They only come into play when other
9 actions -- when we are -- we're very inclusive in the
10 program of non-Federally-qualified users, rural
11 residents, rural preference. We're very inclusive, but
12 then the resources are struggling, and we've had a good
13 10 years of a decline in the Western Arctic Herd and
14 we're glad to see new technology saying there's a
15 little blip showing, there's a sign of recovery, but
16 that's a blip, it's not a trend of any sorts what
17 scientists would say.
18

19 So my concern and I think under public
20 testimony is bringing to the table our communities,
21 their needs and be very thoughtful about deliberating
22 when proposals come in because there may be only
23 recourse that we're limited to one way to try to
24 address something when there might be another option,
25 but our only way to express it solidly was this one way
26 to try to bring it to your table.
27

28 Here's an example of -- and I'm just
29 going to just use this as a quick example and not dwell
30 on this any further. I just want to make it an
31 attention. That when oil and gas industry is embarking
32 to develop around the community of Nuiqsut, we
33 recognized as a community that impacts to normal
34 hunting practices and migratory patterns would change
35 of animals because of infrastructure or obstacles
36 created by the means for these animals.
37

38 We had made a determination that even
39 though the animals are abundant you can deplete them
40 from where they're reasonably available for harvest by
41 the community and obstruct the community's needs and
42 nutritional needs for that community.
43

44 I just want to -- that little statement
45 -- and we go by a lot of times from our region we study
46 things to heck. I think bowhead whale has been the
47 most studied species on earth because of us on the
48 North Slope.
49
50

Page 16

1 We call something -- when we have a
2 very high dependency on the nutritional needs and
3 availability of those resources for a community, a
4 preponderance of the evidence exists that the community
5 needs these resources and we should not interrupt the
6 traditional hunting practice of harvest and provide
7 competing uses in the wake of those resources to be
8 reasonably available to those where they're normally
9 found. That's a law in the Borough up there.
10

11 And how we make others understand these
12 kind of things is very complicated, I think, and I
13 think it needs to come out somewhere. But I think it's
14 time to look at what we're doing and it might start to
15 impact when we start to have little portions of
16 comprehensive plans for each communities that say this
17 village area of influence and there's a definition for
18 that. The traditional and contemporary environments
19 immediately outside of the village district boundary
20 that provides for the traditional and nutritional needs
21 of the communities. So it's a very important
22 statement.
23

24 Anyway, I always tend to go a long ways
25 and overemphasize and over explain things, but these
26 are important things to learn and be cognizant as you
27 start to deliberate a lot of these different things no
28 matter if it's outside of the North Slope because
29 there's a real need to make sure and express the
30 community needs and not develop arguments in the wake
31 of their traditional practices.
32

33 Thank you.
34

35 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you, Mr.
36 Brower. Okay.
37

38 The floor is still open for public
39 testimony.
40

41 (No comments)
42

43 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: It looks like
44 we have no other public testimony. Again there will be
45 an opportunity at the beginning of each day to bring up
46 and share information or to provide comment on non-
47 agenda items as well as opportunity when each item is
48 presented. With that we'll move on the agenda to the
49 tribal/ANCSA consultation implementation guidelines
50

1 annual review.
2

3 MR. LIND: Quyana, Mr. Chair. Members
4 of the Board. Orville Lind, Native Liaison for the
5 Office of Subsistence Management. Since I've been on
6 the job three years, three months and four days -- I'm
7 not counting really.

8

9 (Laughter)

10

11 MR. LIND: The policies and guidelines
12 we follow for tribal consultation, the whos, whats,
13 hows and whys, we are to give an annual review every
14 year and this review is done by the workgroup, which
15 consists of I believe 18 members. ISC staff,
16 InterAgency staff, our staff at our office.

17

18 So what I'm doing here is I'm going to
19 give a brief summary of the consultation progress and
20 would like to hear some comments from public, RAC
21 members to see how we're doing. This is a living
22 document. It can be changed and it should be. If
23 something is not working, I definitely want to hear it
24 because I'm here to make things work. Thank you.

25

26 So we've had some comments that I'm
27 going to share from Chief Garrison. Things are going
28 pretty well as you can see. Ms. Trumble, Della, has
29 stated that as long as we keep this meaningful and
30 productive I think we'll do okay. We've heard from the
31 Fish and Wildlife Service staff that it seems to be
32 going well. I've asked for input on things that we
33 could change. I haven't had too much feedback on that,
34 which is a good thing.

35

36 Again, I'm here to listen to your
37 suggestions, your comments, to see what and where we
38 can make some changes to make this tribal consultation
39 process more meaningful and more productive. I did
40 hear from Crystal Leonetti who thinks it's going fairly
41 well. Again, it's up to the people that we consult
42 with to hear their voice and to see what changes need
43 to be changed if anything.

44

45 Forest Service and so on thinks that
46 we're doing okay. I heard from Rose Ahtuangaruak from
47 up north. She says that it seems to be going pretty
48 well. She still sees a need for improvement of
49 engaging the tribes and that's something I'm going to

50

Page 18

1 share with you after this short annual review.
2

3 So, with that, I'm going to go ahead
4 and open up the floor for some comments or questions,
5 suggestions.

6
7 Mr. Chair.
8

9 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
10 Orville, for that short and brief presentation there.
11 I also wanted to say I really did appreciate this
12 morning's tribal consultation and I'm glad that we
13 front-ended our meetings with offering that to the
14 tribes out there and ANCSA corporations to come in and
15 consult prior to the meeting. I think it's been
16 beneficial to the work that we do in looking at these
17 proposals in the time ahead of us.
18

19 So definitely appreciated that.
20

21 MR. LIND: Thank you. I would love to
22 entertain some feedback possibly from the RAC members.
23

24 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: We have Greg
25 and then Don.
26

27 MR. SIEKANIEC: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
28 This morning during some of the consultation and even
29 during a little bit of our session that we had was we
30 heard a fair amount of concern voiced about confusion
31 in the process or complications in the process. I'm
32 wondering, Orville, are you hearing the same relative
33 to the consultation methodology that we use? Really
34 what I'm wondering is so what do we do as a Board to
35 try and help add some clarity to that.
36

37 Something maybe for us to think about
38 here as we go through this meeting and perhaps come out
39 of the meeting with some sort of a recommendation on
40 how we try to add some clarity to the process so the
41 public is not struggling with being engaged with the
42 process nor would tribal and/or ANCSA corporations be
43 struggling with being engaged in the process somehow
44 because it was a pretty strongly-voiced concern this
45 morning.
46

47 MR. LIND: Thank you, Greg, for that.
48 So I'm going to talk a little bit about that after this
49 round on what we're doing to help in the direction of
50

Page 19

1 more clarity, more understanding and the whole process.
2

3 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Don.
4

5 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
6 It's a pleasure to be here. This is my first Board
7 meeting and I'm filling in for our chair Sue
8 Entsminger. The comments that I had with her were
9 directly related to this.

10 At our recent RAC meetings we aren't
11 getting much tribal consultation input and I don't know
12 the reason for that, but I think it's a very valuable
13 asset and it's a lot like TEK and the elders speaking
14 out about their experiences. I don't know how that can
15 be improved, but I think that just sending an email
16 doesn't seem to touch the people in a way it should.
17 Maybe a lot of phone calls would be much more
18 beneficial.
19

20
21 Thank you for your time.
22

23 MR. LIND: Thank you for that. We try
24 to do the best outreach possible when it comes to
25 whether it's just sending out the news releases or the
26 final invite letters to RACs and regions we can. We
27 have council coordinators that also step up to do the
28 same outreach effort. I do hear a lot of folks say
29 that they didn't receive the information. There's not
30 many tribes voicing their opinion on certain types of
31 -- whether it's regulation changes or updates, that
32 sort of thing.
33

34 Again, one of the -- well, I might as
35 well go into it now. Last October 30th down at
36 Southeast Regional Advisory Council session, the day
37 before we actually had the session we did a tribal
38 engagement session and in that tribal engagement
39 session primarily my goal was to have a presentation
40 that showed the whos, whats and whys of tribal
41 consultation. We invited the chair, the vice chair of
42 the Regional Advisory Council, we invited the directors
43 of Forest Service to attend, which they did, we invited
44 tribes. Even Seldovia got to call in.
45

46 I thought that session was the most
47 meaningful and productive session we had had and it was
48 the first one. Thanks to Melinda, who actually put
49 this together. We had I believe an hour and a half of
50

Page 20

1 just learning what tribal consultation is about, who to
2 consult with and why we should consult. I think that's
3 just going to get better.
4

5 Right now I'm working with the Bristol
6 Bay RAC to also do the tribal engagement session with
7 them at their next regional advisory session. I have
8 been invited by Western Interior to come over and do a
9 tribal session with them. I've also been invited by
10 the Northwest Arctic RAC to do a tribal session with
11 them also and just recently YK Delta.
12

13 So I'm looking forward to these
14 sessions. Again, it's going to introduce maybe some
15 more clarity of how the process works and maybe
16 understand why in some cases tribes don't get involved
17 and maybe why they should get involved. I'm looking
18 forward to those sessions.
19

20 Thank you.
21

22 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Judy.
23

24 MS. CAMINER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
25 Judy Caminer, Vice Chair of the Southcentral Regional
26 Advisory Council. I'm sure Greg Encelewski, our
27 Chairman, who will be here tomorrow, might have some
28 additional comments.
29

