

0001

NORTHWEST ARCTIC SUBSISTENCE
REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL

PUBLIC MEETING

VOLUME I
TELECONFERENCE
February 14, 2022
9:00 a.m

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

Thomas Baker, Chairman
Barbara Atoruk
Elmer Armstrong
Vern Cleveland
Wilbur Howarth
Michael Kramer
Calvin Moto
Robert Schaeffer
Enoch Shiedt
Hazel Smith

Regional Council Coordinator, Eva Patton (Acting)

Recorded and transcribed by:

Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC
329 F Street, Suite 222
Anchorage, AK 99501
907-227-5312; sahile@gci.net

0002

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2

3

(Teleconference - 2/14/2022)

4

5

(On record)

6

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: It is now 9:00 a.m.,
9 so if there's no objections I'll go ahead and get
10 things started. Welcome everyone to the Northwest
11 Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council's winter
12 meeting February 14th, 9:00 a.m. And if you don't mind
13 we'll start with a moment of silence.

13

14

(Moment of silence)

15

16

17

18

19

CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thanks
everyone. And, again, this is Chair Thomas Baker from
Kotzebue. I'd like to call to order this Subsistence
Regional Advisory Council meeting.

20

21

22

Elmer Armstrong, Jr., are you on the
line this morning.

23

24

MR. ARMSTRONG: Yes.

25

26

27

28

CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good morning, Elmer.
Would you mind doing a roll call so we could try to
establish quorum.

29

30

MR. ARMSTRONG: Okay. Thomas Baker.

31

32

CHAIRMAN BAKER: Here.

33

34

MR. ARMSTRONG: Mike Elmer Armstrong.

35

36

Hazel Smith.

37

38

MS. SMITH: Here.

39

40

MR. ARMSTRONG: Mike Kramer.

41

42

(No comments)

43

44

45

46

47

MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
Council. This is Eva and Michael Kramer did let me
know he would be available this afternoon at 1:30.
Unfortunately he wasn't able to call in this morning.

48

49

Thank you.

50

0003

1 MR. ARMSTRONG: Thank you, Eva.

2

3 Wilbur Howarth, Sr.

4

5 (No comments)

6

7 MR. ARMSTRONG: Attamuk Shiedt.

8

9 (No comments)

10

11 MR. ARMSTRONG: Vern Cleveland.

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 MR. ARMSTRONG: Barbara Atoruk.

16

17 (No comments)

18

19 MR. ARMSTRONG: Calvin Moto.

20

21 (Teleconference interference -
22 participants not muted)

23

24 MR. MOTO: Here, thank you.

25

26 REPORTER: I'm sorry, did Calvin say he
27 was here. This is Tina the court reporter.

28

29 MR. MOTO: Yes, this is Calvin.

30

31 REPORTER: Okay, thank you, Calvin.
32 I'm getting some noise in the background. All right,
33 thanks. go ahead, Elmer.

34

35 MR. ARMSTRONG: Okay.

36

37 REPORTER: So somebody just signed on
38 that has their TV on in the background, could you check
39 your phone for mute please.

40

41 (Teleconference interference -
42 participants not muted)

43

44 MS. PATTON: Good morning, everyone.
45 Reminder when you're calling in to please mute your
46 phones. You can hit star, six to mute.

47

48 (Teleconference interference -
49 participants not muted)

50

0004

1 MR. ARMSTRONG: Bobby Schaeffer.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 MS. PATTON: Whoever just called in,
6 there's a lot of background noise if you could please
7 mute your phone by hitting star, six.

8

9 (Teleconference interference -
10 participants not muted)

11

12 MR. ARMSTRONG: Robert Schaeffer.

13

14 (No comments)

15

16 MR. ARMSTRONG: Brian Lee Jones.

17

18 (No comments)

19

20 MS. PATTON: And, Mr. Chair and Council
21 members. There is a.....

22

23 MR. CLEVELAND: Hello, could you guys
24 put your phones on mute, everyone, so we could hear.
25 Put your phones on mute.

26

27 REPORTER: Hold up, I'm going to
28 disconnect that line.

29

30 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Tina,
31 should we hang up and call back in.

32

33 REPORTER: No, stay on the line, please.

34

35 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay.

36

37 (Off record)

38

39 (On record)

40

41 REPORTER: Thanks for your patience, I
42 think I got that line disconnected.

43

44 MR. CLEVELAND: Is the meeting on or
45 are we late?

46

47 MR. ARMSTRONG: Yeah, this is
48 Elmer.....

49

50

0005

1 MR. CLEVELAND: Hello.

2

3 MR. ARMSTRONG:we're going
4 through roll call.

5

6 MR. CLEVELAND: Oh.

7

8 REPORTER: Go ahead, Elmer.

9

10 MR. ARMSTRONG: All right, this is
11 Elmer, I'll continue with roll call. Wilbur Howarth,
12 Sr.

13

14 (No comments)

15

16 MR. ARMSTRONG: Attamuk Shiedt.

17

18 MR. SHIEDT: I'm here.

19

20 MR. ARMSTRONG: Vern Cleveland.

21

22 (No comments)

23

24 MR. ARMSTRONG: He's here.

25

26 Barbara Atoruk.

27

28 (No comments)

29

30 MR. ARMSTRONG: Robert Schaeffer.

31

32 (No comments)

33

34 MR. ARMSTRONG: Brian Lee.....

35

36 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

37

38 MR. ARMSTRONG:Jones.

39

40 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
41 Council members. I just spoke with Robert Schaeffer
42 and he was trying to call back in and so he should be
43 joining us shortly here. And I am just giving our
44 Council Member Vern Cleveland, Sr., who's our new
45 Council member, he is actually in the seat that Brian
46 Jones was in. We just recently got those appointments
47 and so that's an update to your roster.

48

49 MR. ARMSTRONG: Okay.

50

0006

1 MS. PATTON: So Vern Cleveland, Sr., is
2 in that seat now. And just reaching out to him, he had
3 confirmed he would be on but he does have to maintain
4 the runway at his community there so he said he might
5 be out plowing and then be able to join us. So I'll
6 just touch base with Barbara and Vern and make sure
7 they're able to call in.

8
9 MR. ARMSTRONG: This is Elmer. Yeah,
10 Vern is on.

11
12 MS. PATTON: Okay. So Vern was able to
13 call in.

14
15 MR. ARMSTRONG: Yeah.

16
17 MS. PATTON: Okay, great, thank you. I
18 was probably calling him at the same time. All right,
19 thank you. And I will.....

20
21 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, I'm back on.
22 Good morning. Thank you.

23
24 MS. PATTON: Okay.

25
26 MR. CLEVELAND: Has the meeting started
27 or.....

28
29 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Vern.

30
31 MR. CLEVELAND:what's going on.

32
33 MS. PATTON: Yes, we're just doing roll
34 call to make sure we have all our Council members able
35 to connect. I know Robert -- I just spoke with Robert
36 Schaeffer he was trying to call in yet. We have our
37 other Council members on and I'll make sure that
38 Barbara can join us shortly here too.

39
40 MR. CLEVELAND: Good morning, can we
41 get the meeting started, are they calling -- they could
42 just call in. Thank you.

43
44 REPORTER: Okay, who was that talking,
45 Vern?

46
47 CHAIRMAN BAKER: This is Thomas, I
48 believe that was Vern. Vern, this is Thomas Baker, I'm
49 the Chair of the Council. Just to remind you, since
50

0007

1 we're on the phone and we can't see each other, can you
2 just say your name when you say something.

3

4 REPORTER: Thanks, Thomas.

5

6 MR. CLEVELAND: Okay, this is Vern,
7 sorry. Could we get started with the meeting so we can
8 keep going, I think they'll call in as soon as we --
9 you know we could keep going, you know. No sense
10 wasting our time. Thank you.

11

12 MS. PATTON: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair
13 and Council members. Yes, we could go ahead and
14 reconvene the meeting, I think we've got the noise
15 taken care of and we do have currently six of 10
16 Council members online and others trying to call in.
17 So we can reconvene the meeting and the others will
18 join us when they are able to connect.

19

20 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21

22 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. So it
23 sounds like with six of 10, we have quorum established.
24 Thank you, Mr. Secretary, for doing that roll call.

25

26 Again, welcome everyone to our winter
27 RAC meeting. At this time I'd just like to go through
28 and introduce ourselves, Eva, would you like to start
29 things off.

30

31 MS. PATTON: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair
32 and Council. Welcome everyone. And as noted we did
33 just have -- recently receive Secretarial appointments
34 so we do have two new Council members, Vern Cleveland,
35 Sr., and Hazel Smith and would like to welcome everyone
36 who has joined us on the teleconference today.

37

38 (Teleconference interference -
39 participants not muted)

40

41 MS. PATTON: And we just have to start
42 with a reminder for cell phones, everyone please mute
43 your phones when you're not speaking, so hit star, six,
44 or mute on your mute button. And also if you get an
45 incoming call while on teleconference make sure to
46 disconnect from the teleconference, especially for
47 agency Staff, if they get a call coming in that will
48 put us on music if you put us on hold. So right now
49 there's a lot of background noise and I know it's hard,
50

0008

1 especially because Council members are addressing the
2 group frequently so remember to just hit the star, six
3 button or the mute button on your cell phones or your
4 home phone, that will help reduce the background noise
5 so everybody can hear.

6
7 So right now we've got an open line
8 with some open noise going on in the background so
9 everybody just take a moment and look at your phone and
10 hit the star, six button to mute and then when you want
11 to speak hit star, six again to unmute.

12
13 And, again, as requested since we're
14 all meeting by teleconference if you could please state
15 your name when you're speaking and that way we know
16 who's speaking and also who's making the motions on the
17 record.

18
19 So, again, welcome everyone. We will
20 start out with a welcome and introduction. If you want
21 to lead us through that, Mr. Chair. It might be
22 helpful if we go through the agency reports and call on
23 each of the representatives one at a time and that kind
24 of helps organize folks to introduce themselves.

25
26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Sure thing, Eva. And
27 just looking at which tab the agency reports are on so
28 I can go through that.

29
30 MS. PATTON: Your Tab 1, agenda, and
31 No. 13 is agency reports.

32
33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right.

34
35 MS. PATTON: And then.....

36
37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So we'll start with,
38 do we have any tribal governments on the line this
39 morning. Any Native villages, IRAs, any tribal
40 governments.

41
42 (No comments)

43
44 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Native organizations,
45 corporations or anything along those lines.

46
47 MR. SCHAEFFER: Good morning. This is
48 Damon Schaeffer with NANA Regional Corporation.

49
50

0009

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good morning, Damon.
2 Anyone else from NANA on this morning.

3
4 (No comments)

5
6 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, any
7 other Native corporation, Native organizations
8 attending this morning.

9
10 (No comments)

11
12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, we'll
13 move on to U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Selawik
14 National Wildlife Refuge.

15
16 MR. WIESE: Good morning, Mr. Chair.
17 Members of the Council. This is Will Wiese with
18 Selawik National Wildlife Refuge.

19
20 MS. KLEIN: Good morning. This is Jill
21 Klein with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service in the
22 Regional Office in Anchorage. I'm the Regional
23 Subsistence Coordinator. Good morning.

24
25 MS. HYER: Good morning. This is Karen
26 Hyer. I'm a Fisheries Biologist with the Office of
27 Subsistence Management.

28
29 MR. LIND: Good morning, Chairman and
30 Council members. My name is Orville Lind. I'm the
31 Native Liaison for the Office of Subsistence
32 Management. Good morning.

33
34 MS. LAVINE: Good morning, Mr. Chair.
35 My name is Robbin LaVine, and I'm the Subsistence
36 Policy Coordinator for the Office of Subsistence
37 Management.

38
39 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So it sounds like
40 we're getting the OSM folks, and good morning everyone,
41 but do we have anybody else from the Fish and Wildlife
42 Service or Selawik National.

43
44
45 (No comments)

46
47 CHAIRMAN BAKER: National Park Service
48 is next.

49
50

0010

1 MS. ATKINSON: Hi. Good morning, this is
2 Hannah Atkinson with the National Park Service. I'm
3 the Cultural Anthropologist.

4
5 MR. FRONSTIN: Good morning. This is
6 Raime Fronstin, Wildlife Biologist with the National
7 Park Service.

8
9 MR. PAIZ: Hi, this is Carlos Paiz,
10 Integrated Resource Manager, National Park Service.

11
12 (Teleconference interference -
13 participants not muted - on hold)

14
15 MR. RASIC: Hi, this is Jeff Rasic. I'm
16 the Acting Superintendent for Gates of the Arctic
17 National Park calling from.....

18
19 MR. YOUNG: Good morning, this is
20 Justin Young. I'm the Archeologist for Western Arctic
21 National Park Lands.

22
23 MS. FRONSTIN: Good morning, this is
24 Marsha Fronstin. I'm Compliance and Research Permit
25 Coordinator for Western Arctic National Park Lands.

26
27 MR. HOWARTH: Good morning, it's Wilbur
28 Howarth.

29
30 MS. BRAEM: Good morning, this is Nikki
31 Braem.....

32
33 MR. HOWARTH: Good morning.

34
35 MS. BRAEM:Cultural
36 Anthropologist at Bering Land Bridge down in Nome.

37
38 MR. DOWDLE: Good morning, this is Mark
39 Dowdle Acting Superintendent for the Western Arctic
40 National Parklands, National Park Service.

41
42 REPORTER: I didn't get your name,
43 could you please state it again.

44
45 MR. DOWDLE: Mark Dowdle.

46
47 REPORTER: Thank you.

48
49 MS. HUGHES: Good morning, this is
50

0011

1 Letty Hughes, Acting Subsistence Program Analyst for
2 the Regional Office. I'm calling from Nome.

3

4 MS. OKADA: Hi. Good morning. This is
5 Marcy Okada, Subsistence Coordinator for Gates of the
6 Arctic National Park and Preserve.

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you everyone and
9 good morning. If there's no one else from the National
10 Park Service, do we have anyone on from the Bureau of
11 Land Management.

12

13 MR. SPARKS: Yes, Mr. Chair, this is
14 Tom Sparks, BLM Management, Anchorage Field Office.

15

16 MR. MCKEE: Good morning. This is
17 Chris McKee, Subsistence Coordinator out of Anchorage.

18

19 (Teleconference interference -
20 participants not muted)

21

22 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you. Good
23 morning. Anyone from the Alaska Department of Fish and
24 Game.

25

26 MR. BURCH: Hello. This is Mark Burch
27 from the Department of Fish and Game in Palmer.

28

29 MS. EDMISON: Good morning, Mr. Chair
30 and Council members. This is Nicole Edmison with
31 Region 5 here in Kotzebue. I'm a Region Biologist.

32

33 MR. SCANLON: Good morning, Mr. Chair.
34 This is Brendan Scanlon. I'm the Northwest and North
35 Slope Area Fisheries Biologist for the Department of
36 Fish and Game. Thank you.

37

38 MS. OSBURN: Good morning, this is
39 Christie Osburn. I'm the.....

40

41 (Teleconference interference -
42 participants not muted)

43

44 MR. SPENCER: This is Joe Spencer and
45 I'm.....

46

47 (Teleconference interference -
48 participants not muted)

49

50

0012

1 REPORTER: Can you repeat your name
2 again.

3
4 MR. SPENCER: Yeah, this is Joe Spencer
5 and I'm with the Division of Sportfish in Fairbanks.

6
7 REPORTER: Thank you.

8
9 MS. OSBURN: Hi. Good morning. This
10 is Christie Osburn, Unit 23, Area Biologist in
11 Kotzebue.

12
13 REPORTER: Thank you.

14
15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you. Good
16 morning everyone. Do we have anyone from Ambler Mining
17 District Access Road.

18
19 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
20 Council. They will be calling in tomorrow for their
21 presentation.

22
23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Understood. Thank
24 you, Eva. And anyone else from the Office of
25 Subsistence Management.

26
27 MS. GREDIAGIN: Hi. This is Lisa
28 Grediagin, the Wildlife Division Supervisor with the
29 Office of Subsistence Management.

30
31 MS. VOORHEES: Good morning. This is
32 Hannah Voorhees, Anthropologist with OSM.

33
34 MR. PLANK: Good morning. This is Tom
35 Plank, Wildlife Biologist with the OSM.

36
37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good morning. Welcome
38 everyone. Do we have anyone else on the line from any
39 of these agencies that didn't get to introduce
40 themselves or any members of the public that were
41 calling in this morning.

42
43 MR. CHEN: Good morning, Mr. Chair and
44 Council members.

45
46 MR. RISDAHL: Good morning, Mr.
47 Chairman. This is Greg Risdahl, USDA Forest Service
48 and ISC InterAgency Staff Committee member here in
49 Anchorage. Thank you.

50

0013

1 MR. CHEN: Good morning, Mr. Chair and
2 Council members. My name is Glenn Chen. I'm the
3 Subsistence Branch Chief with Bureau of Indian Affairs.
4

5 MR. JOLY: Hello, Mr. Chairman, this is
6 Kyle Joly. I'm a Caribou Biologist with the National
7 Park Service.
8

9 MR. SEPPI: Good morning. This is
10 Bruce Seppi, BLM, Anchorage Field Office.
11

12 MS. STANG: Good morning. This is
13 Maggie Stang with the Wildlife Troopers in Nome.
14

15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good morning.
16 Welcome. Anyone else on the line before we move on.
17

18 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, this is.....
19

20 MR. SCHAEFFER: Mr. Chair, Bob's on.
21

22 REPORTER: Could you say your name
23 again, please.
24

25 CHAIRMAN BAKER: I think that's Bob
26 Schaeffer.
27

28 REPORTER: Okay, thank you.
29

30 MR. HOWARTH: Good morning, Mr. Chair.
31 It's Wilbur Howarth, calling in late.
32

33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good morning, Bob.
34 Good morning, Wilbur. Welcome. Do we have anybody
35 else.
36

37 MR. HARRIS: Cyrus Harris, Kotzebue,
38 listening in.
39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good morning Cy.
41 Anyone else on the line.
42

43 (No comments)
44

45 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Going once.
46

47 (No comments)
48

49 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Going twice.
50

0014

1 MR. SHIEDT: Good morning, Attamuk.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, well, thank
4 you everyone. Good morning, Attamuk. So thank you
5 everyone for that. We will move on to review and
6 adoption of the agenda. Does anyone have any additions
7 they'd like to make to the updated agenda that was sent
8 out, I believe, it was sometime last week from Eva.

9

10 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
11 Council members. This is Eva Patton, Council
12 Coordinator. And just so everybody has those updates
13 to the agenda, again, we did have a wildlife special
14 action request that was submitted by the National Park
15 Service and BLM regarding muskox in Unit 22 and 23,
16 muskox permitting. And we have included that WSA22-01
17 under new business at the bottom. If you turn to the
18 second page of your agenda under Item 12, new business,
19 we have added an H at the bottom before we get to
20 agency reports, we'll address the muskox permit request
21 at that time.

22

23 And also under new business the
24 nonrural, the call for nonrural determinations did not
25 make it out in the first round of agendas and so that
26 is a brief overview for the Council that will come
27 right after the call for fisheries proposals. So under
28 Item 12 B.

29

30 And then lastly we had just provided a
31 little bit of a clarification when we get to, under old
32 business, Item 11, old business, deferred Wildlife
33 Special Action 21-01 to close moose and caribou hunting
34 to non-Federally-qualified users in Unit 23 and 26A.
35 Those analysis are separated into two separate
36 analysis, one for caribou and one for moose. So we
37 will take up a caribou and prior to the analysis have
38 opportunity for all the relevant caribou reports at
39 that time and then get into the analysis after the
40 population updates and permitting information and all
41 of that discussion.

42

43 So those were the few changes, or
44 updates that we had since the meeting materials were
45 mailed out.

46

47 Thank you, Mr. Chair and Council.

48

49 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. Does

50

0015

1 anyone have any request to move things around or are we
2 happy with the way the agenda looks at this time.

3

4 (No comments)

5

6 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Would anyone like to
7 move to adopt the agenda.

8

9 MR. ARMSTRONG: This is Elmer
10 Armstrong. I make a motion to approve the agenda.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Motion by Elmer, do we
13 hear a second.

14

15 MR. SHIEDT: I'll second.

16

17 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Who was that?

18

19 (No comments)

20

21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Who just seconded?

22

23 REPORTER: Could you tell me who made
24 that second please.

25

26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Just a reminder when
27 you're saying something just introduce yourself, I
28 didn't catch whose voice that was that made the second.

29

30 MR. SHIEDT: Attamuk.

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk.
33 We have a motion from Elmer and a second from Attamuk,
34 all those in favor of adopting the agenda please say
35 aye.

36

37 IN UNISON: Aye.

38

39 CHAIRMAN BAKER: And those opposed,
40 same sign.

41

42 (No opposing votes)

43

44 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, we will
45 go ahead and adopt the agenda as presented. And we
46 will move on to the election of officers.

47

48 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
49 members of the Council. For the record my name is Eva

50

0016

1 Patton and I am the Council Coordinator for the
2 Northwest Arctic Subsistence Regional Advisory Council
3 and the designated Federal officer. So in accordance
4 with the Council charter, Council members elect a
5 Chair, a Vice Chair and a Secretary for a one year term
6 so we hold elections once a year at the winter meeting.
7 The term usually starts at the beginning of the
8 calendar year. So whoever is elected at this meeting
9 would then assume those seats.

10

11 Currently, our Chair is Thomas Baker.
12 I will open the floor for nominations of the Council
13 Chair and then once the Chair is elected they will
14 resume with the nominations for Vice Chair and
15 Secretary.

16

17 So a nomination does not need to be
18 seconded and when the nominees names are called out,
19 we'll just repeat to confirm the nomination and then we
20 don't need to vote on the nomination but when the
21 nominations are all complete then we'll proceed with a
22 vote and election of the officers.

23

24 So at this time we'll open the floor
25 for nominations for Chair.

26

27 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, I'd
28 nominate.....

29

30 MS. ATORUK: Good morning.

31

32 MR. HOWARTH:Thomas Baker for
33 Chair.

34

35 MS. ATORUK: Good morning.

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Is that Barbara.

38

39 MS. ATORUK: Good morning.

40

41 MS. PATTON: Yes, go ahead. Yes, good
42 morning, is that you Barbara.

43

44 MS. ATORUK: Yes.

45

46 MS. PATTON: Okay, wonderful.

47

48 MS. ATORUK: Yes, it is.

49

50

0017

1 MS. PATTON: Thank you for joining us.
2 Wonderful. Thank you for joining us, glad you were
3 able to connect this morning.

4
5 MS. ATORUK: Okay.

6
7 MS. PATTON: Barbara, we are just
8 on.....

9
10 MS. ATORUK: Okay. I will nominate --
11 Mr. Chair.

12
13 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Barbara, at this
14 time.....

15 MS. ATORUK: I want to make a
16 nomination.....

17
18 CHAIRMAN BAKER:it will go to
19 Eva.

20
21 MS. ATORUK:for Chair.

22
23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: You can make a
24 nomination.

25
26 MS. ATORUK: Okay.

27
28 MS. PATTON: Okay.

29
30 MS. ATORUK: I'd like to nominate Enoch
31 Shiedt, Enoch Shiedt, Sr., please.

32
33 MS. PATTON: Okay. So we have a
34 nomination.....

35
36 MR. CLEVELAND: Second.

37
38 MS. PATTON: We have a nomination for
39 Thomas Baker and a nomination for Enoch Shiedt, Sr.

40
41 MS. ATORUK: I'd like to.....

42
43 MR. CLEVELAND: I want to.....

44
45 MS. ATORUK:close the nomination.

46
47 MS. PATTON: And if there are no
48 further nominations then we can close nominations. And
49 it's a little challenging over teleconference. If we
50

0018

1 can, we'll do a vote one at a time so that we can hear
2 who's being voted for, and we'll start with a
3 nomination for Thomas Baker for Chair. All those in
4 favor of Thomas Baker as Chair, please say aye, and
5 then I will ask you to identify yourself so we can get
6 it on the record.

7

8 MR. HOWARTH: Aye, Wilbur Howarth.

9

10 MS. SMITH: Aye.

11

12 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Wilbur.

13

14 MR. SCHAEFFER: I, Bob Schaeffer.

15

16 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Bob.

17

18 MS. SMITH: Aye, Hazel Smith here.

19

20 MR. ARMSTRONG: Aye.

21

22 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Hazel. And
23 there was another yes that I didn't catch.

24

25 MR. ARMSTRONG: Aye, Elmer Armstrong.

26

27 MR. CLEVELAND: I didn't get what we're
28 doing.

29

30 MS. PATTON: I'm sorry, was there any
31 other votes for Thomas Baker for Chair.

32

33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Aye, this is Thomas
34 Baker.

35

36 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Thomas.

37

38 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Was that Vern that
39 said they didn't catch what we're doing, did I hear
40 that.

41

42 (Pause)

43

44 REPORTER: Yes, Thomas, that was Vern.

45

46 MS. PATTON: I didn't catch that,
47 what.....

48

49 MR. CLEVELAND: What are you guys

50

0019

1 doing.

2

3

MS. PATTON: Did we have a.....

4

5

6

MR. CLEVELAND: I just want to know
what's going on here, thank you.

7

8

MS. PATTON: Oh, hi, Vern.

9

10

MR. CLEVELAND: Thank you.

11

12

MS. PATTON: Hi Vern.

13

14

MR. CLEVELAND: Vern.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MS. PATTON: Thank you. Sorry, if you
got disconnected there. Right now we are on election
of officers and we have two nominations. One is Thomas
Baker who's our current Chair, and a nomination for
Enoch Shiedt to be Chair. So right now we are on a
vote for Thomas Baker as Chair if you would like to
vote, Vern.

23

24

(No comments)

25

26

27

MS. PATTON: So, again, all those in
support of Thomas Baker for Chair.

28

29

(No comments)

30

31

32

MS. PATTON: Are you still able to hear
Vern, did you want to vote?

33

34

35

MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, I can hear you.
Thank you.

36

37

38

39

MS. PATTON: Okay. Okay. So, again,
last call, all those in favor of Thomas Baker for Chair
please say aye and identify yourself.

40

41

(No comments)

42

43

44

45

46

MS. PATTON: Okay. So we will close
the vote for Thomas Baker. And we have a vote for
Enoch Shiedt. So all those in favor of Enoch Shiedt
please say aye and identify yourself.

47

48

49

50

MS. ATORUK: Aye. Barbara Atoruk.

0020

1 MS. PATTON: Okay. Thank you, Barbara.

2

3 MR. SHIEDT: Aye, Enoch.

4

5 MS. PATTON: And thank you, Enoch. And
6 any others in favor of Enoch Shiedt for Council Chair,
7 please say aye and identify yourself.

8

9 MR. MOTO: Aye, Calvin Moto.

10

11 MR. CLEVELAND: Aye. (In Native)

12

13 MS. PATTON: I'm sorry, I didn't catch
14 your name.

15

16 (No comments)

17

18 MS. PATTON: Can you please repeat your
19 name. Someone said aye but I didn't catch your name.

20

21 MR. CLEVELAND: Aye. Vern.

22

23 MS. PATTON: Vern. Okay, Vern
24 Cleveland, Sr.

25

26 MS. PATTON: Okay. So one last call,
27 any others who support Enoch Shiedt as Chair please say
28 aye.

29

30 (No comments)

31

32 MS. PATTON: Okay, we will close the
33 voting and we have five votes in favor of Thomas Baker
34 for Chair and three votes for Enoch Shiedt as Chair.
35 So Thomas Baker will remain Council Chair for the next
36 year. Thank you, Council members and thank you
37 Chairman Baker, and I will turn over the election of
38 officers for Vice Chair and Secretary to you.

39

40 Thank you.

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. And
43 thank you everyone for your support. We'll just move
44 right along to Vice Chair, do we have any nominations
45 for Vice Chair.

46

47 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, this is
48 Wilbur.....

49

50

0021

1 MR. CLEVELAND: Hello.

2

3 MR. HOWARTH:I would like to
4 nominate Michael Kramer.

5

6 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So a nomination by
7 Wilbur for Mike Kramer. Any other nominations for Vice
8 Chair at this time.

9

10 MR. SHIEDT: And I'll second they be
11 closed.

12

13 MS. SMITH: This is Hazel Smith Harris,
14 I nominate Robert Joseph Schaeffer.

15

16 MR. SCHAEFFER: I decline.

17

18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: There's a nomination
19 for Bob and Bob declines.....

20

21 MR. CLEVELAND: I second.

22

23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay. Seconded. Any
24 other nominations for Vice Chair besides Michael
25 Kramer.

26

27 (No comments)

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Going once.

30

31 (No comments)

32

33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Going twice.

34

35 (No comments)

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Last call for.....

38

39 MS. ATORUK: I nominate.....

40

41 CHAIRMAN BAKER:nominations for
42 Vice Chair.

43

44 MS. ATORUK:Enoch Shiedt.

45

46 MR. SHIEDT: And I decline.

47

48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: There's a nomination
49 for Enoch -- nomination for Enoch and Enoch declines.

50

0022

1 Any other nominations.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none we'll go
6 ahead and close nominations and it appears that we just
7 have Michael Kramer nominated so de facto, Michael
8 Kramer shall be the Vice Chair again this year.

9

10 Next we have Secretary. Do we have any
11 nominations for Secretary.

12

13 MR. ARMSTRONG: This is Elmer, I'll
14 nominate Hazel Smith.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Nomination for Hazel.
17 Do we have any other nominations for Secretary.

18

19 MS. ATORUK: Who.....

20

21 MS. SMITH: I nominate Elmer
22 Armstrong.....

23

24 MS. ATORUK:who's the Vice Chair?

25

26 MS. SMITH:this is Hazel.

27

28 CHAIRMAN BAKER: I'm sorry, Hazel, I
29 think Barbara was saying something. Barbara, what did
30 you say.

31

32 MS. ATORUK: I was asking who is the --
33 who did you put in for Vice Chair?

34

35 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Mike Kramer since he
36 was the only one nominated.....

37

38 MS. ATORUK: Oh, he got.....

39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER:that accepted.

41

42 MS. ATORUK: Mike Kramer -- there was
43 Mike Kramer, Bobby Schaeffer and Enoch Shiedt, we
44 didn't vote.

45

46 CHAIRMAN BAKER: But Bob Schaeffer.....

47

48 MR. SCHAEFFER: Because we all
49 declined.

50

0023

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: and Attamuk
2 declined their nominations.

3

4 MS. ATORUK: Oh, okay, and then Bobby
5 Schaeffer was also nominated.

6

7 CHAIRMAN BAKER: And he declined.

8

9 MS. ATORUK: Oh, okay. All right.
10 Mike Schaeffer it is -- I mean Mike Kramer it is.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
13 Barbara.

14

15 MR. ARMSTRONG: Mr. Chair, this is
16 Elmer.

17

18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hazel were you making
19 -- yes, Elmer.

20

21 MR. ARMSTRONG: I would decline.

22

23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: And Elmer declines his
24 nomination for Secretary. So far we just have a
25 nomination for Hazel. Do we have any other nominations
26 for Secretary.

27

28 MR. CLEVELAND: Make a motion the
29 nominations be closed. Move on. Thank you.

30

31 REPORTER: Is that Bob or Vern.

32

33 MR. CLEVELAND: Vern.

34

35 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Vern.
36 Yeah, that was Vern.

37

38 REPORTER: Okay, thank you.

39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So at this time if we
41 have no other nominations for Secretary, we'll go ahead
42 and close things and so it looks like, Hazel,
43 congratulations, you are our new Secretary.

44

45 If we don't have any more questions on
46 election of officers we will move on to the review and
47 approval of previous meeting minutes. So in our
48 packets we have the meeting minutes from the November
49 1st and 2nd fall meeting of 2021, does anyone have any

50

0024

1 questions or comments that they would like to make, any
2 revisions that they would like to see be made.

3

4 (Teleconference interference -
5 participants not muted)

6

7 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair and Council.
8 Just so the Council can find it easily in your packets,
9 the meeting minutes are under Tab 3 of your binder.
10 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. So if
13 you all can look at Tab 3, do we have any amendments or
14 changes we'd like to be made or are we fine with how
15 the minutes from the November 1st and 2nd of last year
16 look.

17

18 REPORTER: Okay, so while we're.....

19

20 MS. SMITH: Hazel Smith Harris. In
21 reviewing the minutes on the second page it says Wilbur
22 Howard of Noorvik, that needs to be corrected to Wilbur
23 Howarth.

24

25 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hazel.

26

27 MS. PATTON: Thank.....

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: It's on the second
30 page of the minutes under Council member and Chair
31 reports, Wilbur Howard and it needs to be Wilbur
32 Howarth.

33

34 MS. PATTON: Thank you very much for
35 catching that. Duly noted and I will make that change.
36 Thank you.

37

38 (Teleconference interference -
39 participants not muted)

40

41 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, thank you, Hazel.
42 Any other changes we'd like to see made in the minutes.

43

44 (No comments)

45

46 MS. ATORUK: Make a motion to approve
47 the minutes with the change please.

48

49 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Motion to approve the

50

0025

1 minutes with the change noted made by Barbara, do we
2 have a second.

3

4 MR. CLEVELAND: Second. Vern.

5

6 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Seconded by Vern. All
7 those in favor of approving the minutes with the
8 amendment, please say aye.

9

10 IN UNISON: Aye.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All those opposed.....

13

14 MR. CLEVELAND: Aye, Vern. Call for
15 question.

16

17 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay, thank you, Vern,
18 so with that, we will go ahead and approve the meeting
19 minutes for November 1st and 2nd of 2021. We will move
20 on to the overview of the 2021 Council charter changes.
21 Eva is that your time here.

22

23 MS. PATTON: Yes. Yes. Thank you, Mr.
24 Chair and Council members. Again, this is Eva Patton,
25 Council Coordinator. And you will find your Council's
26 2021 charter under Tab 15 so it's at the back of your
27 binders in your meeting materials and it is also posted
28 on the Federal Subsistence Program website.

29

30 So all 10 Subsistence Regional Advisory
31 Councils were chartered under the Federal Advisory
32 Committee Act and the Council's charters are renewed
33 every two years. So last year the Councils reviewed
34 the charters and proposed some changes. And the
35 Federal Subsistence Board supported most of the
36 Councils proposed changes and forwarded its
37 recommendations to the Secretary of Interior and
38 Agriculture who review and approve the charters each
39 cycle.

40

41 Nine Councils -- nine of the 10 Federal
42 Subsistence Regional Advisory Councils had requested to
43 add carryover terms, a clause in the Council's charter
44 to avoid temporary vacancies on the Council that occur
45 when seats expire -- current number of term seats
46 expire and the Secretarial appointments have not yet
47 been made. So some Council members may recall there
48 were numerous vacancies that occurred the last couple
49 years when Secretarial appointments weren't made before

50

0026

1 the current seats expired. So the Secretaries did
2 support this change to your charter and the clause and
3 carryover term was added to your charter and can be
4 found under Section 12 in the membership and
5 designation. And the added language reads:

6
7 If appointments for a given year has
8 not been announced, a member may continue to serve on
9 the Council following the expiration of his or her term
10 until such appointments are made, unless reappointed,
11 the member serves on the date of the announcement even
12 if that member's seat remains unfilled.

13
14 So that would provide that buffer, so
15 to speak, so that the Council doesn't end up with
16 numerous vacancies while waiting for the next round of
17 Secretarial appointments. And those.....