30 Orville, certainly you and your group
31 have done a fantastic job over the last several years
32 to really get things started, but there's so many
33 challenges on both sides. One can imagine in some of
34 the smaller communities you may be sending an email to
35 someone who is no longer there or to someone who is
36 completely overwhelmed with probably repeated requests
37 not only by this program but other programs to try to
38 keep up with consultation.
39

40 I like the idea of a two-way
41 consultation with your answer being tribal engagement
42 because I think to continually being asked for one's
43 opinion, if you got something like this printed out,
44 would be very, very challenging for those organizations
45 not set up and not maybe even understanding our program
46 as fully as some of the other organizations do.
47

48 So I guess I'd continue to encourage
49 the education part of this as well as trying to solicit
50

Page 21

1 the feedback you're asking from us here at every
2 session you go to and trying to keep your contact list
3 updated as best as possible.
4

5 Thank you.
6

7 MR. LIND: Yeah, thank you. Exactly
8 right. A lot of times when we try to connect with
9 tribes or their offices the names have changed and so
10 we try our best to update that information as we go
11 through the year. I know that I'm not the only one
12 that updates the information. Our council coordinators
13 make a great effort in keeping the contacts current.
14 We share that information as much as we can.
15

16 Also, on top of that, about six months
17 ago we had been addressing this exact problem of people
18 saying that they're not getting the information that
19 they would like to have as far as consultation. We
20 have now identified all the refuge information
21 technicians in each region. It's in a map like this
22 and it's on the website. It identified each refuge
23 information technician who can be contacted by the
24 council coordinators in our Office of Subsistence
25 Management.
26

27 For example, in Bristol Bay Region 4,
28 we have John Dyasuk. We have John Mark and the
29 supervisor Amanda. So those type of connections that
30 we're relying on to further share that information when
31 we send it out there. Once we send the information out
32 to the tribes and corporations we have no control what
33 happens after it gets out there. So we're relying on
34 more local experts to assist us in doing that.
35

36 Beyond that, I would like to also say
37 that we are on the website and I don't know of any
38 village that does not have access -- it may not be very
39 strong -- but access to our website. In that website
40 we have contacts, we have names, we have phone numbers.
41 My goal -- the first month I took this job I said I
42 wanted to do the best job I could. So I made a huge
43 mistake by putting my personal phone number on my
44 business card.
45

46 (Laughter)
47

48 MR. LIND: I will never do that again.
49 But I'll tell you what, I made a lot of friends who
50

Page 22

1 call me after hours, but still it helped out. Again,
2 my phone number is there. I have cards. Contact me if
3 you have any questions. My job here is to make
4 consultation the best it could be.

5

6 With that said, I'd like to entertain
7 any more suggestions, comments or questions.

8

9 MR. FROST: So Orville maybe you can
10 help me out. Maybe I just have a short memory. This
11 morning during our tribal consultation we had requests
12 for two sort of closed consultations. My recollection
13 is, as long as I've been on the Board, this is the
14 first time that's happened. What's the protocol? We
15 had a number of people that sort of spoke up while
16 everybody was in the room and then a couple didn't and
17 we had great conversations on both ends.

18

19 I'm just trying to understand. I think
20 it goes back to the confusion issue that Greg was
21 talking about. Is there a process, is there a
22 protocol, is there a -- what's right, what's wrong. I
23 don't know what the answer is, but I think it just sort
24 of feeds into the confusion of, you know, how do we do
25 consultation. Is it a public process, is it a private
26 process? If it's a private process, then it should be
27 a private process for everybody as opposed to just a
28 few people.

29

30 So I don't know. That was an
31 observation I made this morning. I don't know if
32 anybody else made the same observations.

33

34 MR. LIND: Thank you for that. So in
35 our policy it says it may be closed to the public. I
36 think when we're dealing with tribes and we're mandated
37 to listen to the tribes, we basically will -- for
38 example this morning. They requested to be closed
39 consultation. We made that happen.

40

41 Again, if there's any things you think
42 we may add to that to make it more meaningful, more
43 clear, I'm here.

44

45 MR. FROST: So just as a followup, so
46 that's news to me, so that's good that it says they may
47 be private, but I'm not sure that everybody knew that.
48 I didn't know that. So for other tribes that may want
49 that opportunity I think that needs to be sort of put
50

1 out there broad and wide so people know that they have
2 that opportunity. Just because it's in the policy
3 doesn't mean anybody knows about it.
4

5 I think this goes back to Greg's issue
6 of how do we communicate the business of the Board and
7 do we need a one-pager on tribal consultation and a
8 one-pager on Board procedures or something on how we --
9 you know, what are the key points that are really,
10 really important that people need to know in terms of
11 how do you deal with proposals or what do you need to
12 do for consultation and what are your options. I
13 didn't realize there was an option that it could be
14 closed, so that's good to know.
15

16 MR. LIND: Yeah, I tell you what, I'm
17 all for simplicity. Short and sweet, that's me. Again,
18 this is a living document. That's why we're here.
19 That's why we're reviewing this. Again, I would love
20 to entertain some suggestions on maybe how we can
21 shorten the process, but right now I think in the three
22 years that I've dealt with this I think it is working.
23 I just think we just need to educate more. I think we
24 need to engage the tribes more and I think it will
25 work.
26

27 MR. LORD: Mr. Frost, thank you for
28 bringing up that question because there is a legal
29 consideration there, which is that if the tribe or
30 ANCSA corporation requests a closed session without a
31 record, then we don't have anything on our
32 administrative record. If they're asking for the Board
33 to make a decision on the information they've shared,
34 we don't have anything to back that up.
35

36 So we've tried to make it clear that
37 it's okay to request that, but if they want that
38 information in the record either it has to be recorded
39 at the time or they have to put it on the record later
40 either in writing or verbally.
41

42 MS. PITKA: Hi. Rhonda Pitka. So I
43 think a couple of notes on tribal engagement. It's
44 very difficult to engage tribes with small staff that
45 maybe don't have those resources to go online and find
46 information. I'm not sure if a lot of people in this
47 room have gone to that website, but it's not the
48 easiest to find information or even a phone number
49 really. I couldn't remember someone's number and I had
50

Page 24

1 to look on there and it was not that easy.
2

3 So I think maybe getting out news
4 releases a little bit sooner to tribes. Most tribes
5 honestly still have a fax machine because the internet
6 is so unreliable. I've been a tribal leader for my
7 tribe for six years now and I've been working for my
8 tribe for 10 years and I don't believe that I've ever
9 seen a notice for tribal consultation to my tribe.

10
11 I've also been involved with the
12 Council of Athabaskan Tribal Governments for six years
13 also and that's a consortium of 10 tribal governments
14 in the Yukon Flats and I don't believe that any of
15 those tribes has ever received a tribal consultation
16 notice.

17
18 So I think maybe there's room for
19 education on both sides about what tribal consultation
20 looks like. Maybe there's also room in the Federal
21 government to have a class or something so that
22 everybody is on the same page about tribal consultation
23 and what that looks like because it can be vastly
24 different. Government to government consultation is
25 one of those things that's really, really important to
26 me.

27
28 We've done that in various ways within
29 my own tribe and within the Council of Athabaskan
30 Tribal Governments. A lot of the elders, like the real
31 leaders in our communities, don't use or trust email or
32 social media, so those avenues are a little bit
33 difficult. So one of the ways that we engage them is
34 through the radio system. Having PSAs on the radio in
35 those hub communities is really important.

36
37 Thank you.
38

39 MR. LIND: Thank you for that, Rhonda.
40 I guess, as I said before, a lot of it is who you know.
41 I love getting phone calls. I'm getting more and more.
42 People are making those connections. I would love to do
43 more tribal engagement sessions all over if I could.

44
45 Thank you.
46

47 MR. GREEN: Mr. Chair. This is Louis
48 Green.
49

1 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Online. We're
2 going to try one more here and then we need to call for
3 a short recess. We're having a problem with our mic
4 system here and recording the meeting, which is pretty
5 important as we sit here talking about consultation and
6 process and recording and making sure that things get
7 transferred forward.

8

9 It's really important that we can
10 record our meeting in its entirety and right now we're
11 having some technical difficulties. So if we can just
12 maybe follow up right here and then we're going to take
13 a little recess here to try to figure out the sound
14 system.

15

16 MR. GREEN: Mr. Chairman. This is
17 Louis Green. Do you hear me now?

18

19 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Yes, I hear
20 you, Louis. Go ahead. You have the floor.

21

22 MR. GREEN: All right. Thank you.
23 This question is for Orville and maybe a comment
24 following up. Orville, on consultation with tribes and
25 ANCSA corporations, what is your -- how successful are
26 you with the Bering Straits/Seward Peninsula regions.

27

28 MR. LIND: Louis, say that last part
29 again.

30

31 MR. GREEN: I was asking -- I'm sorry.
32 I was asking how successful you are with ANCSA
33 corporations and tribal consultations in the Bering
34 Strait/Seward Peninsula RAC region.