18
19 (Teleconference interference -
20 participants not muted)

21
22 MS. PATTON:seats would still be
23 voting seats until new appointments are made.

24
25 The Board also supported the North
26 Slope Subsistence Regional Advisory Council
27 recommendation to strike out subsection 4(h) and 4(i)
28 of Section 4, description of duties from all Council
29 charters. And it's not in your charter now, so what
30 that was was a Secretarial Order from the previous
31 Administration that was inserted into all FACA
32 Committees and had no real relevance to the work of the
33 Councils under Title VIII of ANILCA and so that was the
34 concern that the North Slope Council had, to make sure
35 that just the Council's duties and authorities under
36 Title VIII of ANILCA were included in your charter.
37 So, again, these subsections were inserted into the
38 Council's charter since 2017 and the renewal by the
39 previous Administration and the Executive Order cited
40 in these subsections were either irrelevant or revoked
41 by the newly issued Executive Order with the current
42 Administration. And the Secretaries approved this
43 change request and those sections, 4(h) and 4(i) were
44 removed.

45
46 And, additionally, the Northwest Arctic
47 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council requested to
48 increase the number of members to 12 and the Board did
49 not support this charter change at the time seeking
50

0027

1 further justification for the need for 12 seats and
2 challenges with declining budgets and increasing costs
3 for when Councils are traveling. The Board considered
4 that increasing the number of seats on the Council
5 would not ensure that adequate representation of all
6 communities across the Northwest Arctic, if that was
7 the Council's goal. But we are working on outreach to
8 get applications that would provide a broader range of
9 representation on the Council.

10

11 Thank you, Mr. Chair and Council
12 members. That concludes the report for the charter
13 changes. If there's any questions from the Council
14 about those changes to your Council charter.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. Does
17 anyone have.....

18

19 MS. ATORUK: Yeah.....

20

21 CHAIRMAN BAKER:a -- go ahead.

22

23 MS. ATORUK: Yes, Mr. Chair.

24

25 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Barbara,
26 go.....

27

28 MS. ATORUK: I have.....

29

30 CHAIRMAN BAKER:ahead.

31

32 MS. ATORUK: Yeah. Through the Chair.
33 Eva, when did we request to change our membership to
34 12.

35

36 MS. PATTON: Thank you. Through the
37 Chair. Thank you for that question, Barbara. That
38 was, let's see a year ago, when -- so the Council
39 reviews its charter every two years and makes those
40 recommendations to their charter or reapproves their
41 charter as written and so it was a year ago, during
42 that process, when the Council makes those
43 recommendations and then submits those recommended
44 changes to the Federal Subsistence Board.

45

46

47 (Teleconference interference -
48 participants not muted)

49

50

0028

1 MS. ATORUK: Humm. Okay, I hadn't
2 heard of it and I've been on the Council for awhile and
3 that's why I was asking because already we're Kotzebue
4 heavy. There's seven here on the Board that are from
5 Kotzebue and only two from the villages. And so that's
6 why I was wondering, maybe two more would have helped
7 and we would get some village applications. Is Mike or
8 Calvin online or are they excused.

9
10 MR. MOTO: I'm here Barbara, this
11 is.....

12
13 MS. PATTON: Calvin is.....

14
15 MR. MOTO:Calvin.

16
17 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

18
19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara. Calvin
20 was introducing himself, he is online.

21
22 MS. ATORUK: Oh, okay, thank you, sir.

23
24 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr.....

25
26 MS. ATORUK: And Mike is out or.....

27
28 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair
29 and.....

30
31 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Mike is.....

32
33 MS. PATTON:Council members.
34 Mike will be on at 1:30 this afternoon. He wasn't able
35 to call in this morning but he will be joining us at
36 1:30 this afternoon. Thank you.

37
38 MS. SMITH: Mr. Chair, this is Hazel
39 Smith Harris. I understand Barb's concern about
40 villages. I just want it to be known that I was born in
41 Noatak and grew up in Kiana and I just currently live
42 in Kotzebue so I understand village concerns and I know
43 where they're coming from.

44
45 Thank you, Chair.

46
47 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hazel.

48
49 (Teleconference interference -
50

0029

1 participants not muted)

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Is there any other
4 questions regarding the Council charter changes from
5 last year.

6

7 (No comments)

8

9 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, thank
10 you, Eva, for that overview and if we have any more
11 questions we'll be sure to follow up with you outside
12 of the meeting. It's now 10:00 o'clock, would anyone
13 like to entertain a 10 minute recess or would we like
14 to just move on to Council member reports.

15

16 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

17

18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara.

19

20 MS. ATORUK: Before I make the motion
21 to do that, we were on -- I must have missed it or not
22 heard but then I thought we -- did we get done
23 approving the minutes. I know I made a motion to
24 approve, but I didn't hear a second or that action
25 taken. Thank you.

26

27 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, thank you,
28 Barbara. We did hear your motion and Vern seconded it
29 and then we voted on it and it was approved to --
30 approve the minutes with that correction you brought
31 up.

32

33 MS. ATORUK: Okay, thank you, sir. And
34 then make a motion to take a 10 minute break.

35

36 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.
37 Does anyone want to second taking a break.

38

39 (Pause)

40

41 MR. ARMSTRONG: Second. This is Elmer.

42

43 REPORTER: Thanks, Elmer.

44

45 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Seconded by Elmer.
46 All those in favor of a 10 minute break, coming back at
47 10:10, please say aye.

48

49 MS. ATORUK: You don't need to do that.

50

0030

1 IN UNISON: Aye.

2

3 MS. ATORUK: You just call it, you're
4 the Chair.

5

6 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All those opposed,
7 same sign.

8

9 (No opposing votes)

10

11 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you everyone,
12 we'll go ahead and take a 10 minute break. It would
13 probably be easier if you could stay on the line rather
14 than hanging up and calling back in but we will get
15 started back up with Council member reports at 10:10.

16

17 (Off record)

18

19 (On record)

20

21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, it's 10:10.
22 Council members, I'll just run down the list to check
23 that we're back. Elmer, are you on the line.

24

25 (No comments)

26

27 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hazel, are you on the
28 line.

29

30 (No comments)

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Calvin Moto, are you
33 on the line.

34

35 (No comments)

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Attamuk, are you on
38 the line.

39

40 MR. SHIEDT: Yes.

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk.
43 Vern, are you still on with us.

44

45 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, I'm here.

46

47 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Vern.

48

49 Wilbur, are you on the call.

50

0031

1 MR. HOWARTH: Yes.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Wilbur.

4

5 Bobby, are you still with us.

6

7 (No comments)

8

9 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Barbara, are you on
10 the line.

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Elmer. Elmer
15 Armstrong, are you on the line.

16

17 (No comments)

18

19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hazel Smith Harris,
20 are you on the line.

21

22 (No comments)

23

24 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Calvin Moto, II, are
25 you on the line.

26

27 MR. MOTO: I am here, Mr. Chair.

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Calvin.
30 And so with that it looks like we're still missing
31 Barbara, Bobby, Elmer and Hazel. We could go ahead and
32 get started with Council member reports and when they
33 join us they could join us. So we'll start with
34 Attamuk, would you like to give your Council member
35 report at this time Attamuk.

36

37 MR. SHIEDT: I hate to make this long
38 but I'll make it short and sweet because these
39 teleconferences are hard ones.

40

41 Yes, there was some caribou. A lot of
42 people and I -- first time I went up to Noatak I saw
43 caribou but this is what bothered me, when I saw
44 caribou, we used to see bunches, like how many
45 thousands and we never see those in bunches anymore.
46 There's something wrong with -- Mother Nature is taking
47 its course on its own way and I think what is happening
48 is we're trying to -- our caribou are going down,
49 everybody know that, but that's just what I see.

50

0032

1 There's so much bears and the wolves, and these are the
2 other takers that having a big impact on our caribou,
3 so much wolves and so much bears and we need to try to
4 preserve our caribou.

5

6 And there was a lot of berries and
7 hardly any fish this summer, salmon, otherwise
8 everything is there for us to take.

9

10 So, thank you, I got to make it short
11 and sweet. There's more to say but due to
12 teleconference I'm going to -- thank you.

13

14 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
15 Attamuk. Vern, would you like to give a report on the
16 subsistence activities that you've been experiencing in
17 your community.

18

19 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, this is Vern
20 Cleveland, Noorvik. Our hunting's been -- we haven't
21 seen anything, no caribou came up this way, until
22 almost freeze-up, then they showed up and that gave a
23 lot of guys hardship on gathering of caribou. And the
24 migration, the route -- you guys seen -- the migration
25 route that's been happening and saw that it keeps
26 hitting the Red Dog Road. The caribou keep hitting
27 that road and keep going back, bouncing back, back and
28 forth. And just got to stop, for the migration of the
29 caribou, I mean if they're hitting the road and going
30 back, and we're saying, hey, it's climate change and
31 something, it can't be clima -- it's got to be
32 something else. And like industry, development, Red
33 Dog -- Red Dog itself. And we have another mine going
34 up as well, the Ambler. So we are in a stage of maybe
35 losing our herd. Caribou. If we don't acknowledge
36 what we're trying to do here. If we say that we want
37 to do it this way then we got to do it, we just can't
38 let it fall underneath the rug and just forget about
39 it.

40

41 For instance like we said we want the
42 outside hunters to quit hunting during migration time
43 but it's not happening because of different lands where
44 the migration route is. And we complain about, hey,
45 it's the hunters fault, we don't know that, we can't
46 say it's the hunter's fault, it might be weather and
47 how we lose the -- decrease of caribou herd, we haven't
48 heard anything of acknowledgement or anything but one --
49 one guy I talked to about caribou is -- he said (In

50

0033

1 Native) and I (In Native), you know, and we didn't look
2 at it until the story came up that avalanches might
3 wipe out caribou the way -- the way I looked at it when
4 he say (In Native), he said that's what it meant,
5 avalanche. So we got to look at that avalanches on
6 where caribou herd are, and the count of the caribou is
7 not very certain, we don't know whether it is or --
8 because there's abundance of caribou right now right --
9 right in Shungnak, I mean right in their city limits
10 right now as we speak and they're abundant.

11
12 And they might -- but our hunting, it's
13 been raining. We had rain in January. And once you go
14 out there it's just like a highway, just crust, no
15 nothing, you know. But I was wondering how the caribou
16 are doing if there's crust on the -- on the snow, you
17 know, there's ice on top of the snow and that was my
18 concern of caribou not eating or -- but I didn't go out
19 as far as I used to.

20
21 But we have concerns here that -- to
22 try and help out our villages on who and where we can
23 hunt, who can hunt and who can hunt on Park lands, like
24 subsistence hunters, I heard were busted in the Upper
25 Kobuk. Subsistence hunters. Maybe we should work with
26 the Park Service, the Park lands that are near the
27 Upper Kobuk right there and we try to not ticket the
28 subsistence hunters that are subsisting. That should
29 be brought up and I hear this quite often. I think
30 it's wrong. And they said they got ticketed because
31 they didn't have a hunting license, but they should
32 have a hunting license for sure but -- in this day and
33 age. But, you know, with all the reports I hear of
34 wolves and bears and all kinds of abundance here and
35 there, our river eroding. By God I hadn't gone up
36 river to Shungnak or Kobuk in years and I finally did
37 and by golly that river sure changed of erosion. I
38 think that guy's right at Maniilaq. He might be a
39 little bit right because the river in some places is
40 getting straight on the Upper Kobuk, above Kobuk, you
41 know, and I was wondering about that story so it's
42 coming through.

43
44 And one more little note, the ones that
45 are maybe concerned about maybe the caribou near
46 Shungnak, if there's anybody up there, the Teshekpuk
47 Herd that are going up -- up that way but I'm not sure
48 if they are the Teshekpuk Herd. I'd like to find out,
49 if anybody could find out and see if they are the
50

0034

1 Teshekpuk Herd that are late migration in the Upper
2 Kobuk area as we speak, I'd like to find out.

3
4 Thank you and have a good day. Thanks
5 Tom.

6
7 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank
8 you.....

9
10 MR. CLEVELAND: That's my report, thank
11 you.

12
13 CHAIRMAN BAKER:for your report,
14 Vern. Thank you. Next, Wilbur, would you like to give
15 your report.

16
17 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, thank you, it's
18 Wilbur Howarth, Noorvik. I seen on the Facebook page a
19 lot of caribou up by Shungnak. We had some down here
20 on the Peninsula and they -- they're not as fat as the
21 ones hanging around Shungnak, those look real nice.
22 But there's quite a few down the Peninsula from
23 Kotzebue towards -- they're over towards Buckland area
24 and Selawik, that big mountain over that way.

25
26 Otherwise, yeah, we still have problems
27 with wolves and a lot of bears. This past fall I seen
28 a lot of bears.

29
30 But the good thing about the moose was
31 I saw most of the females with twins so that was, to
32 me, a plus on the moose side. Otherwise Vern did a
33 good job on the caribou report.

34
35 Fishing. It was cold this spring for
36 the -- when we dry fish and we had a tough time. Yeah
37 he said, Mother Nature is running the course.

38
39 Otherwise I don't know if I should
40 report on this Ambler Road right now or -- I had a
41 meeting in Anchorage on the Ambler Road.

42
43 CHAIRMAN BAKER: If you'd like to you
44 can go ahead, Wilbur. I know someone from the Ambler
45 Metals will be presenting for us tomorrow but if you'd
46 like to speak on your meeting now you can or you can
47 wait until tomorrow.

48
49 MR. HOWARTH: I have everything right
50

0035

1 here with me, I'll just go ahead and give a short
2 report and if there's any questions I probably could
3 answer them. There's five of us from the NANA region.
4 Blaire Westlake, she's co-Chair. Morgan Johnson from
5 Ambler. Henry Horna, Kobuk. And we had Nellie
6 (Indiscernible) from Shungnak call in. And Liz
7 Corvollo (ph), she's from the NANA. And there's five
8 from the Dalton that were there. Then the speakers
9 were David and Kevin. Kevin is from -- they're both
10 from the Anchorage area. He did the report on -- or
11 ran the -- practically. Sharlene, I think she's on
12 here with us.

13
14 But anyway right now what they're doing
15 is they did studies already last year, field studies
16 within that 211 Mile road and there's 59 bridges has to
17 be put in. I don't know how much they did already but
18 they're doing -- working their way -- and I think they
19 completed the engineering designs, surveying, they did
20 over 50 sites, mostly related to the water crossing.
21 They completed field work, 39 of 59 cultural resources
22 and that's 691 acres surveyed. They had 22 hires for
23 the project. So they're still hiring out of the
24 villages that are closest to the road. We -- their
25 goals right now is they're concentrating on going into
26 the villages and hiring to do more work and studies.

27
28 Let's see, we -- it was a two day
29 meeting. The AIDEA is the one that is running
30 practically everything right now so they'll be working
31 with -- they were scheduled to go into the Kobuk,
32 Ambler, Shungnak area to hire. They have some workers
33 already up at Ambler Mining area, that flies out and do
34 studies towards ending of the road. So they're pretty
35 busy right now. They said this summer should -- they
36 should -- at least by the summer they should have all --
37 all the workers in place.

38
39 Is there any questions, Council.

40
41 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

42
43 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Barbara.

44
45 MS. ATORUK: Wilbur, when was this
46 meeting, at Kotzebue, or teleconference or.

47
48 MR. HOWARTH: No, we had it in
49 Anchorage, January 11th. The meetings are quarterly so
50

0036

1 our next meeting will be April 6th in Kotzebue.

2

3 MS. ATORUK: And the people were
4 elected by or they were called, the members?

5

6 MR. HOWARTH: They were elected by the
7 -- I think the Federal Subsistence Board and I was
8 called by the Chair Larry Westlake if I was interested
9 and I told him yes. And I believe Vern is alternate.

10

11 MS. ATORUK: Okay. Because if that was
12 the case, the Federal Board should have let us know to
13 see if we would like to nominate from our Council to be
14 on there and I would have suggested that we nominate
15 Bobby Schaeffer since he's so in tune to the area and
16 the region about all this stuff and he's got good
17 information. And.....

18

19 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair. Mr. Chair.

20

21 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah.

22

23 MS. ATORUK: Go ahead, Eva.

24

25 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair and members of
26 the Council. Thank you, Mr. Chair. This is Eva. And
27 the Federal Subsistence Board was not involved at all
28 with this process, AIDEA, the organization leading the
29 Ambler Mining Access Road was coordinating this
30 committee. So the Federal Subsistence Board didn't
31 have a part in it. There weren't any, you know,
32 opportunity to nominate Council members to serve on it.
33 They had their own independent process for selecting
34 members to that committee.

35

36 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

37

38 MR. SCHAEFFER: I got a question,
39 Wilbur.

40

41 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah.

42

43 MR. SCHAEFFER: How did this committee
44 ever come about, who is responsible for this committee
45 and how did they select members?

46

47 MR. HOWARTH: Maybe Eva could answer
48 that.

49

50

0037

1 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
2 Council. Through the Chair. This is Eva. And we will
3 have the representative from AIDEA to address the
4 Council tomorrow so they will be reporting both on the
5 status of the road development and also the creation of
6 the subsistence committee that they established. So
7 they would be the ones to be able to respond to how
8 that was organized and how members were selected.

9
10 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

11
12 MR. SHIEDT: Attamuk here. Eva, they
13 were asking Wilbur how they were selected and we need
14 to hear it because we got interest in this one here and
15 you Federal are trying to take over again on the
16 talking part. Thomas, you need to take control and let
17 Wilbur finish answering what Bobby Schaeffer asked.
18 And I think Barbara's right, I think Bobby Schaeffer
19 should represent us.

20
21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So this is Thomas,
22 thank everyone for that. Wilbur, do you have anything
23 else to say regarding Bob's question or do you feel
24 like Eva answered it pretty well with AIDEA and that we
25 weren't -- the Federal Subsistence Board wasn't
26 involved?

27
28 MR. HOWARTH: Yes, thank you, Mr.
29 Chair. Eva did answer the question. And you're right
30 AIDEA is the one running this. Thank you.

31
32 MS. ATORUK: Okay, thank you, Wilbur.
33 We'll just wait until AIDEA comes on tomorrow then we
34 will discuss this again. Let's go on, thank you.

35
36 MR. HOWARTH: Thank you, Barbara.

37
38 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Wilbur.

39
40 MR. CLEVELAND: I got one for Wilbur.

41
42 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah.

43
44 REPORTER: Who is this, Vern?

45
46 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, you said.....

47
48 REPORTER: Who is this please.

49
50

0038

1 MR. CLEVELAND:they would hire --
2 that they're going to hire people that are closer to
3 the road, that's discrimination, they can't do that.
4 You can't -- just because they're close to the road you
5 can't hire, it's got to be for everybody. That's
6 discriminating against me because I'm not close to the
7 road, no, that's wrong. Thank you.

8
9 REPORTER: Can you identify yourself,
10 please.

11
12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: That was Vern
13 speaking.

14
15 REPORTER: Okay, thanks, Thomas.

16
17 CHAIRMAN BAKER: You're welcome, Tina.

18
19 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, Vern, like I said
20 they'll be going to Ambler, Kobuk, Shungnak and they'll
21 be hiring.

22
23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
24 Wilbur. So we'll move on to the next report and
25 hopefully hear more about the Ambler Metals project
26 tomorrow when we have them presenting for us. So,
27 next, Bob Schaeffer, would you be able to give your
28 Council member report.

29
30 MR. SCHAEFFER: Where do I start.

31
32 (Laughter)

33
34 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yeah, I appreciate
35 Wilbur's comments and I just wanted to know how that
36 committee was formed and who -- who was responsible for
37 forming it and what their intent was. Obviously it's
38 the world's best kept secret but I -- I'm not sure if
39 NANA is involved in this at all, I don't know. But I
40 would be interested to hear what -- how this was -- how
41 this committee was made up and how it was made up and
42 why it was made up. Because if you have a
43 responsibility I would love to hear what their
44 responsibility is. Because I do have some questions.
45 I think -- you know, I might be a little bit biased but
46 I've been against the Ambler Mining District
47 development for a long time. And I do it because it's
48 not only for the resource and for the caribou and the
49 fish that's there because if AIDEA is involved that's
50

0039

1 going to be State dollars and once that road opens up
2 you're going to have 1,000 Winnebagos and boats heading
3 up and down that river which will be the beginning of
4 the end of the Upper Kobuk. So I might be biased but
5 I'd like to at least be truthful about my feelings.

6
7 The other part.....

8
9 MS. ATORUK: Yes.

10
11 MR. SCHAEFFER:part of the report
12 that I mentioned, you know, I talked about global
13 warming and the impacts of global warming. And Vern
14 had just mentioned, you know, the massive erosion up in
15 the Upper Kobuk because the last two years we've had
16 tremendous amounts of rain and storms and we're
17 witnessing it down here and I've never seen so much
18 erosion on the Baldwin Peninsula and -- and around the
19 Kobuk and Noatak Delta and also on the coastlines
20 further up toward Kivalina. It just amazed me how much
21 the beating that we took last year because of, you
22 know, it started raining July 1 and it didn't quit
23 until it snowed pretty much and the rivers -- the
24 rivers and the lakes were extremely high all summer
25 long and there's just massive erosion everywhere. And
26 not only did it affect, you know, just the land around
27 it, and the environment but it also.....

28
29 (Teleconference interference -
30 participants not muted)

31
32 MR. SCHAEFFER:but it also
33 affected, you know, the -- the animals and I -- see
34 this is where I'll start, is that, I think our biggest
35 concern about is -- is about the caribou and I wanted
36 to give my perspective because I think global warming
37 played a very important role in that demise and I think
38 that, you know.....

39
40 (Teleconference interference -
41 participants not muted)

42
43 MR. SCHAEFFER:that I was glad I
44 was raised in the '50s and '60s and we never had this
45 kind of thing, you know, every year the caribou would
46 come through and they would make their way up north in
47 April and be up in their calving grounds before it
48 starts melting but now it melts in April, you know, and
49 so -- which puts a real crimp on their usual schedule.
50

0040

1 And then -- so when they start heading up north they're
2 slowed down by waters and by melting snow and, you
3 know, they have a real rough go in trying to get up to
4 the calving grounds and most of them hardly ever make
5 it and they have to work their way through it and --
6 and by the time they get up there, you know, they're
7 all spent and I'm sure that -- you know the mortality
8 is part of it because they have hundreds and hundreds
9 of rivers that rather -- rather than walking across
10 they have to swim across. And so it's -- you know I
11 could imagine being a caribou and having to go through
12 that and then it stresses us every year now.

13
14 You know, and then not only that we
15 have the fall migration, you know, you heard -- there
16 is a report from the Park Service biologist about the
17 changes in the environment due to global warming and
18 that was kind of interesting because there is massive
19 growth of willow everywhere and, you know, the willows
20 that were never there are there and they're 20 feet
21 tall and, you know, things -- so things are happening
22 really -- really fast to global warming takes hold and
23 rather than four month summers we have six month
24 summers now, you know. And -- and so I could go on and
25 on about -- about -- about the impacts of it other than
26 saying, you know, I've never seen the ocean so doggone
27 thin, you know, I mean the -- the -- like what we used
28 to have when we were growing up and dad always
29 mentioned going out 25, 30 miles to (Indiscernible)
30 Point to hunt because the ice was so thick they'd have
31 to go quite a ways out to get to the lead but that is
32 gone.

33
34 So massive changes are happening. As
35 we speak to them, we're witnessing it everyday and a
36 lot of them are not good simply because we have massive
37 erosions, like we've had in massive -- massive, massive
38 amounts of water that fell this last year, which affect
39 the permafrost. You know we have permafrost thaw big
40 time the last two years because of massive amounts of
41 rain and a lot of storms, a lot of wind and high water,
42 you know, I mean I could go on and on about it, but I
43 think the changes and what's happening with global
44 warming are affecting everything, not only the caribou
45 but all the other -- all the other -- the species of
46 animals that we've -- that we used to, you know,
47 subsist on.

48
49 But I -- I guess I could expound -- I
50

0041

1 don't -- I don't want to go too far into what's going
2 through my little skull right now but I do -- I do
3 contribute global warming to many of the atrocities
4 that are happening up here insofar as the environment
5 is concerned. And, you know, maybe -- maybe -- and my
6 concern, of course, with the Ambler Road is the road
7 and especially the Ambler Mine is that we're putting --
8 you know, we're not even considering what's going to
9 happen, you know, when they start using so much energy
10 and start digging up more permafrost and exposing more
11 of the tundra and the perma -- the permafrost to the --
12 to the atmosphere because right now, you know, we have
13 massive amounts of carbon dioxide going into the
14 atmosphere and -- and it's affecting the atmosphere
15 with the -- with the greenhouse gases. And then when
16 we start melting permafrost, of course, we have massive
17 amounts of methane and carbon -- and nitrous oxide
18 that's going -- getting into the air, you know, and
19 into the atmosphere and so it's going to speed up -- as
20 more tundra and more permafrost thaws it's going to
21 speed up, you know, the -- the greenhouse gas effect
22 and more than likely speed up the heating of the Earth.
23 But I -- I -- I'm just concerned about -- about what's
24 happening up here and we talk about the animals and the
25 environment and I think the -- I think global warming
26 plays a huge part in that and I just feel that -- that
27 we're not trying to understand what it's doing to us.

28
29 Wilbur talked about setting nets and it
30 was so doggone cold and then all of a sudden it turned
31 warm for a little -- for a few days and then all of a
32 sudden it started raining in July and it never stopped,
33 you know, so -- so things are happening that are
34 unusual for us and they -- they -- and they will
35 continue to get worse as global warming takes hold.
36 And so I just wanted to put that into perspective.

37
38 Anyway, I could go on but I -- I --
39 that's my report, thank you.

40
41 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Bob, for
42 your report. We'll move on to Barbara. Barbara
43 Atoruk, can you please give your Council member report.

44
45 MS. ATORUK: Thank you. Good morning.
46 Happy Valentines Day to each and every one of you.
47 Over 40 of you.

48
49 For Kiana, the fishing was good. Kind
50

0042

1 of sort of. But then the ADF&G, who always put out
2 gillnets up this way and then hand them out to the
3 people here did not do so well. Their stuff gave up
4 and then the river got real high, super high. But
5 thanks to (In Native), Henry, Sr., that had his net out
6 there and get some salmon while he is able to. And
7 even that river being so high -- it was really super
8 high, this is the first time in years that I've been
9 alive that it went over, the bench of up there at
10 Shungnak. And I hadn't seen that in a very long time,
11 or probably have never because it just came up always
12 when the ice was going out but this was during the
13 summertime. I think after all those rains and stuff it
14 did go over the bench at Shungnak and that was
15 something different for me. But the sheefish was good
16 and healthy up here during July when the (indiscernible
17 - cuts out) because a lot of it came over to me and I
18 thank fishermen here at Kiana, the young fishermen who
19 like to share.

20
21 The berries were okay but the pickers
22 had to go out and walk, did a lot of walking for the
23 blueberries down this way. But I heard that Upper
24 Kobuk was good with blueberries. And with cranberries,
25 it was zero here in this region -- in this area, right
26 here from Kiana. The ladies that went to their
27 cranberry picking spots were -- did not see any
28 cranberries. They walked over the place (indiscernible
29 - cuts out) so cranberries were poor. The
30 salmonberries were abundant as far as I know because I
31 got some in my freezer from the pickers that who shared
32 me and a lot of it was down river at the delta. So
33 berries were good.

34
35 And lots of wolves. Lots of wolves
36 this year coming down on the main channel up here all
37 over but they never came into the village, except for
38 maybe one, and which that always happens once in
39 awhile. And last -- as of last spring, they were in
40 town, they came into the town and then the hunters went
41 out and harvested them. They mostly went up to the
42 dump where the person who took care of the dump keep
43 seeing them up there so the hunters went up there and
44 they harvested some.

45
46 And hardly fox. I don't know if any of
47 your villages are seeing any fox at all. I've only
48 seen one or two in the last few months and usually
49 there is quite a few when there is no food out there,
50

0043

1 usually they come in and then be up there by where the
2 school yard is because the kids would feed them their
3 lunches, from what I heard.

4

5 The caribou came real late, very, very
6 late. They got stuck over here kind of inside the
7 Squirrel River and got stuck on that side and the
8 hunters were saying they were seeing brown bear kind of
9 in their path. Until the very last moment they started
10 crossing and hunters went up there hunting and then the
11 next day the river froze. A lot of them were able to
12 take it back out, down river, and made it home. But
13 then -- and, then, again, for a few days it was like
14 that and then it thawed out so the hunters went back
15 out again because the caribou were still crossing. And
16 I know that because that's how I got my caribou. One
17 of the hunters brought me one and then the other one,
18 so I ended up with two.

19

20 So that's how it was this fall here.

21

22 And right now, I think this is the
23 coldest winter we've ever had as far as I can see. We
24 keep hitting 40s, 38, 37 and it's just still cold with
25 no wind. And even some people walking from post office
26 to home are freezing their faces because they're not
27 expecting it with that little breeze hitting the face.
28 So the wind chill, I'm sure are pretty low and it's
29 cold, right now it's foggy out, the sun keeps coming
30 out and the smoke is straight up and then that's --
31 that's cold.

32

33 The changes are here. We're
34 experiencing them. We're having a lot of boiler
35 problems in the villages. We're having a lot of wood
36 being hauled in for the people. So we have about the
37 same kind of problems that a lot of other villages are
38 having. And so keep a look out for us.

39

40 Thank you. That's all I have. And
41 also like to say this is my last meeting. I didn't
42 reapply for the purpose that I might not be living in
43 Kiana anymore after maybe by this fall so I thank each
44 and every one of you for your -- that I had my time
45 with you and get to work with you and for the longest
46 would be Attamuk and Bobby Schaeffer. Thank you for
47 being my friends.

48

49 Okay, have a nice day.

50

0044

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.
2 Just a comment on that, we're all very appreciative of
3 all the input that you've put in over the years and
4 thank you for all the service you've done being a
5 member of the RAC. Moving on, Elmer Armstrong, Jr.,
6 are you able to give your Council member report at this
7 time.

8
9 MR. ARMSTRONG: Okay, thank you, Mr.
10 Chair. Whitefish, I know Kiana was doing really good,
11 I think we kind of missed them when we started putting
12 in our nets but I think there was roughly about 10 nets
13 that were put out under the ice and all of us were
14 catching whitefish but I think we might have missed
15 them a little bit because Kiana was doing real good
16 with whitefish through social media.

17
18 A lot of younger kids and a little
19 older individuals put out hooks for mudshark, burbot,
20 that was good to see.

21
22 Sheefish, it looked like they were
23 getting a lot of sheefish at the mouth of the Noatak by
24 hooking and also a few people having nets under the ice
25 for the sheefish in the Kobuk Lake.

26
27 I noticed some of the hunters were
28 going out to the Peninsula getting caribou and also I
29 think I saw one individual get a wolverine and a lynx.
30 I think just going through the cycle for the rabbits
31 that's why people are seeing lynx.

32
33 I know I did one trip to Kotzebue and I
34 noticed the caribou were all foraging even though we
35 had crusty snow and -- and I'm pretty sure I have more
36 but that's all I have for now.

37
38 Thank you.

39
40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Elmer.
41 Hazel Smith Harris are you able to give a Council
42 member report at this time.

43
44 MS. SMITH: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair.
45 Some of the things I want to bring up. There was the
46 berries, there was just -- I grew up on the Kobuk River
47 so I'm familiar with that area and their resources and
48 I'm learning the new stuff down here. My husband tells
49 me all the usual places we try to go to pick berries,
50

0045

1 there was just too much water to get to them so we
2 didn't get that much berries. We keep trying in
3 different places and like people keep reporting there
4 was just too much water.

5

6 For my own family we weren't able to
7 get any caribou in our freezers until the last month --
8 this past month or so.

9

10 I received reports that the fish run
11 was okay but not abundant like in the past.

12

13 People reported that they weren't able
14 to dry oogruk like they used to because of the weather,
15 either too hot one day and then really rainy the next
16 day, it was just impossible to dry the meat and make
17 oil like in the past. Climate change is really
18 affecting us, I know it is.

19

20 I'd like to hear more reports about the
21 beaver. I've heard it from the (In Native) side, they
22 talk about the over population of the beaver and that
23 they're moving this way and I know, to me, giardia is a
24 big concern. I don't want it -- the people that are
25 doing the research, they say, oh, it's not a problem
26 which to me it is, the beavers got a pee and (In
27 Native) just like we do and they affect our water
28 supply so I want to hear more about that.

29

30 I was disappointed that the WACH didn't
31 approve the special action, committee, and I think I
32 had to ask about the bigger picture on support for our
33 special action. We are getting it from the North
34 Slope. There's none from WACH and there's -- I didn't
35 hear about the Seward Peninsula side. But in order for
36 the Federal Subsistence Board make a positive reply to
37 us I think we need to garner more support from other
38 people that use the Western Arctic Caribou Herd.

39

40 I'm a big Facebook user. I wake up
41 early every morning and watch people's report and there
42 are people out there that are hungry, they have no
43 caribou like they used to have. The food supply is not
44 -- I know it's because of the virus, the Covid-19
45 that's affecting the food supply and the prices are
46 just way too high for us to afford, you know, what
47 stores are offering when we don't have the caribou or
48 the other resources that we normally use.

49

50

0046

1 My family does -- my grandkids usually
2 go out ptarmigan and rabbit hunting and they're just
3 not bringing any back and I heard somebody say that's
4 why we're seeing a lot of lynx, that might be why.

5
6 I believe that's all I have for now.
7 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8
9 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hazel, for
10 your report. Calvin Moto, II, are you able to give a
11 Council member report at this time.

12
13 MR. MOTO: Hi, good morning everybody.
14 For my report I'd like to, again, preach about the
15 muskox that are hanging out close to town. A lot of
16 hunters have been going out but have unsuccessful
17 nearby Deering, some of which have been going as far as
18 Kiwalik, which is halfway between here and Buckland.
19 But the caribou that they have been getting were pretty
20 lean and I think that's due to the fact that we had
21 some unusual rain throughout the month of December,
22 which is, you know, frozen up the ground and making it
23 harder for them to reach their food supply.

24
25 You know, I think the muskox around
26 Deering is due to -- like Attamuk said, the increased
27 number of wolves and bears, also wolverines. One
28 hunter here has spotted quite a few wolverines around
29 within a mile or two of the village. So the predators
30 are out there and the numbers are increasing out here
31 on the Seward Peninsula. The caribou are usually just
32 10, 20 miles away but hunters have been quite a bit
33 further to get to them. Not too many hunters been going
34 west of Deering, but mostly east towards Buckland and
35 like I say they are pretty lean and skinny.

36
37 So I think the global warming is
38 impacting, having all that rain during some unusual
39 months where we should be getting snow.

40
41 And I'm going to continue preaching
42 every chance that I get about these muskox and this
43 concern is mainly directing towards the National Park
44 Service and Fish and Game, that we need some control
45 out here. We've got two or three herds that just hang
46 around the village. And as the airport maintenance
47 guy, you know, they destroy my lights on a daily basis
48 and that could lead to, you know, planes not coming in
49 and they destroy our cemetery, knock down crosses and,
50

0047

1 you know, they're just a nuisance right now.