35

36 MR. LIND: Well, I can tell you this
37 much. In the last three years we have consulted. You
38 know, I would certainly try to engage your region --
39 you know, it really depends on the issues at hand. I
40 mean if you have a real strong subsistence issue or a
41 regulation change or, you know, special actions come
42 forth, that's when we really get involved and really
43 start getting engaged. It comes from the tribe. We
44 work for you, so the process starts with the tribes.

45

46 MR. GREEN: Thank you. So one of the
47 things that I keep running into and I've tried to
48 encourage ANCSA. I'm a director in two different
49 corporations. One of them is a village corporation,

50

1 Sitnasuak, and the other one is the regional Bering
2 Straits Regional Corporation. I'm trying to get the
3 landowner to be taking part in these consultations.
4

5 It wasn't a trick question. I was just
6 wanting to know if you were getting anything from
7 regional or any village corporations. Maybe that's a
8 big step we need to take there too because I do feel
9 the landowner, the corporations do need to be proactive
10 in this process.
11

12 The tribes -- I don't know who's all
13 there and I'm waiting on this thing. I collided with
14 another meeting here and I'm in Washington by the way.
15 How are the tribal consultations? Are they -- is
16 Kawerak who is the coordinator for the tribes in the
17 region? Not knowing who's in the room there I'm asking
18 that question maybe for myself.
19

20 But it's evident to me that tribes --
21 the ANCSA corporations who own the lands are reluctant
22 to take part in that because they think they're all
23 just about for profit. The issues with the land issues
24 and the natural resources of the lands don't seem to
25 get caught up in conversation yet. Maybe more from
26 your side might help.
27

28 I'm not sure how to operate this phone
29 system here. I'm kind of puzzled how to -- I guess I
30 can mute my phone.
31

32 Thank you.
33

34 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
35 Louis.
36

37 MR. LIND: Thank you, Louis. Yes, I
38 think we are making some progress with ANCSA
39 corporations. Anything dealing -- and with tribes.
40 Anything dealing with their resource and making
41 decisions that are going to change or affect their way,
42 you know, those are just strong avenues just to make
43 the phone calls to get involved, to really work with
44 your Regional Advisory Councils firsthand.
45

46 I think since 1993 after I worked with
47 the Regional Advisory Council in Region 4 I've seen a
48 tremendous effort on the resource they're dealing with
49 that's in decline or there's some trouble up ahead.
50

1 They are really addressing those whether it's with
2 special actions or change in regulations or developing
3 regulations.
4

5 I think there's a huge -- there's been
6 a huge change. I think more is happening in the last
7 three years I've been here. I don't know about you
8 Board members, but I think we're getting a little more
9 busier, but that's a good thing. You know, we need to
10 go with these changes. We need to allow the tribes to
11 voice their opinions and just to be heard.
12

13 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
14 Orville. Any other questions from the Board for
15 Orville on the process of tribal consultation.
16

17 Alissa.
18

19 MS. ROGERS: Thank you. Through the
20 Chair. This is Alissa Rogers. This is my first year
21 on the Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory Council. I've
22 been participating in these meetings. This is my first
23 meeting at the Federal Subsistence Board, but I've been
24 participating at the RAC meetings for the past 10 years
25 and I'm 30.
26

27 I do want to say that maybe, Orville,
28 we could put together something for the youth, starting
29 them off young like I did -- I was nine years old when
30 I first started at those meetings -- and working our
31 way up. Maybe having one session for one year. I know
32 we have only two meetings per year for the RAC meetings
33 and maybe we could get something together working with
34 the school board systems. I tried to put something
35 together to have students at our meetings.
36

37 Then also if we could incorporate maybe one
38 representative from each region to come to this meeting
39 if the Federal system can pay for them to come to this
40 meeting to learn, sit and observe and take in
41 everything because everything that we're doing here now
42 we need someone to take after and just continue as we
43 don't want this to die out and having to restart and
44 remake a whole new system.
45

46 MR. LIND: Thank you for that, Alissa.
47 You're on track. You're right on track. Working with
48 Bristol Bay Regional Advisory Council coordinator
49 Donald Mike, I've been in contact with the school
50

Page 28

1 principal, the district superintendent, and we are
2 setting up a tribal engagement session with their high
3 school, which will require Polycam working out of our
4 office at the OSM office with the students at Bristol
5 Bay. We're trying to set up to where we'll actually
6 have them involved in possibly creating a regulation or
7 maybe a special action. We just want to engage them in
8 the process to help them understand what the Regional
9 Advisory Councils are doing.

10
11 Thank you.
12

13 MS. TRUMBLE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
14 Through the Chair. My name is Della Trumble. I
15 represent -- I'm the Chair on the Kodiak/Aleutian
16 Subsistence Advisory Council. Just reiterating a
17 little bit about what Orville said about meaningful and
18 productive.

19
20 Our region is spread from Kodiak
21 through the Aleutians all the way out west. Trying to
22 work with that many tribes and people has been
23 frustrating sometimes. We've been fortunate, at least
24 when we have our meetings in Kodiak, that Sun'aq Tribe
25 has been very helpful in coordinating efforts with the
26 smaller tribes surrounding Kodiak.

27
28 For the Aleutians that's been a
29 challenge. Orville and I and Karen have talked
30 numerous times on how we can better improve on that
31 process in working more closely with the non-profits
32 that basically represent those tribes.

33
34 The piece that's frustrating even more
35 of course is with the budget cuts and us not having our
36 meetings -- we usually have our winter meeting in
37 Kodiak, but our fall meeting usually goes to the
38 Aleutian side and we've been fortunate in the past few
39 years to be able to accomplish that in communities that
40 we represent because the educational piece and the
41 opportunity for people to come forward and speak and
42 learn and the younger is right at that level.

43
44 When we have to come to our meeting --
45 possibly next meeting again in Kodiak or possibly even
46 Anchorage, we don't represent the people. We don't
47 have that opportunity to do our job representing the
48 people we serve and that is a big concern. That's the
49 issue of if you're being productive. You're not
50

Page 29

1 productive if you're not on the ground with the people
2 that we represent.
3

4 I think the other piece of it is I've
5 always been strong and vocal about the fact that we
6 have a process in place. However, I sometimes felt
7 that when you have to go through the issue of
8 consultation, I don't feel comfortable with the idea
9 that you're just going in there and checking off a box.
10 It needs to be meaningful and you need to be there to
11 do what we're outset to do.
12

13 Thank you.
14

15 And thank you, Orville. I appreciated
16 working with Orville a lot.
17

18 MR. LIND: Quyana.
19

20 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you, for
21 that.
22

23 Jack.
24

25 MR. REAKOFF: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
26 Since Orville has been working as the liaison it's been
27 a vast improvement in consultation. I do feel that
28 each Federal Subsistence Board member -- many of the
29 Regional Directors have staff that are subsistence
30 coordinators. National Park Service, BLM, U.S. Fish
31 and Wildlife Service and the Forest Service. They have
32 staff to help Orville out.
33

34 If Orville sends out stuff, their staff
35 should be calling those communities that have proposals
36 that are going to directly affect those communities.
37 Those staff should help Orville out to contact those
38 communities. They're there. They know those contacts
39 whether they're in Galena or they're in Fairbanks.
40 They have those contacts. They know who those people
41 are.
42

43 So I think that the Regional Directors
44 here should direct staff to help in this tribal
45 consultation using the staff that they already have
46 employed as subsistence coordinators to help get this
47 tribal consultation a little more plugged in with the
48 OSM program.
49
50

Page 30

1 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2

3 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
4 Jack.

5

6 Orville.

7

8 MR. LIND: Thank you. Thank you for
9 that, Jack. I've got to say in the last three years --
10 you know, it takes some time to develop a working
11 relationship or working routine and I think in the
12 three years I've been with OSM I really enjoy working
13 with the staff. They are really dedicated, motivated
14 workers.

15

16 When we send out the outreach effort
17 that comes from our office, it's mind-boggling. We
18 have coordinators working with their regions, with
19 their staff. You know, we've got the wildlife or fish
20 people doing their -- it's just an amazing amount of
21 work that comes out of that office.

22

23 I tell you right now today I'm happy to
24 be here and I'm really happy to be working with the
25 staff I'm working with today. That's why it's working.
26 It may not be perfect. We always have room for
27 improvement, but I think it's working pretty well.

28

29 Thank you.

30

31 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
32 Orville. Like you said, it's an organic living
33 document that's always got room for improvement. We
34 started with a draft and we got here today.

35

36 Any other discussion for Orville,
37 comments from the Board, Regional Chairs.

38

39 (No comments)

40

41 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: All right.
42 Hearing none. Thank you for that presentation,
43 Orville. Definitely appreciate the tribal
44 consultation.

45

46 We're going to take a five-minute
47 break. When we come back we're going to introduce the
48 students that have come in as part of the day. We'll
49 do that when we convene.

50

1 MR. LIND: Quyana.

2

3 (Off record)

4

5 (On record)

6

7 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: We'll call this

8 meeting back to order. I was just trying to make sure

9 Orville was done with his tribal engagement,

10 presentation. There were two items on the list for him

11 and I was just trying to eyeball him, but I don't see

12 him. Oh, right here. You were all finished up, right?

13 Okay. Yeah, Orville was done with his presentation.

14 Thank you for that wonderful presentation, Orville.

15

16 With that, we said after we came back

17 from the break we would invite up the students we have

18 here to introduce themselves and give a little bit of

19 information on what they're up to. So we'd invite you

20 guys up to share with us.