2

3 And as far as fishing, fishing was good
4 this past summer. A lot of people went out and set
5 nets in the ocean and did their seining for salmon and
6 so on and so everybody got their fish that they needed
7 to dry and put away in their freezers.

8

9 Basically that's pretty much all I
10 have. Everybody's looking forward to the usual spring
11 hunt for geese and ducks and oogruks, of course.

12

13 But, yeah, that's all I have. I think
14 global warming's playing a big part in our caribou
15 decline in terms of them being fat and being able to be
16 healthy, to be able to reproduce and so on.

17

18 So that's all I have, Mr. Chair.

19

20 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you for your
21 report, Calvin. So with that being all the Council
22 members I'll move on to the Chair's report.

23

24 A lot of what I was planning to say has
25 been said already concerning the conditions of the
26 caribou herd and what not. Just here in Kotzebue,
27 earlier in the winter there was some caribou harvested
28 that was not so much coming across the Kobuk Lake but
29 more down the Peninsula as Wilbur mentioned earlier.
30 We didn't see a big migration coming down across the
31 Kobuk Lake as we typically do in November, December.
32 We had a couple days of rain in December and as people
33 probably noticed but through everything out of whack
34 across the whole region so caribou have been sparse
35 around the community but people have been able to
36 harvest a few here and there even going out by
37 snowmachine, from what I've been told, seeing that it's
38 not very plentiful and not much to be had to begin
39 with.

40

41 There's been a couple of reports of
42 wolves behind Kotzebue out in the hills. Even circling
43 people that stop on their snowmachines for a cigarette
44 break so getting a little brave back there.

45

46 There's not too much else to be said
47 but this is another one of those winters where there
48 isn't much to be hunted but a lot of people trying to
49 go out and subsist so just hope for a good spring and

50

0048

1 have better conditions to get out for our spring hunts.

2

3

4 And at this time that's all I have for
5 the Chair's report.

6

7 So we'll move on to the opportunity for
8 public and tribal comment on non-agenda items. This is
9 available each morning of the meeting. Do we have any
10 comments from members of the public or tribal
11 organizations, members, items that are not on the
12 agenda at this time.

13

14 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara.

17

18 MS. ATORUK: I -- I forgot to mention
19 that, you know, our roster for Region 8, we used to
20 have the phone numbers for each Council member and we
21 don't have that anymore and we're officially nominated
22 or put into to be on the Council for this region and we
23 -- I always try to look for the phone numbers for the
24 other Council members when I want to ask questions and
25 then I don't have any phone numbers to call them
26 personally. So if that would be added to our roster so
27 that Council members can call each other whenever they
28 need to talk about or discuss whatever. So I'm putting
29 that out to see how the other Council members feel
30 about this.

31

32 Thank you.

33

34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: That is a good point.
35 Eva, can you make a note to disseminate that, update
36 the roster with all of our new members and contact
37 information for each of us so that we all have that
38 prepared.

39

40 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
41 Council. I will definitely send you each directly that
42 membership contact list. We do keep Council members
43 personal information private so we don't post that or
44 place it within the meeting books but I will certainly
45 mail the Council members the current contact membership
46 so that you all have it and are able to connect with
47 each other.

48

49 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

50

0049

1 MR. SHIEDT: Thomas, through the
2 Chair.....

3
4 MS. SMITH: Mr. Chair.

5
6 CHAIRMAN BAKER:Attamuk.

7
8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Attamuk.

9
10 MS. SMITH: Go ahead, Attamuk.

11
12 MR. SHIEDT: Yeah, Eva, you could ask
13 each Council member if they could have their phone
14 listed. Barbara is right, we need to talk to each
15 other that way we could be more effective where we are
16 at and that way we will know each other and we could
17 contact each other. You could, individually, ask each
18 Council member to have their number posted. You could
19 post mine.

20
21 MS. SMITH: Mr. Chair, this is Hazel.

22
23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes. Yes, Hazel, go
24 ahead.

25
26 MS. SMITH: We have to be careful when
27 we talk to each other that we don't make Council
28 decisions or that we don't -- I know that in Robert's
29 Rules of Orders there's a protocol about, you know, I
30 mean I support that we all talk to each other but we
31 shouldn't be making decisions, you know, out there by
32 ourselves, that we bring it to the full Council for the
33 full Council to make decisions on.

34
35 That's all I have, thank you.

36
37 MS. ATORUK: I don't -- I don't -- I
38 think we all.....

39
40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hazel.

41
42 MS. ATORUK:understand that.
43 We've been on the Council for awhile already so we know
44 that. Thank you.

45
46 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.

47
48 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair.

49
50

0050

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: At this time do we
2 have any -- who was that, Wilbur.

3
4 (Teleconference interference -
5 participants not muted)

6
7 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, it's Wilbur.
8 Just for the public and our Council here and everybody
9 in the region, we still have -- this is on safety, we
10 still have just snow covered over the creeks. We had
11 some guys falling through the creeks with their
12 snowmachines when they're trying to get wood and stuff
13 so a lot of our creeks are dangerous to be around. So
14 it's just covered with snow so you got to be careful
15 out there.

16
17 Thank you.

18
19 MS. ATORUK: Oh, yeah.

20
21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you for
22 that.....

23
24 MS. ATORUK: Yes.

25
26 CHAIRMAN BAKER:safety point,
27 Wilbur. So at this time do we have any public comment,
28 any members of the public listening in that want to
29 make a comment at this time.

30
31 MR. HARRIS: Mr. Chairman, Cyrus Harris
32 from the public.

33
34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
35 Cyrus.

36
37 MR. HARRIS: Hey, I'd just like to
38 share, very interesting meeting this morning. Great
39 topics regarding our cultural life that -- that could
40 affect our cultural lifestyle, primarily the Ambler
41 Road and the muskox issue, I really appreciate Deering
42 speaking on behalf of the muskox in their area. And
43 also the caribou, very interesting topic. And that's
44 also along with WSA21-01, very interesting meeting.

45
46 (Teleconference interference -
47 participants not muted)

48
49 MR. HARRIS: I'm not going to be able
50

0051

1 to call in this afternoon, I got some work obligated
2 meetings but I called in just to learn more about this
3 SRA Council.

4

5 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6

7 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, thank you for
8 your comments, Cyrus. Do we have any other public or
9 tribal comments at this time on non-agenda items.

10

11 (No comments)

12

13 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none then
14 we'll go ahead and move on to old business. And the
15 first thing under old business will be the deferred
16 Wildlife Special Action 21-01 to close moose and
17 caribou hunting to non-Federally qualified users in
18 Units 23 and 26A. So at this time the Council will
19 receive relevant caribou reports prior to the analysis.

20

21 REPORTER: Thomas. Thomas, this is
22 Tina, the court reporter.

23

24 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Tina.

25

26 REPORTER: Yep, before you go on to
27 that next subject and before the speaker begins
28 speaking. If everybody could take a moment, check your
29 phone and make sure you're on mute so we can hear the
30 speaker. There's a lot of background noise and I just
31 want to be sure that the Council members can hear the
32 report as well as the speaker, that she can get any
33 questions.

34

35 All right, thank you.

36

37 Go ahead, Thomas.

38

39 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Tina. It
40 looks like first we have, it would be Hannah Voorhees
41 who is up first for this under old business, Eva.

42

43 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair, this is Eva.

44

45 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Eva.

46

47 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
48 members of the Council. So we had discussed with the
49 Council of providing the caribou reports and
50

0052

1 information that was relevant to the Wildlife Special
2 Action Request so the Council had an opportunity to
3 hear the latest caribou census data and other
4 information that would help in making a decision,
5 recommendations on the special action. So if it works
6 for the Council, we were going to start with the
7 caribou reports, hear those, and then move into the
8 analysis overview, which Hannah Voorhees would be
9 providing. We do have ADF&G and Park Service and other
10 Federal Staff on at this time who have provided
11 information for the Council in your meeting books.

12

13 So just wanted to check with you, Mr.
14 Chair, and see if you would like to proceed with that
15 order of hearing the caribou reports first before the
16 analysis.

17

18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Eva, I believe
19 going with the reports would be good so who -- I'm just
20 looking through the agenda, who do we have first on
21 that.

22

23 MS. EDMISON: Hi, Mr. Chair, this is
24 Nicole Edmison from ADF&G up here in Kotzebue and I
25 think I'm supposed to give one of the reports and I'm
26 not sure if Kyle Joly from National Park Service is
27 also going to speak at this time. And I think Christie
28 Osburn, also here with ADF&G will talk about the moose.

29

30 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right. Well, the
31 floor is yours.

32

33 MS. PATTON: And, Mr. Chair and
34 Council, you will find, if we're starting with the
35 ADF&G caribou report, you will find that in Tab 5, and
36 I think the order got a little mixed up so if -- it's
37 at the back of your Tab 5. So inbe -- there's a yellow
38 -- a yellow division in between the Park Service
39 report, which is on the front, and then the next one
40 you'll see is a grey heading, WAAH Caribou overview.

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Now that I'm in the
43 tab, Eva, it might just be easier if we just start with
44 Kyle because it looks like Kyle Joly did the first
45 section of reports under Tab 5.

46

47 MS. PATTON: Okay. So if the Council
48 would prefer for Kyle then to be up first.

49

50

0053

1 (Pause)

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Kyle Joly, are you
4 still on the line with us.

5

6 MR. JOLY: Hello, Mr. Chairman, I'm here.

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Kyle.
9 Would you be able to go over this report that we have
10 in our Council material Western Arctic Herd Working
11 Group, National Park Service Caribou Monitoring?

12

13 MR. JOLY: Yes, Mr. Chairman, I'll be
14 able to do that. Thank you for having me. Let me get
15 myself situated.

16

17 REPORTER: So could I have everybody
18 please check your phone and mute it if possible before
19 Kyle starts. You can press the little star key and
20 then the six, or the mute button if you're on the cell
21 phone. There's some background noise. Sorry for
22 interrupting, thank you.

23

24 Go ahead, Kyle.

25

26 MR. JOLY: All right, thank you. Can
27 you hear me okay.

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, we can Kyle.

30

31 MR. JOLY: Great, thank you. So the
32 first slide is a depiction of where the caribou were
33 back in October. This was a presentation for the
34 Western Arctic Herd Working Group which was held back
35 in December.

36

37 The caribou have moved a little bit but
38 not a ton from October, generally December, January,
39 February into March are times of pretty low movement.
40 Some of the animals did make it down to Buckland, which
41 is, we heard in a report earlier, but we really don't
42 have any collared female caribou further west of
43 Buckland, so really none out on the Seward Peninsula
44 again. The main bunch, as we also heard, is in the
45 Shungnak, Kobuk, Ambler area. That's where the
46 majority of collars are but they're spread out all over
47 the Northwest coast up by Teshekpuk and into Gates of
48 the Arctic and over by Anaktuvuk Pass.

49

50

0054

1 The next slide is movements near the
2 Red Dog Road. This is Slide 2. This is just to show
3 you what we've seen for a number of years now, which is
4 caribou having a difficult time crossing the Red Dog
5 Road. We documented that in a paper back in 2016 but
6 we continue to see that being an issue. I had an
7 animation, which, you know, basically puts this picture
8 into movement for you but I can't do that over the
9 teleconference unfortunately, hopefully next time we're
10 in person and I can show you that video.

11
12 The next slide is Slide 3. This shows
13 movements near Kiana, the western portion of Kobuk
14 Valley National Park and generally what we see in a
15 normal year is the caribou flowing from north to south
16 during the fall and this year they really got hung up
17 on the Kobuk River. You can see how they're just
18 getting stuck there and then most of them flow to the
19 southwest nearing the village of Kiana and then head up
20 into the Squirrel River. What I think what's happening
21 here is that the migration was delayed and the animals
22 ran into pan ice as they got to the Kobuk River and
23 they didn't want to cross and so they got stuck on the
24 north side and then ended up over in the Squirrel River
25 country.

26
27 (Teleconference interference -
28 participants not muted)

29
30 MR. JOLY: If anyone could check their
31 mute button to make sure that they're not transmitting,
32 that'd be appreciated.

33
34 The next slide is Slide 4 is the
35 Colville River so same type of thing, generally see a
36 good flow across the Colville River. Here, this year
37 we had animals having a hard time crossing the river,
38 again, I think this was pan ice. Eventually these
39 animals -- most of these animals did cross, where that
40 wasn't the case in the Kobuk.

41
42 One thing that we hear questions about
43 a lot is how the caribou are moving through the Noatak
44 National Preserve in fall. And generally we see pretty
45 good flows through the northern portions of the Noatak
46 Preserve, not really those obvious delays that we see
47 at Red Dog and the pan ice.

48
49 The next slide is Slide 6. Just an
50

0055

1 overview of our year, September 2020 to August 2021.
2 We put out a record number of collars with Alaska
3 Department of Fish and Game, 48 GPS collars, that's the
4 most we've ever put out on females in the Western
5 Arctic Herd. They were all deployed during netting.
6 We're having a hard time working out of Onion Portage
7 anymore. We didn't put out any collars in 2020 or 2021
8 out at Onion Portage. Just between the delays and less
9 migration of caribou coming through there we just
10 haven't had as much success. There's been a lot of
11 change in winter use by the herd. So for several years
12 Bering Land Bridge out on the Seward Peninsula was
13 heavily used, 70, 80, even 85, 90 percent of the
14 collars were getting out to Bering Land Bridge just
15 five or six years ago. In the past three years, none
16 of the collars have been getting out to Bering Land
17 Bridge, that's BELA, B-E-L-A, and GAAR, that's Gates of
18 the Arctic. So we had a record number of caribou
19 collars in Gates of the Arctic in the winter of
20 2020/2021, 70 percent of the collars were in Gates of
21 the Arctic, which is something that we haven't seen
22 since we started using GPS collars in 2009.

23
24 The next slide is Slide 7. This is the
25 annual usage of the range. It's very much skewed to
26 the south and east. The core, which is that dark
27 orange, that's the highest use throughout the year was
28 in Gates of the Arctic. They were in Gates of the
29 Arctic in all season, which is somewhat unusual and
30 they spent their winter there and that combination
31 leads to the core being that far over.

32
33 (Teleconference interference -
34 participants not muted)

35
36 MR. JOLY: But we also have a lot of
37 animals utilizing the Northwest coast.

38
39 The next slide is Slide 8. This is a
40 map showing where the caribou crossed the Noatak River
41 in the fall of 2020. And so there's different segments
42 there. And as you can see there was a more easterly
43 flow, animals -- the bulk of the animals coming through
44 the upper portions of the Noatak River where the Noatak
45 River moves from Noatak National Preserve to Gates of
46 the Arctic National Park. Something interesting, too,
47 we didn't have any collared caribou come through the
48 very western section, so a lot of times on average we
49 have 10 or 15 percent of our animals come down the very
50

0056

1 far west through Cape Krusenstern sometimes cutting
2 right through Kotzebue and down the Baldwin Peninsula.
3 This is the first time that we haven't seen a collared
4 caribou use that farthest western route since 2010 so a
5 decade of -- since they haven't used that area. The
6 bottom figure is just the average from 2010 to 2016.

7
8 The next slide is looking at the Kobuk
9 River so it's looking at the percentage of animals that
10 are crossing the Kobuk River. And so for the first few
11 years of monitoring, so 2010 through 2015, those first
12 six years we had an average of over 80 percent of the
13 animals crossing and we thought this was pretty normal.
14 We always have reports of some animals staying north,
15 either up by Wainwright or Point Hope or Point Lay so
16 on average 82 percent cross the Kobuk River in those
17 six years, 2010 to 2015, but in the last five years
18 only 34 percent have crossed. So 2016 to 2020, only 34
19 percent, a third of the herd is crossing is the Kobuk
20 River on their fall migration so that's less than half
21 of the animals are crossing the Kobuk River, which is
22 obviously impacting people's ability to harvest,
23 especially on the southern half of the range. The most
24 striking thing was in 2020 we only had six percent of
25 the animals cross the river at all. That's an all time
26 low that we've reported. It's not a historic low,
27 people have reported through traditional stories that
28 in times of caribou scarcity that the animals were
29 further north and as the herd has declined that's what
30 we're seeing, is that the animals are staying further
31 north.

32
33 So the next slide, Slide 10, looks at
34 the timing of the crossing. So the first several years
35 we were actually seeing a little bit of an earlier
36 crossing of the Kobuk River. We're not really sure why
37 that was. Everyone talks about the crossings getting
38 later and later and for the last four years that's what
39 we've seen is much, much later. And in 2018 and 2020
40 were the latest ever migrations that we've seen. And
41 when we're looking at that earlier trend, one of the
42 things that we thought about doing is looking at when
43 the first animal crossed the Kobuk River and so this
44 red bar -- these red bars on Slide 11, that's the first
45 animal crossing and then the blue bars are the average
46 timing so all the collars, when do they cross. And
47 what you see is pretty interesting. So back in the
48 early days of our monitoring, 2010, 2011 we had animals
49 crossing the Kobuk River in late August and that was
50

0057

1 pretty normal and then just 10 years later we had our
2 first animal cross the Kobuk River in November in 2020.
3 So in the span of 10 years there's been a change in the
4 timing of migration by over two months for those first
5 animals which is just really a dramatic change, which
6 have been noted in all your Council reports.

7
8 On the flip side, looking at spring
9 migration, so when the females are ready to head back
10 up to the calving grounds, the story isn't as
11 straightforward. We see that the 2012/2013 there was
12 some very late migrations. We think this is correlated
13 with deep snow events where they just kind of waited
14 until the snow conditions got better and then they
15 started crossing. One of the reasons we think there
16 isn't as dramatic a story here is that the animals
17 still want to calve, you know, they want to get to the
18 calving grounds and so they are really motivated to get
19 going in spring. And we've noticed that the timing of
20 calving, we haven't detected any significant changes in
21 the timing of calving. So the spring migration isn't
22 as variable as the fall migration.

23
24 So moving on to Slide 13, just the next
25 few slides I'm just going to run through some
26 publications that we've been working on and have come
27 out. They're all available, freely available. We also
28 have some public accessible versions for people and the
29 web page address for those are on the slide itself.

30
31 So this first one was looking at the
32 calving area of the Western Arctic Herd and the figure
33 you see there, the bright red area, that's where
34 animals calve every single year and as the colors fade
35 to yellow and blue that's less and less years of use.
36 But that core area up in the Utukok uplands was used
37 every year. Peter Lent was the biologist out there in
38 the '60s and that's where they calved back then. And
39 when he was out there, he talked to elders wondering
40 about the calving grounds and the elders that he spoke
41 to back in the '60s said, oh, yeah, they've been
42 calving out there for at least 50 years so we've
43 documented 100 years plus use of calving by the Western
44 Arctic Herd up in this area. It does vary from year to
45 year but there's really strong fidelity to that central
46 area.

47
48 The next slide was a different paper
49 and we specifically looked at fidelity. Obviously
50

0058

1 calving area was really strong, really high fidelity
2 and that means that the animals go back there year to
3 year. Interestingly an average of 60 kilometers or
4 about 40 miles distance between where an animal would
5 calve one year and calve the next year, so they're not
6 going back to the exact same spot, they're just going
7 back up to that general area and probably making
8 decisions about what's best based on the local
9 conditions that year, you know, where it's greening up,
10 where it's melting out, things like that. We also saw
11 very strong fidelity to the insect relief areas over in
12 the Lisburne Hills area. Almost the entire herd will
13 be out there and they're out there every single year to
14 try and get relief from the insects. There was less
15 fidelity in winter, they tended to move around a lot,
16 and that's noted in a lot of different caribou herds so
17 that was pretty expected as well. On the calving
18 front, animals -- 90 percent of the animals all calved
19 within a week of when they calved the previous years
20 and usually just within a couple of days of when they
21 calved the previous year and that's really astounding
22 given how much variability they face in terms of
23 different snow conditions, different forage conditions,
24 travel routes, predators, all that, they come back to
25 the general same area and they calve at the general
26 same time. So that's pretty interesting. We also
27 documented that fall migration is much more variable
28 than spring migration.

29
30 The next paper, Slide 15, this is a
31 paper that we worked on with Dr. Tim Fullman, he's with
32 the Wilderness Society down in Anchorage. And we
33 looked at caribou migration routes, both in spring and
34 in fall in relation to a proposed set of roads that
35 would be in the North Slope area, it's called the ASTAR
36 system. And so we looked at what that might do to
37 migration and what we found was that caribou avoided
38 areas of dense migration during -- dense vegetation,
39 excuse me, during migration, rugged terrain and major
40 rivers both in spring and fall. And that the proposed
41 road system could impact the direction of migrations
42 and also the availability of the herd for subsistence
43 hunters in different villages.

44
45 The next paper is Slide 16, again,
46 working with Dr. Tim Fullman, we analyzed the proposed
47 development of the National Petroleum Reserve-Alaska,
48 which includes the core calving grounds of the Western
49 Arctic Herd and also the Teshekpuk Herd, and I'll just
50

0059

1 focus here on the Western Arctic Herd. And so we
2 looked at the different proposals that they had, the
3 different alternatives they used in the EIS, and we
4 determined that there was probably some better
5 alternatives that didn't use much more land that could
6 conserve the Western Arctic Herd's calving grounds. So
7 I think that's a pretty interesting report and could be
8 helpful in future planning of that area.

9

10 And lastly, Slide 17, was a paper, we
11 worked with a whole bunch of different colleagues from
12 around the world and it's called Mapping out a Future
13 for Ungulate Migrations. Up in Northwest Alaska we're
14 blessed with very abundant, very undisturbed migrations
15 of ungulates which include caribou, the deer family
16 primarily. But across the planet these long distance
17 migrations are threatened by development and habitat
18 loss and so this group has formed a coalition to try
19 and map out where these important migratory routes are
20 so that we can conserve the routes to help conserve
21 large populations of ungulates.

22

23 So that's the end of my report, I'm
24 happy to take questions, Mr. Chair.

25

26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Kyle, for
27 your report. Do any members of the Council have any
28 questions for Kyle Joly.

29

30 MR. SCHAEFFER: I've got a question,
31 this is Bob.

32

33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead
34 Bob.

35

36 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yeah, Kyle, I was
37 interested in the last report where you talked about
38 the effects of global warming and, you know, another
39 issue that was brought out that I have been keeping
40 track of, of course, is the permafrost thawing and all
41 the nasty stuff that's coming out of it and probably
42 the nastiest one I just saw, or just read recently was
43 the effects of release of radon gas, radon radiation
44 that's coming out of the thaw areas and then affecting
45 the environment in that particular area -- areas, the
46 effect on all the animals, including humans, and
47 there's possible cancers that can be caused by an
48 excess of radiation. Is there something like that, or
49 is that part of your studies or -- or I'm just kind of
50

0060

1 wondering.....

2

3 (Off record)

4

5 (Line break)

6

7 (On record)

8

9 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
10 Eva and Tina and Kyle. Bob, did you have any other
11 questions for Kyle Joly.

12

13 MR. SCHAEFFER: Well, you know, I think
14 the health of the herd is important. I think the
15 decline is many factors, I think most of it was related
16 to the natural stuff, you know, we talk about the rain
17 in the winter and we have that most every year now and
18 the starvation. I think there's just challenges that
19 the caribou experience now in both the southern and the
20 northern migrations is really challenging and I think
21 that mortality is a result of some of those challenges.
22 And I just thought I'd bring (indiscernible) because I
23 think global warming is the -- probably the most
24 important environmental challenge that they will face
25 and it's getting worse and as time goes on, I think,
26 you know, I think it's going to affect not only the
27 caribou but the moose and all of the little critters
28 out there that we use to survive.

29

30 Thank you.

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you. Does
33 anyone else on the Council have any questions for Kyle
34 Joly at this time.

35

36 MR. SHIEDT: Attamuk here.

37

38 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
39 Attamuk.

40

41 MR. SHIEDT: Yeah, Kyle, like Bobby
42 said, global warming had big effect on our caribou as
43 of this fall. When I went up the Noatak I seen the
44 caribou they get. They weren't that fat. They were on
45 the lean side and it's due to the weather at the Slope,
46 a lot of rain like he said, a lot of rain affect our
47 caribou, they're lean, even the ones that late cross --
48 some were lean and some were fat, that's what get me
49 toward the end, when the ice was coming out, there was

50

0061

1 a nice few fat ones but the majority of them were lean
2 and global warming is affecting our caribou and we're
3 the ones that got to learn how to live with it. We
4 have to make some adjustments some how.

5

6 Thank you.

7

8 MR. JOLY: Thank you, Attamuk.

9

10 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk.

11

12 MR. JOLY: I -- oop, sorry, Mr. Chair.

13

14 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Go ahead, Kyle.

15

16 MR. JOLY: I was just going to agree
17 with Attamuk that, yeah, climate change is really
18 impacting caribou, caribou habitat, caribou body
19 conditions. We just had another paper come out that I
20 didn't include in the slide show but it was by one of
21 my Teammates Matthew Cameron and we looked at what was
22 impacting the timing of fall migration and the two big
23 things were falling temperatures and increasing snow.
24 And, of course, you know, any hunters who have been out
25 in Northwest Alaska have seen that, you know, you get a
26 dump of snow and the animals start moving south to try
27 and get to better habitat. And then one of the
28 interesting things they saw about that is, you know, if
29 they move far enough south and they get to better
30 conditions they'll stop. So the migration isn't just,
31 you know, once they get started they go all the way to
32 where they're going to end and spend their winter,
33 they'll stop and enjoy the conditions where they are
34 and wait for that next dump of snow before it then gets
35 pushed again. And so, you know, as everyone on the
36 call knows, temperatures have really soared in the fall
37 and, you know, snow is really variable but it's also
38 coming later and later, and so, you know, those direct
39 impacts of climate change are likely affecting caribou
40 migrations and, therefore, caribou health and your
41 ability to go out and get them.

42

43 MR. SHIEDT: Thank you. One other
44 thing if possible, through the Chair.

45

46 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please.

47

48 MR. SHIEDT: Yeah, the roads do affect
49 the caribou. When we had a meeting years ago, an elder
50

0062

1 said when they build that road all the way to
2 Unalakleet that affected the caribou, the crossing of
3 the caribou and the other road, when -- he said, big
4 effect is the Teller Road, they would not cross the
5 road for years when they used to migrate towards Teller
6 and Unalakleet and he says you could prove it through
7 Red Dog Road, they don't -- for them to cross it.

8

9 Thank you.

10

11 (Teleconference interference -
12 participants not muted)

13

14 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk.
17 Yes, go ahead, Wilbur.

18

19 MR. HOWARTH: Yes, this is Wilbur.
20 Kyle, the last I seen on the count from 244 to 188,000
21 is that the latest or is that a couple years ago, count
22 on the caribou, where are we at?

23

24 MR. JOLY: Thank you, Wilbur. This is
25 Kyle Joly again. Yeah, so the previous count in 2019
26 was 244,000 caribou and the count that Fish and Game
27 did in 2021 which is the latest estimate, July of 2021,
28 is 188,000 so that's a 24 percent decline in two years
29 so it's a fairly steep decline and it's been a fairly
30 steady decline since the peak back in 2003 when we were
31 at 490,000. So we're about 18 years into a decline
32 right now.

33

34 MR. HOWARTH: Okay, thank you.

35

36 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

37

38 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara.

39

40 MS. ATORUK: Yeah, Kyle, is there any
41 more reindeer herds in the region or are they mingled
42 in with the caribou -- our caribou herd now? And just
43 so to speak to see if you guys are seeing the ones
44 right there behind Shungnak, or I mean maybe a few
45 steps away from Shungnak, that's where -- that's where
46 they are foraging right now and just staying there and
47 then being a nuisance now -- becoming a nuisance at the
48 airport where they're almost causing some accidents by
49 the planes coming in as they're landing already, in the

50

0063

1 landing mode, they're running across the airport road.
2 And I'm just wondering to see if you guys know that and
3 are seeing it on your computers or go and visit to see
4 what's going on, but then we know what's going on, is
5 they just need a place to go eat, too many wolves.
6 I've seen some wolves within the area and even further
7 up, above Kobuk there is Greg Zuritz (ph) who lives up
8 there in a small cabin and they're right there, too,
9 right behind his yard, he calls them his herd. So I'm
10 just curious to see -- this has happened -- this is the
11 closest I've ever heard or seen for a herd to be that
12 close. In the fall time, years ago they used to be
13 back there by that second lake to the right, (In
14 Native) in the fall when they hunted, the community
15 hunted together when they came that close, where they
16 would go around in the back -- some men would go around
17 in the back and herd them in to the shooters and then
18 bring them down to the village. There used to be two
19 lakes right there within the village and then they
20 would bring all the harvest there, ladies would do all
21 the cutting and tieing (ph) of all the meat and stuff
22 and then they distributed it within the village. We
23 don't see that anymore, that is gone.

24
25 But I'm just curious to see how -- if
26 you guys are seeing this or have gone up to visit or
27 gone up to see for yourself for pictures -- well
28 informed over that. I'm just curious.

29
30 Thank you.

31
32 MR. JOLY: Thank you, Barbara, for your
33 observations and questions. I'll start with the
34 reindeer. So there are still some reindeer herds, the
35 bulk of the reindeer herds got swept away when the
36 Western Arctic Herd came into the Seward Peninsula in
37 the mid-90s and continued staying out there. There's
38 just a few small herds on the western -- far western
39 side of the Seward Peninsula. A lot of those reindeers
40 did get swept away and they ran off with the wild
41 caribou. A lot of times those reindeer can't keep up
42 as well and they tend to die off. But we know that the
43 caribou and reindeer can interbreed and their offspring
44 survive and we have done some genetic studies showing
45 that there is some reindeer blood in the caribou. Not
46 in all of them, but some, so they -- they live on in
47 that way.

48
49
50

0064

1 Yeah, we're seeing, you know, on our
2 satellite data exactly what you're seeing, caribou very
3 close to Shungnak, Ambler, Kobuk, lots of caribou --
4 the majority of our collars are in that area. I'm
5 hoping to get out there in the early part of April to
6 see it myself. So I'm looking forward to that but do
7 appreciate all these observations so please do share
8 them.

9

10 Thank you.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, any other
13 questions for Kyle Joly at this time from the Council.

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, we can
18 move on and it looks like the next in our packet is
19 from the Western Arctic National Parklands, District
20 Ranger Joe Dallemolle has a report for us, Joe are you
21 on the line this morning.

22

23 MR. DALLEMOLLE: Yeah, this is Joe
24 Dallemolle, I'm the District Ranger with the National
25 Park Service. I'll keep my report pretty brief today
26 and just open it up to questions. Before we get
27 started I just wanted to say I know with this proposal
28 that's coming out and there is probably going to be a
29 lot of questions about commercial activity,
30 transporters and so forth, that's going to be discussed
31 later on so if we could kind of hold those questions,
32 if there's general questions about that I'm happy to
33 answer.

34

35 I wanted to just briefly recap the last
36 year's hunting season, and sort of our patrol
37 initiatives during that and we discussed at the last
38 RAC meeting, but just to, again, summarize. Pretty
39 successful as far as being able to get out there and
40 patrol. We used a helicopter and fixed-wing airplane
41 in September to make a lot of contacts with hunters in
42 the Noatak Preserve. All the contacts we made were
43 non-Federally-qualified subsistence users so the folks
44 being flown in by transporter aircraft. Probably
45 landed and contacted about 1,600 (ph) or so, most
46 hunters were in compliance. The only things that we
47 really encountered were just, you know, very minor
48 incidents of some discrepancies on their hunting
49 paperwork, tags, or license issues. No citations were
50

0065

1 issued. There was one waste caribou case, so a wanton
2 waste case that I can't really discuss too much more
3 of, we need to investigate that jointly with the
4 Troopers. The helicopter was extremely useful. We
5 were able to land on places we wouldn't have been able
6 to get in with our fixed-wing airplanes, but of course
7 our fixed-wing ranger pilot, we had come up and
8 participate, was able to land on even more contacts.
9 And, as always the local Wildlife Trooper, Steve
10 Canteen, spent most of that time flying around. A lot
11 of his contacts in the Preserve as well and so he was
12 landing on, in some cases, the same -- the same hunting
13 groups. Very successful, probably contacted more folks
14 than the Park Service does, investigates more cases,
15 it's just the nature of his job and resources allows
16 him to be out there even more often than we are and we
17 coordinate very closely with the Troopers when we
18 patrol during the hunting season.

19
20 If members of this group haven't heard --
21 we have listened to this very group a couple years
22 ago, we've been asked to have more rangers, more
23 rangers in the field and, you know, again, I'm pleased
24 to announce that we have another permanent ranger that
25 is going to be stationed -- or is stationed now here in
26 Kotzebue, Jim Hans. He has been up for the last three
27 summers working and working the hunting seasons with us
28 but he'll be year-round in Kotzebue now so that's going
29 to be.....

30
31 (Teleconference interference -
32 participants not muted)

33
34 MR. DALLEMOLLE:Jim now. And
35 I'll be sure that he introduces himself to this group
36 in the future and starts presenting so everybody can
37 get to know him, another good point of contact.

38
39 Beyond that, you know, just to get into
40 a little bit of the commercial activity numbers, we're
41 not going to discuss much on that but the numbers for
42 this last hunting season in 2021, they're not out quite
43 yet, we have most of the reports back from transporters
44 that will give us an indication of those numbers but we
45 won't have those numbers ready right now that'll --
46 that's still a couple months away, but definitely by
47 the next meeting we'll be able to get some of those
48 numbers out.

49
50

0066

1 With that, I guess I'll leave it at
2 that and just open it up to any questions.

3

4 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
5 Joe. Does anyone have any questions for Joe from
6 Western Arctic ParkLands Law Enforcement.

7

8 (No comments)

9

10 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Any questions for Mr.
11 Dallemolle.

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, thank
16 you for your report Joe. Good to hear we'll have
17 another year-round ranger getting out there and doing
18 good work. So we'll move on to our next
19 presentation.....

20

21 (Teleconference interference -
22 participants not muted)

23

24 CHAIRMAN BAKER:a report on
25 commercial use authorization, subsistence from the
26 National Park Service.

27

28 MS. ATKINSON: Hi. This is Hannah
29 Atkinson. I am going to be giving this presentation
30 today. So I'm the Cultural Anthropologist with Western
31 Arctic National Park Lands and then I do Subsistence
32 Resource Commission coordination and manage the
33 Subsistence Program.

34

35 And so the commercial use authorization
36 statistics, I'm presenting this but the.....

37

38 (Teleconference interference -
39 participants not muted)

40

41 MS. ATKINSON:team of people who
42 work together on this, Joe and Scott Sample, the
43 Resource Protection Manager and District Ranger, they
44 have the most interaction with the CUA holders and then
45 we receive reports from them each season. And like
46 Joe, just, you know, gave a short note, like we've been
47 presenting on those commercial use authorization
48 reports on a year by year basis but we do have a
49 database to track that information over time and we put
50

0067

1 in a significant amount of work in the last couple of
2 months to update that database for the last couple of
3 years. So the presentation that you have, Eva, do you
4 want to give them the page number so people are on the
5 right page.

6
7 (Teleconference interference -
8 participants not muted)

9
10 MS. PATTON: Through the Chair, thank
11 you for that Hannah. Yes, if you could please walk
12 through as you turn each page, that would be helpful
13 for the Council, the original.....

14
15 MS. ATKINSON: Yes.

16
17 MS. PATTON:presentation didn't
18 have the page numbers. So we're starting on the big
19 brown Park Service logo commercial use authorization
20 statistics 2018 to 2020.