21

22 Thank you.

23

24 MS. BAUSCHER: Hi, everyone. Thank you

25 so very much for this opportunity for us to be here.

26 My name is Heather Bauscher. I'm an adjunct professor

27 at UAS under Jan Straley. You may remember me. I came

28 through here a year or two ago trying to set the

29 groundwork for this and it's really exciting to come

30 back a year or two later and actually have students in

31 a full dual credit class with Mt. Edgecumbe and UAS

32 Sitka. So a big thank you to the USDA for helping make

33 that happen.

34

35 I'd like to introduce the students that

36 are here today.

37

38 MS. ITTA-TOMAS: Hi, my name is Kori

39 Itta-Tomas. I'm from the North Slope, Utqiagvik. I go

40 to Mt. Edgecumbe. I'm a four-year senior. I've been

41 going since I was a freshman. In those four years I've

42 learned and met a lot of new people, a lot of people

43 around Alaska. I'm interested in learning about the

44 policies and how it plays out.

45

46 Thank you.

47

48 MS. LEAVITT: Hi, my name is Doreen

49 Leavitt and I'm from Barrow, Alaska. I'm a three-year

50

1 senior at Mt. Edgecumbe High School.
2

3 MR. MARTIN: Hi, my name is Andrew
4 Martin and I live in Sitka and I have been attending
5 Edgecumbe for two years. I am a junior and I
6 appreciate the opportunity to be here.
7

8 MR. RICE: Hello. My name is Austin
9 Rice. I'm a three-year junior. I've been attending
10 Mt. Edgecumbe since I was a freshman. We're just glad
11 to be here and thank you for letting us come.
12

13 MS. BAUSCHER: I also want to encourage
14 anybody here who would like to speak more with the
15 students on breaks please do because they do have an
16 assignment to try and make as many contacts and figure
17 out how all the pieces fit together here. So please
18 help them unravel the puzzle.
19

20 Thank you.
21

22 GEORGE: Hi, I'm George. I am an
23 AmeriCorps volunteer at UAS Sitka and I am just here as
24 a chaperone for them.
25

26 MS. BAUSCHER: George is also learning
27 too and is interested, so please talk to him as well.
28

29 GEORGE: All right. Thank you.
30

31 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
32 guys.
33

34 Any questions from the Board to the
35 students.
36

37 (No comments)
38

39 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: I just wanted
40 to know -- I know you came in here two years ago. Is
41 the basis of the class ANILCA or is it a subsistence
42 program or just policies in general in Alaska?
43

44 MS. BAUSCHER: The plan is to talk
45 about ANILCA. We didn't end up doing that at our first
46 meeting because everybody was too excited about what we
47 were going to be walking into here, but we're going to
48 talk about ANILCA a little bit. Their assignment is to
49 pick a proposal of their choosing. Maybe something
50

Page 33

1 reflecting where they're from or just something that's
2 really interesting while they're here, follow that
3 through.
4

5 As well as do a reflection and we'll be
6 meeting up at the end of each day just trying to make
7 sense of what occurred during the day and put the
8 pieces together. But I think it's really exciting for
9 them to get a chance to be here and see how all of this
10 works and learn opportunities and ways to be engaged
11 and use their voice in this process.
12

13 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you for
14 that.
15

16 MS. PITKA: I don't have a question,
17 but I would like to ask if you guys have any questions
18 of the Board. Now is a good time to ask them.
19

20 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: You have the
21 floor.
22

23 MR. RICE: So I'm from the Southeast
24 Region of Alaska. I'm from Sitka. It's illegal to
25 shoot off the boat or to harvest deer off the boat
26 because when it's moving, but I want to know why it's
27 illegal to harvest deer off a boat only in Sitka, but
28 in other regions around in the Southeast it isn't
29 illegal.
30

31 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: So I
32 understand, I think, it is legal in Sitka, right?
33

34 MR. RICE: It is not legal.
35

36 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: I don't believe
37 it's legal anywhere else in Southeast to shoot from a
38 boat. I know in our area -- huh? Under power. I
39 think you have to turn the boat off and be coasting, is
40 that what it is, or beach the boat. Where that comes
41 from is each community -- they put in a proposal based
42 on what their community customary maybe and
43 traditionally are, even contemporarily utilize how they
44 hunt, what process we go through.
45

46 So in order to make those changes what
47 you do is draft a proposal and say, okay, here in the
48 Sitka area we would want to harvest deer from a boat
49 because it's a traditional practice and then you would
50

Page 34

1 draft that proposal that says this is what we would
2 like to do and you would submit it to the Federal Board
3 for us to consider as a means necessary to harvest and
4 meet your subsistence needs.

5

6 So it is something that is still
7 possible and you come to these meetings and try to
8 change that to fit the needs of your community so that
9 you can meet the needs of your subsistence. So if
10 that's something you guys see in the future as a
11 necessity, you just have to convince the management
12 agencies, which sit here, that it's in the best
13 interest for your community to be able to harvest deer
14 from a boat.

15

16 MR. RICE: It used to be legal like
17 earlier on, but I don't know why it was deemed illegal.
18 It was legal at one time. So I was just wondering why
19 it was deemed illegal.

20

21 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: I don't know
22 the specific history, but I'm pretty sure someone put
23 in a proposal to stop hunting from a boat. If I could
24 recollect my history of it, it was I think -- like you
25 said, the boat moves, and being able to get an ethical
26 shot off sometimes is up in the air depending on the
27 perception of the person on how well you can shoot from
28 a boat and recover the animal. You've got to be a
29 pretty decent shot to shoot from a boat and get a deer,
30 which most of us in Southeast are.

31

32 (Laughter)

33

34 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: And I'm with
35 you, man. I would love to be able to harvest a deer
36 from the boat, but again we have to follow that reg.
37 To make the change, you put in a proposal to this Board
38 and get the support from your community in Sitka and
39 see if you can make that change.

40

41 MR. RICE: All right. Thank you very
42 much.

43

44 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Any other
45 questions from you guys.

46

47 (No comments)

48

49 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Don't be shy.

50

Page 35

1 Go ahead.
2

3 MR. G. BROWER: I'm not a student, but
4 in a way I am because it's my first time being able to
5 attend this. I think it's important if you're
6 interested to get your homework assignment readily
7 done, I think you have a lot of knowledge base here
8 with a lot of chairmans and Federal Subsistence Board
9 members at your fingertips and I would take advantage
10 of that.

11

12 MR. SIEKANIEC: Mr. Chairman. Thank
13 you. That was actually a great question and I think
14 why it's a great question because it demonstrates the
15 complexity in regulations and in the process that we're
16 involved with. I think the State probably has a
17 regulation relative to hunting from a boat and what
18 methods you can actually use, whether it's no longer
19 under its power or it's beached as the Chairman said.
20

21 Migratory bird rules also have
22 regulations around hunting from boats that are under
23 power. I believe we also have a special provision in
24 probably Unit 23 that you may harvest caribou from a
25 boat that's under power because of its customary and
26 traditional methodology.

27

28 So I think you asked a great question.
29 It does demonstrate the complexity around what we deal
30 with here, but also then the importance for knowing
31 where you are and what rules are actually applied. I
32 can see the boat discussion in the Southeast being
33 everything from whether it's a Federal water or whether
34 it's State waters, you know, it all will come into
35 play. Again, thanks, that was pretty good.
36

37

38 And thanks for putting the Chair on the
39 spot for us, we appreciate that.

40

(Laughter)

41

42 MR. C. BROWER: Mr. Chair.

43

44 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Go ahead.

45

46 MR. C. BROWER: I have a question for
47 all you students. Your interested in wildlife
48 management while you're at where you're at right now so
49 you can pursue it when you get to college or what?
50

Page 36

1 What's your interest?

2

3 MR. RICE: I would like to go into fish
4 biology and, if not, I would like to work somewhere in
5 wildlife management.

6

7 MS. LEAVITT: This summer in Barrow
8 I'll be working with Lesley Pierce at the Wildlife
9 Center as a college intern and then I'll be going into
10 college studying marine biology.

11

12 MS. ITTA-TOMAS: I'm partially
13 undecided, but I kind of want to go into biology. I've
14 done a lot of programs through ASRC going through Young
15 Scholars Programs in Maryland and through learning
16 methods and molecular biology, doing bio-pharmaceutical
17 production and stuff like that. So I really like
18 medicine and working in the lab, but this is kind of
19 just like a pique for me, just trying to see if I can
20 pique my interests and learn more about what I actually
21 want to do. I kind of like political science too.

22

23 MR. C. BROWER: Thank you. I think,
24 you know, there's always that need for local biologists
25 in each of our respected communities. Any student take
26 that interest and take the degree and go work in your
27 hometown it can make a lot of difference. You have the
28 background where you grew. You'll get to know
29 everything. So hopefully -- I'm encouraging you guys
30 to continue if you're interested in wildlife
31 management, biology or whatever, to continue.