21
22 MS. ATKINSON: Yes, thank you. That's
23 our title slide. And, yeah, my note for the title
24 slide is I apologize on the mistake about the dates for
25 the presentation, so the information that we're going
26 to share is ranging from 2009 to 2020 and there -- the
27 slide was some historic information going back to the
28 '90s. As I said we were putting in a lot of effort and
29 got this presentation into the booklet right in time.

30
31 So, anyway, and -- so I'm going to go
32 through the slides and I'll try to describe them as I
33 go so people can follow along and there are some
34 limitations to the data that we're going to present due
35 to like data entry and then like some things that need
36 to be checked on -- like by kind of interviewing with
37 the CUA holders, but I'll -- I'll just give you more
38 details on the limitations.

39
40 So going to the next slide, the title
41 is Commercial Use Authorization and it has some bullet
42 points. So to review what commercial use
43 authorizations are, they encompass all types of
44 commercial activities that are not otherwise authorized
45 under a concessions contract. Concessions would be
46 like the guides, they get contracts to operate in the
47 Park. And then the CUAs, commercial use authorization,
48 they range from land-based hiking groups, motorboat
49 fishing activities, air taxis, and big game hunting
50

0068

1 transfer -- transporters. So, we, in this
2 presentation, have tried to focus in on the big game
3 transporters. And so the next note is three to four
4 air taxis are operating regularly in Western Arctic
5 National Park Lands. And other operators listed are
6 usually ancillary to the area and making less than five
7 flights per year or less in the Park. So we do have
8 three -- we have more than three to four, but it's like
9 three to four that are operating regularly.

10

11 And it is common for CUA holders to
12 maintain a permit and may not operate.

13

14 (Teleconference interference -
15 participants not muted)

16

17 MS. ATKINSON: And then in 2020 three
18 CUAs were based in the NANA region, two of them are in
19 Kotzebue and only one is a big game transporter of the
20 two. And then one is in Ambler. Two CUA holders are
21 based in Bettles and others are based elsewhere in
22 Alaska.

23

24 REPORTER: Okay, Hannah. Hannah, could
25 you hold on just one moment please.

26

27 MS. ATKINSON: Uh-huh, yes.

28

29 REPORTER: Sorry. This is Tina, the
30 reporter. So I'm getting background noise of somebody,
31 it sounds like they're working in their kitchen, if
32 that's you could you please mute your phone, it's kind
33 of overriding Hannah.

34

35 Thanks.

36

37 MS. ATKINSON: Mute. Mute your phones,
38 thank you. Do you want me to repeat any information,
39 did you all catch the information on that slide.

40

41 (No comments)

42

43 MS. ATKINSON: Okay. We'll get into
44 more detail, this is still introductory information.

45

46 (Teleconference interference -
47 participants not muted)

48

49 MS. ATKINSON: All right, so all -- so

50

0069

1 almost all the big game transportation occurs between
2 August 1st and September 30th.

3

4 Going to the next slide, talking about
5 the types of reports that we receive from them. So all
6 the data, and this is where the data that we're sharing
7 comes from, from the CUA, and concession reports that
8 are submitted annually to the NPS from each company
9 conducting business. The reports include an annual
10 report that's the gross income that they receive and
11 State of Alaska Big Game Transporter activity reports
12 and activity reports that are specific to the NPS.

13

14 (Teleconference interference -
15 participants not muted)

16

17 MS. ATKINSON: If you just cleared your
18 throat I think you're off mute, if you could mute your
19 phone.

20

21 REPORTER: Yes, please, we can hear you
22 chewing.

23

24 MS. ATKINSON: And then concessions,
25 end of year reports, and CUA holders are required to --
26 the things they're required in these annual reports are
27 the flights, dates, numbers of passengers, activity,
28 aircraft tail number and landing coordinates as well as
29 if they're transporting big game hunters, the species
30 and estimated pounds of meat transported and name. So
31 notice that they're required to report the estimated
32 the pounds of meat and not the actual numbers of
33 animals. And then the hunting licenses and numbers of
34 each hunter.

35

36 And a review of the information
37 submitted 2009 to 2020 has shown that, like earlier
38 years, so when we look back like in prior years, the
39 information has like more missing data, so we're
40 getting like more and more complete data.

41

42 Any questions like on that introductory
43 information.

44

45 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Whoever is eating
46 right now can you please mute yourself.

47

48 REPORTER: Thank you. That would be
49 star, six, or the mute button on your phone please.

50

0070

1 Hannah, go ahead.

2

3

4 MS. ATKINSON: So going to the next
5 slide that's titled limitations of the data. There's a
6 couple notes on different types of information. So I
7 wanted to -- we wanted to share that at times the NPS
8 has reported on the number of CUA flights into the Park
9 and I know that information has been requested and
10 would be helpful, however, there are limits to what our
11 recorded data can tell us. Currently the CUAs
12 generally report one entire party of clients
13 transported to/from the same location on one form and
14 the form only accounts for one drop off and one pick up
15 roundtrip flight. And our NPS Staff estimate of the
16 flights that we have shared is based on the inference
17 that there's two roundtrip flights and no matter what
18 size of the specific party. But we know that the way
19 that people operate, that many drop off flights may
20 stop during their return and pick up other clients from
21 different parties that are leaving the field, and
22 because this is a common practice that wouldn't be
23 reported as a separate pick up. I think that the
24 estimate that we have is not -- not something that we
25 want to base decisions off of, it's probably higher
26 than what the actual flights are that are occurring.
27 And we would have to do further checking in with CUA
28 holders in order to find out whether those, like, pick
29 ups had multiple pick ups included. So we do not have
30 any information on that in our Power Point right now
31 because that limitation is so significant in terms of
32 what like that can tell us.

32

33 Then limitations of the animals
34 harvested. That is that we are estimating the number
35 of animals harvested -- after 2013.....

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hannah, are you still
38 with us.

39

40

(No comments)

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

MR. DALLEMOLLE: Mr. Chair, this is Joe
Dallemolle. She -- her call just dropped, we're
chatting, she's reconnecting now if you don't mind just
giving her a minute to get back in.

CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you
for that Joe. We'll just wait a second here, she
should be right back on.

0071

1 (Pause)

2

3 MS. ATKINSON: Hello.

4

5 CHAIRMAN BAKER: We can hear you.

6

7 MS. ATKINSON: Hi. I am back, sorry
8 about that. Should I just pick up where I left off.

9

10 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
11 Hannah.

12

13 MS. ATKINSON: This is Hannah. Thank
14 you. I typed the numbers so fast to dial back in.

15

16 So because we're estimating that
17 animals harvested based on the weight, you know, we're
18 using just like an average of poundage per caribou and
19 so there could be some error to those numbers of
20 animals harvested.

21

22 So limitations for location
23 information. CUA holders have gotten better over the
24 years at providing complete location information but in
25 some cases the NPS is still receiving reports with
26 information that's -- it's missing a portion of it or
27 there's like problems with data entry and so I think
28 that is one that could be worked out, you know, soon if
29 we can dedicate more time to our database but the
30 location information that I'm going to share is like
31 just a limited amount. We have a map from 2020 CUA
32 holders drop off locations but it'll take up more time
33 to feel certain and share that long-term data over
34 time.

35

36 And the database entry itself is
37 accomplished by one person, or more people, and they're
38 just like hand entering it into an access database, and
39 I'll show you on the next slide, like what our database
40 looks like. And it makes it difficult to detect errors
41 until you're working with the data in Excel or trying
42 to analyze it and then realizing that there is some
43 issues with what was entered. So we may have to -- the
44 Staff may have to spend a lot of time cleaning the data
45 as a result. And so our limitations are the
46 limitations of our office, we just don't have someone
47 working on this full-time, it's something we're able to
48 do in pieces.

49

50

0072

1 So if you go to the next slide you can
2 see the example of what it looks like and I have some
3 notes about it. So the database was developed in 2014
4 and it was updated again in 2017 and then updated in
5 2021. And so you can see it's not something that we
6 get a chance to update every year because it's not
7 assigned to any one of our Staff, we just are able to
8 get to it when one of us has time.

9
10 And we want to thank Nikki Braem did a
11 lot of the database updates for our 2020 report -- it's
12 not 2021 because as Joe said those reports are not
13 fully submitted yet so we have just entered the data
14 until 2020.

15
16 So there's definitely further
17 improvements that can be made to the database when
18 we're able to have -- get a chance and do that.

19
20 And then we're also like working with
21 regional concession staff on the system of reporting
22 from the CUAs so we can get better information to input
23 into the system. And then in the future that'll
24 include a map that people -- they'll continue reporting
25 -- CUAs will continue reporting the coordinates of
26 their drops but it'll also have a map that they can
27 select an area, a general area of drop offs.

28
29 Does anyone have any questions about
30 the database?

31
32 MS. SMITH: Mr. Chair, this is Hazel
33 Harris. I'm not sure what page to go to but under
34 commercial use authorizations it says, almost all big
35 game transportation occurs between August 1 and
36 September 30. It sounds like the Park Service has the
37 ability to choose any date to approve these big game
38 transportation. What does it mean when you're report
39 says almost all big game transportation occurs between
40 August 1 and September 30, are there other dates that
41 you folks have that's not included in the report?

42
43 MS. ATKINSON: Thanks, Hazel. We have
44 a slide later in the presentation that shows more
45 detail on this or maybe that's the one you're looking
46 at because there's a graph that shows the months where
47 people are hunting. But big game transportation
48 includes different species, and so I think that species
49 that are hunted outside of August and September include
50

0073

1 like other -- other species. Joe do you have more to
2 add to that?

3
4 MR. DALLEMOLLE: Yes, Joe Dallemolle
5 again. Maybe I can help clarify. So most of the
6 transporting activity occurs, again, August 1st through
7 September 30th, because that's the only open caribou
8 hunt season for non-Alaska residents in Game Management
9 Unit 23 and so that's -- that's what most people are
10 coming up to hunt for. That's -- that's the only time
11 period where those hunters can hunt so that's when
12 we're seeing that. And when we say, almost, that does
13 allow the caveat of a few more flights throughout the
14 years for various other species as Hannah mentioned.
15 We're not really seeing that. Some years go by we
16 don't see any big game transportation beyond that
17 August to September timeframe and -- but occasionally
18 we do and there are some Federally-qualified
19 subsistence users that may use transporters at
20 different times of the year too. But it's -- it would
21 be very small numbers and, again, some years we're just
22 not seeing that at all.

23
24 I hope that answers your question.
25 Does that help clarify that?

26
27 MS. SMITH: Yes, it does, thank you.

28
29 MS. ATKINSON: We'll be sharing some
30 more information about that. There's another --
31 another chance to talk about the timing of when people
32 are coming. But let me go to the groups of hunters
33 slide.

34
35 So this has a graph showing transported
36 groups of hunters in Noatak National Preserve, it's
37 abbreviated NOAT, from 2009 to 2020. The number of
38 groups of non-Federally-qualified hunters transported
39 into Noatak National Preserve averaged 125 over the
40 period 2009 to 2015 with the most occurring in 2012 and
41 they had 161 groups in that year. And in 2016 when
42 Federal lands were closed in GMU 23 to caribou hunting
43 by non-Federally-qualified users, 11 groups were
44 transported to the Noatak. This included caribou
45 hunters and they went into a portion of Noatak National
46 Preserve that is in 26A. And I will show you where
47 that is on the map that's later down in the slides, but
48 it's a map of the 2020 locations. But the 26A portion
49 of Noatak National Preserve is in the vicinity of the
50

0074

1 Nayigu River. And then in 2016 there were some that
2 were also hunting species other than caribou.

3
4 In 2017 an average of 87 groups have
5 been -- were transported to Noatak National Preserve.
6 And when we get to the location data for 2020 I'd just
7 note that the number of groups does not directly
8 respond to -- correspond to the dots on the maps and
9 this is a limitation in the way we're showing the data
10 because multiple groups get dropped off in one
11 location. We're going to work on that for future
12 presentations and see if we can show -- okay, going
13 through the next slide is the number of hunters that
14 were transported from 2009 to 2020. An average of 366
15 of non-Federally-qualified hunters were transported
16 into Noatak National Preserve between 2009 and 2015,
17 the most occurring in 2012 with 480 individual hunters.
18 In 2016 when all of the Federal lands in GMU23 were
19 closed, 37 hunters were transported into the Noatak and
20 this included caribou hunters into the 26A portion and
21 those who hunted other species besides caribou and
22 between 2017 and 2020 an average of 246 hunters were
23 transported into Noatak National Preserve.

24
25 The next slide is titled long-term
26 trends and there is a graph with a grey background
27 showing the number of clients and the number of
28 permitholders from 1991 to 2005. So this data is
29 historical, in that, it was developed prior to our
30 current database by a former NPS biologist so we can't
31 say that the information is directly comparable so
32 we're not putting a graph from 1991 to 2020 all on one
33 slide because we -- we got this -- this graph from our
34 earlier files and it just wasn't looked at with the
35 same considerations or the same methods. So -- but we
36 do want to share just to get a general idea of how
37 things have increased over time. The data for 2006 to
38 2008 is not available at this time. But for this data
39 until 2005, it shows that the growth in the number of
40 hunters transported into Noatak National Preserve began
41 in the '90s and peaked in 2005 at 154 hunters. And the
42 number of non-Federally-qualified hunters gradually
43 increased because the levels seen between 2009 and
44 2015, after 2016, and if you look at Slide 7 and Slide
45 8, so -- so Slide 7 is the number of hunters
46 transported 2009 to 2020 and then this historical
47 slide, you would see that the trend line has continued
48 -- continued up until 2012 and then it kind of
49 fluctuates after that. But it does not exceed 475.
50

0075

1 But it's higher than -- all of the years after 2009 are
2 higher than that 15 -- that number of 154 is what we
3 thought was an interesting thing looking at this
4 historical data said, and significantly higher in the
5 last 10 years.

6
7 So going to the next slide, we have --
8 then does someone have a question or a comment.

9
10 MS. SMITH: This is Hazel again. I'm
11 just curious why you didn't -- why there grey areas
12 about unknown residency, is it because the Park Service
13 was unable to collect the data or why do we have
14 unknown residents, you know, hunting in.....

15
16 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

17
18 MS. SMITH:the area.

19
20 MS. ATKINSON: That's a good question.
21 I'm -- I'm thinking that that is because what we are
22 able to get out of our database right now, like Nikki
23 do you want to speak to that.

24
25 (No comments)

26
27 MS. ATKINSON: Well, let me see if
28 Nikki will chime in on that after I give some other
29 notes for this.

30
31 So some reminders as we view this
32 slide, so it's a slide titled residency and the table
33 says transported hunters into Noatak National Preserve
34 by residency.

35
36 Noatak National Preserve was
37 established as a Preserve to allow for non-resident
38 hunting. And in the Federal system non-residents are
39 anyone living outside of the resident zone communities,
40 rural communities with C&T of this area, but this graph
41 is breaking it down into Alaskans and non-Alaskans
42 because we thought that you all would be interested in
43 that information but just wanted to give that reminder
44 about the Federal definitions and the State
45 definitions. Non-Federally-qualified is anyone that's
46 outside of the rural resident definition for who can
47 hunt in the -- in the Federal system. But what we're
48 seeing is that in all years, the majority of
49 transported hunters have been non-Federally-qualified
50

0076

1 users living outside of Alaska so non-Alaska residents
2 as well as non-Federally-qualified. And we don't have
3 information for 2011.

4

5 And Nikki is back on so maybe she can
6 speak to the grey portions of that.

7

8 MS. BRAEM: Hello.

9

10 MS. ATKINSON: Hi, Nikki.

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 MS. ATKINSON: I think she's having
15 phone issues so maybe she can just share the answer
16 with me and I'll read it in our chat group. Are you on
17 Nikki.

18

19 (No comments)

20

21 MS. ATKINSON: Okay, she's typing
22 something. But does anyone have any other questions
23 about residency, this residency slide?

24

25 MR. SCHAEFFER: Hannah.

26

27 MS. ATKINSON: Yes.

28

29 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yeah, this is Bob. I'm
30 kind of confused on the map, you know, listened to Joe
31 talk about landing 1,500 times and checking different
32 hunters all ov -- all -- all up from the Noatak
33 National Preserve and yet the in your -- the count, and
34 there was only 230 or so hunters up there for the
35 months of -- you know, that's a -- that's kind of
36 confusing to me. So if I could look at something to
37 show the numbers per month that would be nice but I
38 don't see that here. Am I getting confused right or am
39 I getting confused.....

40

41 MS. ATKINSON: So, the.....

42

43 MR. SCHAEFFER:wrong?

44

45 MS. ATKINSON:number of hunters
46 that are out there at any given time, that's kind of
47 like what your curiosity is?

48

49 MR. SCHAEFFER: Well, you know, when I

50

0077

1 go to Alaska Airlines and see a plane load of hunters
2 come in and they're all going out there, and I -- I
3 count a heck of a lot more than 230, and in just a
4 couple of days. So I guess my confusion is, howmuch --
5 how -- how'd you get -- are these average numbersor --
6 or I know you got 2019 there was only 80-some outside
7 hunters, that's confusing to me because I know there's
8 a heck of a lot more out there.

9
10 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah. Which slide are
11 you looking at, are you looking at the groups or the
12 number of hunters?

13
14 MR. SCHAEFFER: I was looking at both.

15
16 MS. ATKINSON: Okay.

17
18 MR. SCHAEFFER: But it's still kind of
19 confusing because if you look at the numbers that are
20 coming in to hunt and the transporters take them out,
21 you know, which they're busy 24 hours a day pretty much
22 because we got 24 hour light so.....

23
24 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

25
26 MR. SCHAEFFER:almost -- but it's
27 just I look at them and I thought the numbers were.....