32

33 Don't let nothing stop you.

34

35 Thank you.

36

37 MR. RICE: So how involved are tribes
38 in the RAC?

39

40 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: That's a good
41 question. Part of our process here today has been a
42 lot of talk about tribal consultation. One of our
43 mandates here from Washington is to consult with
44 tribes. Federal agencies have a mandate to consult
45 with tribal governments on issues related or that
46 affect them. So what you see up here is six agencies
47 that all have various levels of tribal consultation as
48 well as this Board itself.

49

50

1 This morning we held a three-hour
2 tribal consultation session to front-end the meeting so
3 we can hear concerns or issues that might arise that
4 either pertain to the agenda or not. But tribes are
5 pretty involved in the process from the top down and
6 it's one of the communities that we're mandated to
7 consult with on a government-to-government basis as
8 tribes are recognized as sovereign entities by the
9 Federal government. So tribes are pretty involved.
10

11 I know in Southeast a lot of the times
12 the proposals that get drafted are coming from tribal
13 governments themselves and their natural resource
14 programs. So tribes are very involved in it. We even
15 have here on our agenda today Ahtna Intertribal
16 Resource Commission who is applying to co-manage the
17 resources and has been authorized through an agreement
18 to do so and we have proposals in the book that we're
19 looking at to help support that effort.
20

21 So tribes are very involved and now
22 there's a new -- I call it a new era coming where co-
23 management in rural Alaska is becoming a reality and a
24 lot of that is happening with tribal governments
25 becoming more engaged in subsistence resources in their
26 area, building their natural resource programs up,
27 staffing them with people and starting to address their
28 local concerns and elevating them to this Board and
29 other agencies that can help manage those resources and
30 tribes are at the forefront of that whether they're
31 regional or a cooperative or they're a collective group
32 of them. They've become very active in managing the
33 resources in the state.
34

35 So good question.
36

37 MR. RICE: So I have a question. What
38 mechanisms are in place and what challenges do you face
39 in adapting the regulations to a dynamic environment?
40 Somebody in the other room raised a great point that
41 the moose will kind of move where they will. They
42 don't care that moose season begins on September 1st
43 and end on September 20th or whenever. Those are just
44 arbitrary dates. The populations themselves don't
45 really do what we want them to.
46

47 The onset of things like changing
48 weather patterns, warming oceans, all the problems that
49 are being caused by global climate change, these things
50

Page 38

1 will have a real impact on animal movement and stuff
2 like that. So how will this Board adjust to that sort
3 of issue?
4

5 MR. SIEKANIEC: Another good question.
6 So the program does have flexibility when issues arise.
7 We have a process called a special action process. A
8 special action process basically is a way of making a
9 fast decision outside of the cycle that you're seeing
10 here. It involves the submission of a proposal, but
11 it's a proposal for a special action request, which
12 basically is, hey, we need to do something quick here.
13 Either we weren't able to hunt because a storm came
14 through and the season closed or the population dropped
15 suddenly that nobody was expecting.
16

17 Something happened that we have to take
18 action to either allow subsistence uses to continue or
19 to preserve a healthy population or some reason like
20 that. So there is that process in place and there's
21 actually, I think, a form online for you to submit a
22 special action request and it's something we do quickly
23 on an expedited basis or as fast as we can anyway.
24

25 MR. RICE: Thank you. That's really
26 interesting. I wasn't sure how something like this --
27 generally the stereotype of Boards is that they're sort
28 of slow-moving and inflexible. So I guess it's very
29 good that.....
30

31 (Laughter)
32

33 MR. SIEKANIEC: I think he meant Board
34 members, Mr. Chair.
35

36 (Laughter)
37

38 MR. RICE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
39

40 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: You were
41 talking to somebody out there.
42

43 (Laughter)
44

45 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Well, like he
46 said, there's special actions and then there's the
47 proposal process. Then there's another process we do
48 here so that we're more reactive to what happens in the
49 field and we delegate authority to regional managers.
50

1 So if there's Refuges or District Ranger Offices that
2 have an office or a field staff out there in Alaska and
3 there's issues or resource concerns that we delegate
4 authority to the local managers so there's a more
5 reactive process in place.
6

7 When it comes to harvesting resources,
8 we understand the window is tight, especially in
9 fisheries. They come in for a week, two weeks, three
10 weeks and we have to have mechanisms in place to help
11 communities meet their needs for subsistence. So
12 that's another one of the tools in the box is to really
13 localize that authority through this Board and get
14 boots on the ground, eyes and ears out there in the
15 environment and listening to the people and trying to
16 react accordingly because ultimately our goal here is
17 to provide opportunity to harvest subsistence resources
18 in Alaska in a timely and effective manner without
19 jeopardizing the stocks.
20

21 Also, again, that's another tool we
22 have here besides special action is delegating that
23 out. There's a lot of workgroups out there when
24 there's priority resource concerns or areas that are
25 continually coming up as resource concerns are just
26 either politically or demographically charged. So we
27 try to work on those ahead of the game and put in play
28 -- to bring that out as close as we can to the resource
29 and the people of concern.
30

31 MR. RICE: So if there's a same region
32 -- let's say there's a region and there's a certain
33 amount of game in that region and there's like two sets
34 of populations that harvest from the game. There's a
35 bigger population over here but there's less game and
36 there's a smaller population of people harvesting from
37 the game, but there's more game here. Who has more of
38 a say when it comes to that region? Is it the one with
39 the higher population of game or the higher population
40 of people?
41

42 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Well, what we
43 do here is they go through an analysis process. So,
44 i.e., like the fish on say the Kuskokwim, right,
45 there's a resource issue and the fish swim upstream.
46 Obviously the people at the bottom of the stream have a
47 greater access to the fish than the people at the top,
48 so we have to try to figure out how to allocate that
49 resource as a Board and that takes working with all the
50

Page 40

1 agencies and the communities on the river.
2

3 The process requires what they call an
4 804 analysis of those communities, so they'll look at
5 the historical use of who really utilized that resource
6 and how much their dependency on it is as a community.
7 So there's a lot of factors that weigh in. They do
8 have a book that describes how that process unfolds
9 when it comes to a conservation concern for resources
10 and an abundance of resources.

11

12 Sometimes we have to also make tough
13 decisions and exclude certain user groups from
14 accessing resource at some points when there's a
15 concern, so there's multi levels to answer your
16 question, but ultimately it comes down to analyzing
17 that situation and then trying to first and foremost
18 give a priority to the rural subsistence user.

19

20 That's what this Board's primary focus
21 is, is to make sure that there's enough resource there
22 for all users and then, when there isn't, conducting
23 and analyzing the information to prioritize the
24 communities and the people who have the greatest need
25 for that resource and that falls down to the customary
26 and traditional use of it. So there's a process that
27 the Board uses or the OSM Staff uses to figure that
28 out. When we get to that it's a tough place to be, but
29 there is a process that we utilize to figure out who
30 gets that access.

31

32 MR. RICE: Thank you.

33

34 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Jack.

35

36 MR. REAKOFF: I wanted the students to
37 understand that each one of these Chairs here has 10
38 members or around that behind them. Regional Councils
39 encompass a big area. We have meetings to listen to
40 the public. A public platform to get information about
41 uses that need to be addressed through a proposal
42 process.

43

44 So the students should understand that
45 interacting with your Regional Council that's local to
46 your area is very important. You can listen in to our
47 meetings, you can have input to the meetings and you
48 can get the Councils to do things that you need to be
49 done and that's the public process. The Councils then

50

Page 41

1 either submit proposals or you submit proposals. We
2 act on those proposals, make recommendations and then
3 we advocate to this Board to try and get those
4 regulatory changes made. That's the way this system
5 works.

6

7 MR. WOODRUFF: Mr. Chair.

8

9 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Donald.

10

11 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
12 To answer your question on the end there about moose
13 and stuff. The Eastern RAC has a Proposal 53B that
14 kind of touches on that topic that you were speaking
15 about. If you want to look at that, I've got a copy.
16 You can have it.

17

18 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Just so you
19 know, you too as an individual can submit a proposal.
20 So the process is open to everybody in Alaska. If they
21 have a concern or an area, the proposal process is open
22 to the general public. So if you want to hunt a deer
23 in Southeast from a boat, you can draft that proposal
24 and work with your area biologist.

25

26 Beth right over there, that's the one
27 you would go see. Right here. She's a Board member.
28 She could direct you to the staff and start that
29 process. I know Sitka also has a very active local
30 area advisory committee as well as a subsistence
31 representative. So those options would be available to
32 you.

33

34 I definitely appreciate the engagement
35 you students brought today in asking the questions and
36 posing them to the Board in the manner you have and I
37 look forward to seeing some proposals from you guys
38 here in the future.

39

40 MS. LEAVITT: I have a question. What
41 support exists for helping members of the public to
42 participate in the writing of a proposal?

43

44 MS. PITKA: Your Council Coordinator
45 for your specific area could help you draft proposals.
46 Your Regional Advisory Council members are also very
47 knowledgeable about the proposal process. Reaching out
48 to people in your community that know a lot is very
49 helpful too, like Mr. Charlie Brower here.

50

Page 42

1 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: And you can get
2 online and find a lot of examples. There's a nice
3 website. Rhonda said it's kind of hard to get through.
4 I've gone on there too just to look at my name.

5

6 (Laughter)

7

8 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: I'm just
9 kidding. But, yeah, there is definitely a lot of
10 support in the subsistence arena if you want to draft
11 those proposals. A lot of people would love to step
12 up, especially if it's an area of concern or an issue
13 that merits that attention. There is the help there
14 necessary to draft a proposal.

15

16 MR. DOOLITTLE: Yeah, it's great that
17 you guys are here. My name is Tom Doolittle and I'm
18 Deputy Assistant Director for OSM. One of the things
19 about that is OSM does provide support to the Regional
20 Advisory Councils and everybody that we can in
21 development of proposals.

22

23 Also those from Mt. Edgecumbe you
24 should probably interview your principal superintendent
25 because she has a lot of experience in subsistence over
26 the years and she's spent a lot of time when I was out
27 in Bethel. She's a really good source for a lot of
28 stuff.

29

30 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Ken.

31

32 MR. LORD: Don't let the proposal
33 process intimidate you. A proposal doesn't have to be
34 an in-depth analysis of all the biology and stuff. We
35 have biologists for that. We really just need to know
36 what it is you're proposing. We need to be able to
37 understand what it is you're proposing and if you want
38 to add some explanation, great. If you have
39 information that bears on that, even better. But,
40 again, we're not expecting you to be experts or to
41 write a master's thesis or anything like that. The
42 form is actually fairly short. So don't be
43 intimidated.

44

45 MR. SIEKANIEC: And, by the way, it's
46 on our seamless, easy-to-use website and you'll find it
47 on there.

48

49 (Laughter)

50

Page 43

1 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Greg's in the
2 picture too.

3
4 Judy.
5

6 MS. CAMINER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
7 I'd also like to encourage you or people that you know
8 to apply for a position on the Regional Advisory
9 Councils and that would be a really good way to learn
10 the system and we're always looking for new, young
11 members and tribal members as well. So that's open
12 every year.
13

14 Thank you.
15

16 MS. LEAVITT: One of the questions was
17 would you want to become a member of the Council and I
18 guess it's coming off from what you were saying. How
19 did one of you become like a chairman, for example?
20 How did you get on the Board? How did you want to,
21 like what made you?

22 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: They made me.
23

24 (Laughter)
25

26 MS. LEAVITT: I knew it.
27

28 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Well, actually,
29 I work for my tribal government in Hydaburg. I'm from
30 Hydaburg, Alaska myself. My interest was piqued
31 because they hosted a Regional Advisory Council meeting
32 in Hydaburg in 2000, I believe it was. So they had
33 actually went out to some rural communities and I had
34 just got hired at the tribe as an EPA tech, so I was
35 working in the environmental program for the tribe and
36 I went to the subsistence meeting and they were talking
37 about fishing and hunting, which obviously in Alaska is
38 about all we do, right, next to TV.
39

40 So I'm there and I'm, like you, a young
41 student basically. Fresh out of school, sitting there
42 before a chairman like myself and we were talking about
43 issues. We were as a community trying to get a
44 community harvest program established for deer and one
45 of the community members had proposed 500 deer. The
46 Regional Advisory Council at the time shot the proposal
47 down for the community of Hydaburg with the meeting in
48 Hydaburg because there wasn't substantial data to
49
50

Page 44

1 substantiate our claim to 500 deer for a community
2 harvest program.
3

4 So I had to ask questions, well, what
5 is the data and they started to talk about populations
6 and indexes and things that we go through here on a
7 regular basis. Basically what we were missing was the
8 information to validate the 500 deer we needed for our
9 community harvest. So we started to educate ourselves,
10 myself, on how to do that, like you guys are doing
11 here.

12

13 How does the process work? How do you
14 get the proposal and what do you do? How do you get
15 that information? And started to find out that we
16 needed to do a lot of surveying and a lot of partnering
17 and a lot of educating ourselves on this process and
18 what information would help validate what needs we had
19 for the community.

20

21 So our natural resource program, which
22 I eventually am the director of now, started to do a
23 lot of creel surveys and utilizing the State system is
24 what we did. We partnered with the State of Alaska to
25 gather household survey data, harvest data and all the
26 information that we would need to substantiate our
27 needs for the subsistence resources.

28

29 That just began, I guess, my trek
30 towards being the Chairman of this Board. Then to fill
31 those resource needs and information gaps is an FRMP
32 process, which was the monitoring program that this
33 office funds. So as a staff person at the tribe, I
34 think I was 24 at the time, I submitted our first
35 application to get funding to run a weir project for
36 the FRMP process. We ended up getting funded, but
37 there was somebody on the RAC at the time that didn't
38 support the community proposal and they were from our
39 community. So the first year our proposal got shot
40 down.

41

42 So I had to go door to door and get the
43 entire community to sign on to allowing us to receive
44 the FRMP project because the number one criteria to the
45 project was to have the Fish and Game be our lead
46 partner on it and that was a touch sell in our
47 community, was to partner with the Fish and Game at
48 that time. But we were successful in selling the
49 concept to the community and ultimately got FRMP
50

Page 45

1 funding to run Hetta Lake Project is what that was
2 called and we ran a weir successfully now for 18 years.
3

4 Through that education I've learned
5 along the way, I've showed up at enough meetings and
6 voiced enough concern over resources and issues that
7 somebody nominated me to be Chairman of this Board --
8 well, not Chairman, a rural seat. There was a
9 Washington review of the Subsistence Program in Alaska
10 and one of their recommendations was to add two rural
11 members to the seat to bring a voice from basically
12 rural Alaska to this Board to help bring balance to
13 some of the decision-making that was happening.
14

15 Fortunately I got vetted through the
16 process and was seated as a rural member where Rhonda
17 is sitting now and I sat there for three years learning
18 the process. And then Tim Towarak resigned as Chairman
19 of the Board and I put my name in and ended up getting
20 the nod to be Chairman.
21

22 So it was really not something I woke
23 up when I was in high school and said I'm going to be
24 Chairman of the Subsistence Board. I thought I was
25 going to be a seine boat captain. That was probably my
26 dream at that time. But through time and experience
27 and just the work that comes towards you when you have
28 to engage at the local level and find a meaningful role
29 in this process and then try to be cordial about it, it
30 starts to bring you places when you build a network and
31 educate yourself and connect the dots to the people who
32 can help you elevate your concern in your community.
33 Pretty soon you find yourself here, I guess. It's
34 where I ended up.
35

36 So it's just about staying engaged and
37 really educating yourself in your communities and
38 elevating how important subsistence is to each and
39 every one of our communities and the members that
40 utilize the resource to fulfill a larger need in our
41 lives.
42

43 I don't think subsistence is just about
44 nutrition. It's about a larger way of life for most
45 Alaskans. So when we sit here, a lot of the time it
46 can get emotional too because people are defending a
47 lifestyle and a way of life and it's drastically
48 changing in the landscape in Alaska. We have to help
49 elevate and alleviate those concerns through this
50

Page 46

1 process.

2
3 So that's the short story of how I got
4 here and why it's important to me.
5

6 MS. PENDLETON: Through the Chair. I
7 wanted to add just a couple things because there's
8 several of us that are on the Board that represent
9 Federal agency management. I'm one of those with the
10 U.S. Forest Service for Southeast Alaska and
11 Southcentral, the Tongass and the Chugach National
12 Forest. Then my partners at the other side of the
13 table work for the U.S. Department of Interior for
14 various Federal land management agencies.
15

16 Under statute and regulation we have a
17 responsibility in Alaska to manage those Federal lands
18 in part for a rural subsistence priority for the take
19 of fish and wildlife and other cultural resources for
20 subsistence uses. It's a real important part of our
21 job. So as a part of my job I have that
22 responsibility. Fortunately I have wonderful staff who
23 also support that process.
24

25 So we have a subsistence coordinator,
26 we have an individual, Deanna Perry, who serves to
27 support the Regional Advisory Councils for those areas
28 of the state and help with the proposal process. We
29 have subsistence staff on both Forests who help with
30 the analysis. We work closely with Fish and Game, who
31 also sit at this big table here, who have a lot of the
32 data and information and research and studies and we
33 work together on providing the best science and
34 information and bringing that forward in the proposal
35 process.
36

37 So some of us sit on this Board as a
38 part of our day to day jobs as Federal land managers in
39 the state of Alaska.
40

41 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Thank you,
42 Beth. Any other questions.
43

44 (No comments)
45

46 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: I'd like to
47 thank you guys for your wonderful engagement today.
48 I'm glad you guys took the time to ask the questions
49 and push our buttons up here. Again, like I said, I
50

Page 47

1 enjoyed this last half hour. A lot of times you grind
2 through the day, but this was enjoyable and gives us a
3 little insight that there's some hope for the future.
4 I might shoot that deer from my boat yet.

5

6 (Laughter)

7

8 MS. BAUSCHER: I'd like to say thank
9 you again for allowing this to happen. Thank you for
10 support from the USDA and the Drumbeats Grant and UAS
11 and support from Jan Straley in allowing me to help put
12 this together, and Mt. Edgecumbe, Chohla Moll, the
13 amazing science teacher that helped connect me to these
14 wonderful students, George for willing to be a
15 chaperone at the last minute, and all of these
16 wonderful kids who got up and braved the 6:00 a.m.
17 flight and made time to spend their week here.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21 (Applause)

22

23 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: All right.

24 Next we're going to do Robert's Rules of Order.

25

26 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
27 Members of the Board. My name is Carl Johnson. I'm the
28 Council Coordination Division Chief for the Office of
29 Subsistence Management. I'm here to talk to you about
30 the exciting topic of the rules of parliamentary
31 procedure. I joke a little bit because a lot of times
32 when you bring up Robert's Rules you either get a
33 combination of rolling eyes and sighs, like Rhonda just
34 did.

35

36 (Laughter)

37

38 MR. JOHNSON: Robert's Rules is
39 actually one of several different types of rules of
40 parliamentary procedure. It's actually only used by
41 only a minority of State legislative chambers in the
42 U.S. Mason's Manual is the most popular type. But
43 that's for another topic.

44

45 The reason why we do these is the one
46 principal rule, the thread of these rules of
47 parliamentary procedure is to ensure that there is
48 adequate debate. That everybody has an opportunity to
49 speak. One of the themes you'll see as I go through
50

Page 48

1 some of these is that we don't want to allow one person
2 or one faction to dominate the discussion and exclude
3 others from participating. So that's one important
4 reason why we do this.

5

6 Another one of the parts of Robert's
7 Rules that kind of hides in the background that's not
8 part of these motions that we're going to discuss is
9 that Robert's Rules also sets a code of conduct of how
10 you're going to treat each other and how you're going
11 to behave in a meeting and there are actually some
12 rules related to that, but we're not going to cover
13 those.

14

15 Most importantly for this body is that
16 these rules will help you to establish a clear record
17 of what was discussed and what decisions were made. So
18 that's really the focus of my brief refresher on
19 Robert's Rules today and that is to help you all set a
20 clear record.

21

22 We've already seen the common thing you
23 have to do if you ever want to talk is you've got to
24 have the Chair recognize you. When the Chair recognizes
25 you, then you speak. In the case of the proposals
26 you're going to be discussing probably starting
27 tomorrow, but the non-consensus agenda items,
28 everything starts with a motion. I move to adopt
29 Proposal WP18-01 as found on Page blah blah blah of
30 your meeting book. What are you asking the body to do.
31 That's what a motion is. I suggest we do this.

32

33 Now the way it works is, and a lot of
34 people really get excited and they want to start
35 talking about their motion, but Robert's Rules actually
36 prohibits you from discussing the substance of your
37 motion while you're giving the motion. That's for
38 discussion. You don't get to have a discussion until
39 there's a first and second.

40

41 A lot of times folks are really eager
42 to jump in and say second and we recognize that a
43 second has been given, but sometimes there's crickets.
44 The Chair may ask of the body is there a second on this
45 motion. If there is not a second, then the motion
46 fails. Maybe nobody really wanted to support even
47 discussing what you had for your suggestion, so maybe
48 you can think of an alternative. Now let's come up
49 with another phrasing, another wording of how to
50

Page 49

1 approach this issue, try it again and hopefully you'll
2 get a second that time. The key thing is you've got to
3 have that second before you can move on.
4

5 Now when stating that motion, again,
6 it's really helpful for not only the record for this
7 administrative record for your decisions, but for
8 everybody here in the room and for folks listening on
9 the phone, it's to refer to a particular page number of
10 the meeting book that you are referring to. So if you
11 were referring to the proposal, we encourage everybody
12 to say the beginning page of where that proposal
13 appears in the book.
14

15 But if you're going to say I move to
16 adopt WP18-99 as modified by the Southeast Alaska
17 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council, then you can say
18 that modification is found on Page -- and now we're
19 pointing people again who are listening who are here in
20 the room and also for the record specifically the
21 language that you are suggesting that this body adopt.
22 That modification. That's kind of the bare bones of
23 starting this process.
24

25 Now typically, you know, anything
26 related to that subject should be handled within that
27 motion. So after you get a second, if somebody else
28 had a different idea on how to approach it, after the
29 discussion has started, they can move to amend that
30 motion. They can say, you know what, I move to amend
31 to strike a season ending date of March 31st and insert
32 instead a season ending date of April 30th.
33

34 Again you're starting from that main
35 motion. You make that specific suggestion. Again,
36 like with a motion, you have to have a second. Now
37 you're going to discuss that issue, do we want to have
38 a season ending date of April 30th instead of March
39 31st. If everybody agrees and you vote on it and
40 there's a majority vote, you now have approved the
41 amendment, but you still haven't passed that proposal.
42 So now you have to go back again and you're going to
43 now -- you're debating the original motion as amended.
44 You still have another vote to do as long as all the
45 discussion is done.
46

47 Now discussion is also a key part.
48 Again, for you, there's some really specific things
49 that are very encouraged to bring out in your
50

Page 50

1 discussion. You're all going to have different
2 rationale. The person who makes the motion gets the
3 first crack at discussion. They're the first one to
4 speak. Then after that everybody has a chance to
5 speak.
6

7 Robert's Rules -- also to ensure that
8 you don't have somebody dominating the debate, Robert's
9 Rules also says that until -- if you've already spoken,
10 you don't get to speak a second time until the Chair
11 makes sure that anybody else who wants to speak who
12 hasn't yet has a chance to speak. So you're all going
13 to have different things you want to say, but in the
14 end it's helpful -- when we're talking about
15 particularly our program, it's helpful to discuss in
16 the context of what the Regional Advisory Council
17 recommendation was whether or not in the end you want
18 to go with or go against what the Regional Advisory
19 Council recommended.
20

21 In Section .805 it says the Secretary,
22 as delegated to the Board, shall consider the
23 recommendation of the Regional Advisory Councils and
24 gives three specific instances where you cannot accept
25 that recommendation. If it's not supported by
26 substantial evidence, if it violates recognized
27 principals of Fish and Wildlife conservation or it
28 would be detrimental to the satisfaction of subsistence
29 needs.
30

31 So as part of building your record it's
32 helpful if in the discussion those things are pointed
33 to because now if the Board adopts a position in the
34 end that's contrary to the Regional Advisory Council's
35 recommendations, we have a clear statement for the
36 record because the regulations now require that you
37 submit a written report back to the Regional Advisory
38 Council. We call it the 805(c) report that explains to
39 the Council why you disagreed with their recommendation
40 and went with a different position. Again, it helps
41 us, the Staff, and also the public understand your
42 position.
43

44 The other things that may come up is,
45 you know, ending debate. Now one of the things that
46 I've seen not only with the Board but also happens a
47 lot with Regional Advisory Council questions is there's
48 this kind of knee-jerk reaction when somebody says
49 question. The Chair says the question has been called,
50

1 all those in favor say aye. Actually no.
2

3 Under Robert's Rules calling the
4 question is a motion to end debate, which requires a
5 second and also requires a two-thirds majority vote of
6 the body. So you can't just end debate like that. You
7 actually have to have two-thirds of the body agree that
8 we're going to end debate. Again, we don't -- Robert's
9 Rules is designed to prohibit -- prevent one individual
10 or one faction from controlling debate and keeping all
11 the voices from being heard.
12

13 Now the other option too is after
14 you've been discussing for a while and nobody has
15 actually made a motion but it's clear to the Chair
16 perhaps that the Board as a body has had enough
17 discussion. The Chair can suggest to the body are we
18 ready to call the question or are we ready to end
19 discussion and the Chair can ask that of the body. If
20 Mr. Christianson doesn't hear any objections, then he
21 can call a vote.
22

23 Still, again, it's requiring the Chair
24 to confirm among everybody that they've had enough
25 opportunity to discuss, they've had enough to debate
26 and they're ready to vote. At that time take a vote
27 and then declare for the record the vote has passed.
28 What does that mean? Well, that means that we will now
29 adopt Proposal 18-99 as modified by the Southeast RAC
30 into regulations. Now everybody understands what we've
31 all done. There was a motion, it was stated, it was
32 seconded, it was voted on, we stated after the vote
33 what that means and now we're ready to move on.
34

35 Except perhaps if somebody still felt
36 like there was a key issue that was not addressed from
37 that process and they want the body to go back to it
38 and take a look at it again. That's where the motion
39 for reconsideration comes in. But again, because we
40 don't want that tool to be abused, there are some
41 limitations on how that motion can be used.
42

43 First of all, if you were the loser in
44 the vote, you can't call the motion for
45 reconsideration. It actually can only be done by one
46 of the winners of the vote. Maybe they went along with
47 the vote because they had some concerns or they
48 supported it but there was something about it that
49 wasn't quite right and after the voting was done is
50

Page 52

1 when they go, oh, wait a second, yeah, no, I wanted to
2 do this.
3

4 So it's appropriate for them to call a
5 motion for reconsideration because they were part of
6 the winning vote. Ideally it's best if you do that in
7 the amendment process during the vote, but for some
8 reason if it didn't turn out that you could do the
9 amendment or you thought of it late or one of your
10 staff members emailed you a great idea or texted you a
11 great idea after the vote was done, you can bring it
12 back in a motion for reconsideration.
13

14 Now that's just kind of the quick gist
15 of what I have in this handout, which is in your
16 supplement section 6. There's a table on the third
17 page of that that covers a variety of different other
18 procedures and motions that if they come up you can --
19 there's kind of a quick handout on how to make that
20 motion, what kind of votes are required, if it requires
21 a second. There are some things that can be done
22 without a second. You can do that.
23

24 But that's just kind of a quick, handy
25 guide. One of the ones that might come up sometimes is
26 to postpone. What we often call tabling an issue. You
27 can postpone it, but again you want to say specifically
28 to a time certain. I want to postpone this until
29 tomorrow. I need to hear from our staff a little bit
30 more on this issue or we need to have a chat with our
31 solicitor, so let's postpone this issue until
32 tomorrow's item on the agenda. That's all kind of laid
33 out in this table.
34

35 The other thing I want to encourage
36 everybody too is, you know, back to the principal of
37 making a motion. Again, we want to try to make this a
38 process that's clear for everybody in the public and
39 clear for the record. So if you know, for example,
40 that you want to adopt the OSM modification of a
41 proposal, start by saying I move to adopt Proposal
42 WP18-99 as modified by OSM. That modification can be
43 found on Page 329 of your book. Start with that
44 instead of saying I move to adopt Proposal 18-99,
45 getting your second and then during discussion now I
46 move to amend my proposal to adopt the OSM
47 modification.
48

49 You can start with whatever motion you
50

1 want and you can craft it however you want. Easier to
2 start with where you want to get to rather than going
3 through this sometimes convoluted and can be confusing
4 process if there's a lot of discussion. Just start
5 with what you want and go from there.
6

7 So that's my quick overview of my
8 Robert's Rule refresher. Mr. Chair, thank you, and
9 members of the Board.

10
11 I'll be happy to answer any questions.
12

13 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Greg.
14

15 MR. SIEKANIEC: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
16 Carl, we're a Board of eight and we have a 4-4 vote.
17

18 MR. JOHNSON: On a 4-4 vote, that
19 motion fails. Now the rules are kind of squishy -- a
20 little unclear on this. Normally with a main motion if
21 that subject has already been addressed by a previous
22 main motion, it can't be brought up again with a
23 separate main motion, which is just a standard motion,
24 a motion to adopt the proposal.
25

26 But it doesn't really make a
27 distinction between a substantive decision, which
28 would be a 5-3 vote where that -- excuse me, let's go
29 with the 3-5 vote where it fails out of the actual
30 result of the vote as opposed to a procedural rejection
31 of the motion, which is what you're talking about. A
32 tie vote ends in the motion failing.
33

34 But I would encourage then if it's an
35 issue that should be addressed and better to deal with
36 things on substance than on procedure, whoever the
37 original movant was, I would suggest try a different
38 motion. Try something again or somebody else might
39 have an idea. But always better to deal with it on the
40 merits rather than on procedure.
41

42 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Ken.
43

44 MR. LORD: You and I have talked about
45 this a little bit, but that last point that you made in
46 your presentation about making a motion and then
47 embedding the amendment in the motion just because it's
48 easier. There might be a strategy involved.
49
50

1 If you can live with the proposal but
2 you really want the amendment, but you're just not sure
3 if the amendment is going to pass, and you're afraid if
4 you attach the amendment to your main motion the Board
5 might vote it down, there might be a strategy in making
6 the proposal and then if I get a second I'll make an
7 amendment. So even if your amendment gets voted down
8 you still have that original proposal.
9

10 Are you saying that it is a -- that the
11 motion is out of order if you do it that way or are you
12 just saying it's easier?
13

14 MR. JOHNSON: No, it's not out of
15 order. I know it's quite often a practice if you want
16 a modification, just start with the proposal and then
17 do an amendment. I think sometimes it's often done out
18 of a belief that that's how you have to do it, that you
19 have to start with the proposal as written and then
20 amend it through the motions process, but I was just
21 trying to say you don't have to do it that way.
22

23 But obviously there's a strategic
24 reason to approach the issue. Go with whatever you
25 think is going to work, but I was just pointing that
26 out to say that you don't have to do it that way. You
27 can actually start with what you want to have as your
28 motion.
29

30 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Don.
31

32 MR. HERNANDEZ: Thank you, Carl. On
33 the request for reconsideration, does the person making
34 the request -- does the vote always have to be in the
35 affirmative or does it just have to be on the winning
36 side of the vote, whether it's affirmative or negative?
37

38 MR. JOHNSON: Correct, the winning side
39 of the vote. So if the nays prevailed and the motion
40 failed, then the people who were in the nays can ask
41 for a reconsideration. Also, again, that's a good
42 reminder in a different, thank you, to always make your
43 motions in a positive.
44

45 I know this is often sometimes
46 confusing because if you know you want to oppose a
47 proposal, why move to adopt it because it sends this
48 idea that you support something. But the easy way I
49 always explain it to the Regional Advisory Council is
50

1 that way when you're saying no to something, you're
2 saying no to it. We move to adopt this proposal. I'm
3 going to oppose it, so I want to say no to it. But if
4 you're instead taking motions to oppose WP18-99, you
5 would have to say yes to say no and say no to say yes.
6 So it's always easier to just go the straight way even
7 if you want to oppose it.

8

9 MS. PITKA: By easier you mean clearer
10 for the administrative record. We don't mean like
11 easier for us to say. We mean clearer for the
12 administrative record.

13

14 MR. JOHNSON: Oh, definitely clearer
15 for the record but also clearer for the people voting.
16 Quite often I've seen at meetings people are confused
17 about what yes means and what no means when they're
18 voting. So having that motion in the positive helps
19 clarity in both ways.

20

21 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Tom.

22

23 MR. DOOLITTLE: Carl, the
24 reconsideration is also within the confines of the
25 meeting itself, correct?

26

27 MR. JOHNSON: That is correct. You can
28 only move to reconsider something during that meeting's
29 agenda. So here you have a four-day meeting. Now the
30 way the rules say is if you wanted -- something was
31 voted on today, you should move to reconsider it
32 tomorrow. Not on Friday if you end up going through
33 Friday, but it should be done at the next available day
34 of that meeting, but it has to be done during that
35 meeting.

36

37 Much like the RFR process that we have.
38 There's two steps to it. First you have to move to
39 reconsider and you have to all vote in the affirmative
40 that, yes, you will reconsider it and now you have to
41 have a new motion that gets to whatever it is you want
42 to reconsider. So it's a two-step process for that.

43

44 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Any further
45 questions of Carl.

46

47 (No comments)

48

49 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

50

Page 56

1 Members of the Board.
2

3 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Well, the next
4 thing on our agenda is to start all the proposals and
5 the consensus and non-consensus agenda items. What I'm
6 going to do is say let's start that tomorrow. I'm
7 going to call for a recess to the meeting and thank
8 everybody today and remind the public that we will have
9 an opportunity in the morning for public testimony as
10 well as government-to-government consultation.

11

12 MS. PENDLETON: Mr. Chair. I'll second
13 that.

14

15 MR. DOOLITTLE: Before we second that
16 just one clarification. In the morning we'll do tribal
17 government-to-government, ANCSA corporation
18 consultation summary, which Orville will summarize
19 first thing. So the homework, if you're really
20 interested, is on Page 1 and 2 to look at also about
21 the -- excuse me. An announcement of the consensus
22 agenda also will happen tomorrow, which is on Page 1
23 and 2. Also as a reminder that the public comment
24 period on consensus agenda items will occur at the
25 beginning of each meeting. So there's that opportunity
26 to comment on the consensus agenda.

27

28 The very last act that we will do will
29 be the actual adoption of the consensus agenda. So
30 what will occur will be the main discussion and
31 tomorrow will be the non-consensus agenda. Please, if
32 you are looking at the consensus agenda and you want to
33 comment at the beginning of each of our meetings,
34 that's the opportunity for public comment.

35

36 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: And then the
37 first thing in the morning as well as following public
38 testimony we will take the Regional Chairs' testimony.
39 So first thing in the morning.

40

41 Carl came back up.

42

43 MR. JOHNSON: Yes. I'm going to guess
44 that the Regional Forester took a quick lick.....

45

46 (Laughter)

47

48 MR. JOHNSON:quick look at the
49 table of the special motions where she noticed that a
50

Page 57

1 motion to recess actually has to be a motion that has
2 to be seconded, which she did, which also then requires
3 a majority vote to pass.

4

5 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: Oh, hey, hey.

6

7 MR. DOOLITTLE: But I -- sorry, Beth.

8

9 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: We're going to
10 take a 12-hour break.

11

12 (Laughter)

13

14 CHAIRMAN CHRISTIANSON: We'll see you
15 all in the morning. Thank you guys for a good day.

16

17 (Off record)

18

19 (PROCEEDINGS TO BE CONTINUED)

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

Page 58

1 C E R T I F I C A T E
23 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
4)ss.
5 STATE OF ALASKA)
67 I, Salena A. Hile, Notary Public in and for the
8 state of Alaska and reporter of Computer Matrix Court
9 Reporters, LLC, do hereby certify:10 THAT the foregoing, Pages 02 through _____
11 contain a full, true and correct Transcript of the
12 FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE BOARD MEETING, VOLUME I taken
13 electronically by our firm on the 10th day of April
14 2018 in Anchorage, Alaska;15 THAT the transcript is a true and correct
16 transcript requested to be transcribed and thereafter
17 transcribed by under my direction and reduced to print
18 to the best of our knowledge and ability;19 THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or party
20 interested in any way in this action.21 DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 20th day of
22 April 2018.

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

Salena A. Hile
Notary Public, State of Alaska
My Commission Expires: 09/16/18

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50