28
29 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

30
31 MR. SCHAEFFER:because based on
32 -- based on what I perceive the numbers to be just
33 based on incoming hunter traffic.

34
35 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah. Joe wanted to
36 respond, you know, from his time out there on the
37 ground so go ahead Joe.

38
39 MR. DALLEMOLLE: Yeah, Joe Dallemolle
40 again. Maybe I can help clarify this a little bit, I
41 can see where some of that confusion could lie. First
42 of all, I think you mentioned something about me saying
43 something about 1,500 landings, I think my numbers were
44 somewhere around the vicinity of maybe we contacted 30
45 hunters. I just wanted to clarify that. So maybe, in
46 total the Park Service landed on two dozens or so
47 camps, I'd have to look at those numbers again, so,
48 again, it gives us a sampling of what's out there,
49 we're not able to land on everybody. With the Troopers
50

0078

1 involved, and their numbers would be higher, again,
2 they're getting in on more hunting groups. Some of
3 what we're seeing -- Hannah's presentation is just
4 going over the activity by commercial services on -- in
5 Noatak National Preserve. So the Park Service doesn't
6 have access to what occurs on other agency lands or
7 State lands so not all hunters that are coming in
8 hunting caribou during the fall hunting season are
9 necessarily going into the Preserve. We believe that a
10 good portion of that, possibly a majority of hunters
11 coming up are coming into Noatak Preserve, but without
12 looking at other numbers, State numbers and so forth
13 and comparing them we couldn't really give a good
14 estimate of what occurs within the Preserve versus
15 outside of the Preserve. Those are number we could
16 look at in the future and try to get it, it'll just
17 take us a little more work and time to do.

18
19 Furthermore, you know, when we see a
20 lot of hunters on the jet or just in Kotzebue, those
21 might be from a couple days worth of trips so, you
22 know, if you're seeing 40 hunters in the airport, that
23 doesn't mean that they necessarily came out of a field
24 that same day. I think, you know, flying around I'd
25 estimate maybe there's -- there's anywhere from, you
26 know, 40 to 50 hunt -- this is just a guess based on
27 what I've been seeing, maybe 40 to 60 hunters within
28 Preserve on certain weeks, some weeks within that
29 hunting seasons those numbers are a lot less, sometimes
30 they could be more than the average, it just depends on
31 how the transporters are scheduling things, where
32 people are at, when they're coming in and out of the
33 field, too, and some of those are delays based on the
34 aircrafts that are picking them up, restrictions on
35 those aircraft, oh, and weather conditions as well. So
36 it just -- it changes dramatically, you know, there's
37 not like we have a set number within the Preserve at
38 any one time. And that's the same week to week.

39
40 And, furthermore, what we're seeing is
41 hunting groups are probably staying out in the field
42 anywhere from a few days but normally about a week to
43 two weeks at a time on their hunts. They'll usually
44 come in a lot earlier if they're successful, if
45 everybody in their group are successful so it's just
46 very dependent on a number of factors.

47
48 But we're -- the -- the numbers that
49 Hannah's showing you are -- we believe are pretty
50

0079

1 accurate, we believe our reporting is pretty accurate
2 for the hunters that are traveling into the Preserve
3 through big game transporters. We hold them to a
4 pretty high standard of reporting and they're -- we
5 believe that's pretty accurate so those would be the
6 numbers just in the Preserve again.

7

8 I hope that clarifies a bit for you.

9

10 MS. ATKINSON: Thank you, Joe. Maybe
11 we can keep going and if you have any lingering
12 questions at the end we'll be happy to try and discuss
13 to find some explanation.

14

15 (Teleconference interference -
16 participants not muted)

17

18 MS. ATKINSON: Be sure to put your
19 phone on mute if you were just speaking.

20

21 REPORTER: Yes, please, thank you.

22

23 MS. ATKINSON: Unless you have
24 questions.

25

26 REPORTER: We can hear some kitchen
27 background noise. So, thanks, so we can hear Hannah.

28

29 MS. ATKINSON: All right. I'm going to
30 move to the timing slide. So it's titled timing and
31 the chart is the number of.....

32

33 (Teleconference interference -
34 participants not muted)

35

36 MS. ATKINSON:hunters transported
37 by month 2009 to 2020.

38

39 In the period 2009 to 2015 the majority
40 of transported non-Federally-qualified hunters were
41 dropped off in September. After 2016 this pattern
42 appears to have shifted to a more equal distribution
43 between August and September. And a few hunters
44 transported in other months of the year are hunting
45 other species.....

46

47 (Teleconference interference -
48 participants not muted)

49

50

0080

1 MS. ATKINSON:other than caribou
2 and moose. The next slide shows the.....

3
4 REPORTER: Hang on Hannah.

5
6 MS. PATTON: Hannah, Mr.....

7
8 REPORTER: Hang on. Hang on, please.

9
10 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

11
12 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair. Hannah. I'm
13 sorry to interrupt -- sorry to interrupt, I'm just
14 going to check in with our Council members. I think
15 somebody's making lunch, I think we're -- we'll
16 complete this presentation and probably break for lunch
17 but please -- is that, maybe, Bob, are you making lunch
18 -- if Council members please doublecheck your phones
19 and hit mute so we can -- so the whole Council can hear
20 Hannah's presentation.

21
22 Thank you.

23
24 MS. ATORUK: Can I make a motion that
25 we go on lunch break.

26
27 CHAIRMAN BAKER: We'd like.....

28
29 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

30
31 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara, I'd like
32 to finish Hannah's presentation since she's almost done
33 and then we can break for lunch.

34
35 Hannah, would you mind continuing on
36 with your.....

37
38 MS. ATKINSON: Yes.

39
40 CHAIRMAN BAKER:with your last
41 couple slides.

42
43 MS. ATKINSON: Thank you. Yes. And we
44 can revisit after lunch if people have more questions
45 but, yeah, I'll finish up the main -- so -- the main
46 points.

47
48 So, yeah, so this slide September,
49 August -- okay, next slide, this is the last one is
50

0081

1 that the -- it's a hunting group locations from 2020 in
2 Noatak National Preserve. And so I wanted to make sure
3 and share with you.....

4
5 (Teleconference interference -
6 participants not muted)

7
8 MS. ATKINSON:on this slide,
9 there weren't any reported drop offs in the 26A portion
10 of Noatak National Preserve but if you look at the map
11 there is a little, like, diagonal strip of land that is
12 outside of the main National Preserve boundaries.
13 That's the portion that's in 26A. And that's where in
14 2000 -- the -- so in 2018, 2019 and 2020 and in 2016
15 when GMU23 was closed there is -- there are some
16 companies, some transporters that are using that area
17 to drop off hunters in the Nayigu River area in the far
18 east, even outside of like the eastern boundary because
19 it's like an additional portion of the Preserve.

20
21 And other notes I have about this
22 location map, so we -- we want to have the followup
23 conversations with transporters to get better
24 locational data. As an example, some report -- some
25 transporters are reporting (indiscernible) locations
26 used by multiple groups on different dates so we just
27 have to ask them about those specific reporting -- the
28 way that they're reporting it, we don't want to assume
29 that it means a certain thing but if we ask some
30 followup questions then we could figure it out. So we
31 will have those discussions in the future.

32
33 And that is the bulk of the
34 information.....

35
36 (Teleconference interference -
37 participants not muted)

38
39 MS. ATKINSON:that I have to
40 share. I don't know there might be questions and we can
41 cover that after -- after lunch and you're welcome to
42 contact me and I will make sure I can get any questions
43 I can't answer to my team. On the last slide I have my
44 phone number and that's a cell, you can text. And then
45 I have Scott Sample as the CUA contact, and his phone
46 number right there.

47
48 (Teleconference interference -
49 participants not muted)

50

0082

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Great, thank you,
2 Hannah. If anyone has any questions, any quick
3 questions we can ask them now otherwise we can break
4 now for lunch until 1:30.

5
6
7 (No comments)

8
9 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing no
10 questions.....

11
12 MR. CLEVELAND: I got a question.

13
14 CHAIRMAN BAKER: do I hear a
15 motion to break for lunch.

16
17 MR. CLEVELAND: This is Vern.

18
19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes. Yes, go ahead,
20 Vern.

21
22 MR. CLEVELAND: Hi, Hannah, this is
23 Vern. I know we closed out some lands to Federally-
24 qualif -- non-Federally-qualified users but that don't
25 work with the State, does it, the State still keep --
26 hunters keep coming in to hunt in the State lands. How
27 can we change that? If we say that the closure is a
28 closure and nobody's going through the closure, like in
29 the Noatak Preserve and they still keep coming into the
30 State lands, how can we change that or change it.....

31
32 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

33
34 MR. CLEVELAND: to the BLM lands
35 or the.....

36
37 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

38
39 MR. CLEVELAND: State lands?

40
41 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah, I think that that
42 is one of the biggest questions of this proposal. So I
43 think that it's great to bring it up now and like, you
44 know, looking at this information and then we should,
45 you know, review where the closures are because the
46 State does have a Controlled Use Area from the mouth of
47 the Noatak -- or -- yeah, it's the mouth of the -- did
48 it get changed -- anyway, we should look at that area
49 because they have that, you know, the Controlled Use
50

0083

1 Area and talk about the State process. Nicole's going
2 to give her presentation after lunch so I think that
3 that would definitely be something to bring up again
4 after lunch and keep discussing because it's a really
5 big question.

6
7 MR. CLEVELAND: Yes, thank you. If
8 there would be some kind of answer or something for
9 that that'd be good. Thank you, Hannah.....

10
11 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

12
13 MR. CLEVELAND:thanks for the
14 good report.

15
16 MS. ATKINSON: Thank you.

17
18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, if there
19 are no number questions for Hannah right now, do we
20 hear a motion to break for lunch until 1:30.

21
22 MS. ATORUK: I so move.

23
24 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Moved by Barbara.

25
26 MR. CLEVELAND: Second on.....

27
28 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Do we have a
29 second.....

30
31 MR. CLEVELAND:on the break.

32
33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Seconded. All
34 those.....

35
36 MR. CLEVELAND: Second Vern.

37
38 CHAIRMAN BAKER:in favor -- moved
39 and seconded, all those in favor please say aye.

40
41 IN UNISON: Aye.

42
43 CHAIRMAN BAKER: And all opposed, same
44 sign.

45
46 (No opposing votes)

47
48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you
49 everyone we will reconvene at 1:30. 1:30 we'll come
50

0084

1 back.

2

3

(Off record)

4

5

(On record)

6

7

CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay, welcome

8

back.....

9

10

(Line break)

11

12

(Off record)

13

14

(On record)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

MS. ATKINSON: I guess I can't say that for sure but I think that it's definitely possible for us to plot location information on the same map over the course of a couple years but it was not something we could prepare for this meeting. And -- but we could potentially do that for like next meeting or maybe the meeting after. And -- but then to -- I guess like where, you know, questions often lead is like can we look at the transporter local data and analyze it with other types of data like traditional hunting areas, you know, and -- or caribou migration and analyze, you know, those different data sources together, and on that I -- I want to say that we are able to do that but it requires a lot more time and so analyzing the commercial use location data and the caribou migration is similar -- is -- is similar to what the methodology of Kyle Joly and Tim Fullman and Andrew Ackerman 2017 report did, is they used the information from the CUA database location information and analyzed it with the caribou collaring data. And it took years to do that level of analysis and have it published.

So, yes, all this stuff is something we could plan for the future, it's just not something we can bring to the Council very quickly and just requires Staff focusing on it. So definitely the information that the Regional Advisory Council requests we -- we take your requests very seriously and it often leads to Staff time being devoted to it. So keep letting us know what you want to see from us and, you know, talking with the Superintendent once they -- Mark -- Mark is making notes for that person who's going to be our permanent Superintendent -- but talking with that person when they get selected.

0085

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay, thank you,
2 Hannah. That's something that I think would be a good
3 tool to have for all parties involved in seeing maybe
4 over several years, color-coordinated, basically just
5 spit-balling, looking at this slide is here with each
6 green dot being a group location in.....

7
8 MS. ATKINSON: Uh-huh.

9
10 CHAIRMAN BAKER: 2020, let's say,
11 the 2019, back to.....

12
13 MS. ATKINSON: Uh-huh.

14
15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: 2016 when the
16 drop off happened, have each.....

17
18 MS. ATKINSON: Uh-huh.

19
20 CHAIRMAN BAKER: year color-
21 coordinated and maybe see if there's some kind of a
22 shift over the years, if that follows where the
23 migration is going and where the calving grounds, and
24 all that information is kind of lining up where
25 it's.....

26
27 (Teleconference interference -
28 participants not muted)

29
30 CHAIRMAN BAKER: overlapping year
31 after.....

32
33 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

34
35 CHAIRMAN BAKER: year. But thank
36 you for that explanation, understood that it can't all
37 be thrown together for this specific meeting. time.
38 Thank you for that.

39
40 MS. ATKINSON: Uh-huh.

41
42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Any other questions
43 for Hannah at this time.

44
45 MS. SMITH: Yeah, Mr. Chair, this is
46 Hazel.

47
48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Hazel.

49
50

0086

1 REPORTER: Okay, before Hazel goes,
2 somebody's having another conversation in the
3 background, if that's you, could you please mute your
4 phone.

5
6 Go ahead, Hazel.

7
8 MS. SMITH: Yes. You have a list of
9 limitations of the data and I want to know what your
10 reason is for the limitations, like the number of
11 flights, the animals harvested, the location
12 information, the database entry, is it because you
13 don't have Staff dedicated to it or what's the reason
14 of your limitation?

15
16 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah, Hazel, I -- for
17 each of those points I have some explanation on that
18 that I presented earlier and so like for the flight
19 information, that one is a big one, why can't we share
20 the number of flights into the Park. And so the reason
21 is because the way that they're reported, we assume
22 that it is two roundtrip flights that took place, one
23 for a drop off and one for a pick up, no matter the
24 size of the specific party but the way that people
25 actually operate is that they are dropping people off
26 and then maybe on their return flight they pick clients
27 up, you know, they're trying to maximize their hours
28 and the time that they're flying so they're going to be
29 doing stuff like that. So the estimates that we were
30 using in the past that we're assuming, like they did
31 one drop off and one pick up for each group is actually
32 -- it -- it would make it look like there are more
33 flights and so we didn't want to include that -- that--
34 that certain aspect has so many limitations that we
35 were like -- we don't want to include that because it
36 makes it look like there are more flights. And the way
37 that we would be able to get a better understanding of
38 the data and have something that we could use is going
39 and talking with the transporters and checking with
40 them about that practice of like picking up while
41 they're doing drop offs.

42
43 And that's -- well, that's the case
44 with like a lot of this stuff is that like when we get
45 it on the form, reporting it as it is exactly on the
46 form, and then also because we're using different
47 forms, we're getting information from a variety of
48 forms. There's also questions that come up with that,
49 that we would just have to clarify in order to be able
50

0087

1 to use that information.

2

3

4 And then I -- I got an answer for your
5 question about the resident, you know, the residents
6 that are -- we're not sure if they're residents or not,
7 that grey area on that graph is a good example of like
8 one of the limitations, and the reason that there is a
9 grey area of like not sure whether someone is a
10 resident or not is because some of the information
11 provided comes from State records and some from the NPS
12 activity reports which do not ask about residency. And
13 so if we only have -- if we don't get both the State
14 and Federal reports -- just the Federal ones then we
15 can't tell if the non-Federally-qualified users are
16 residents of Alaska or not.

16

17

18 So that's some response to the
19 limitations. And -- and we just want to be transport
20 about this is the information we are provi -- able to
21 provide in just the short timeframe that we had. And
22 some of it just gives you a general idea and -- but I
23 think it's all helpful for the discussion so -- so this
24 is basically preliminary data, like we just put it into
25 the database, brought it out, and put it into a
26 PowerPoint as fast as we could so that we could get it
27 ready for this Council but in order to have findings
28 that we feel confident in it would take another level
29 of analysis.

29

30

31 MS. SMITH: On the number of animals
32 harvested, isn't everybody supposed to have licenses
33 and aren't they supposed to report how much animals
34 they get like we have to here, the residents have to
35 report how many they get, I'm just.....

35

36

37 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

37

38

39 MS. SMITH:curious why you don't
40 have that data?

40

41

42 MS. ATKINSON: It's because of the
43 reports that we put into our database. So that -- that
44 data, the State has that data about the number of
45 animals harvested. But just our database that is
46 linking like the transporters and their clients that
47 they took out and the reports that we get from the
48 transporters and -- and the reports we use are listed
49 on that second slide, the State of Alaska Big Game
50 Transporter Activity Report and activity reports that

50

0088

1 are specific to the National Park Service and apply to
2 all commercial activity. That's -- that's why we don't
3 have the exact number of animals harvested just for
4 this database specifically.

5

6 MS. SMITH: It sounds like to me that
7 the State regulators and the Federal people need to sit
8 down at one table and talk about their data, you know,
9 before you make.....

10

11 MS. ATKINSON: Yeah.

12

13 MS. SMITH:presentations to the
14 people.

15

16 MS. ATKINSON: That -- that could
17 definitely be a good thing to do. Thank you for
18 bringing that up. It's always better for the data and
19 subsistence users if we're working together. We will
20 explore the different opportunities for that.

21

22 MS. ATORUK: That -- that tried to
23 happen when I was there and it doesn't work. The State
24 won't listen to the Feds and they don't listen to us.
25 Only the Federal people are trying to help us out here
26 and the State and Comm/Sport are -- Comm/Sport is more
27 important on the State side. They also need to see
28 that. And it's hard for them to meet together and
29 discuss this because it blows up.

30

31 Thank you.

32

33 Back on mute.

34

35 REPORTER: Thanks, Barb.

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Any questions for
38 Hannah Atkinson at this time.

39

40

41 (No comments)

42

43 CHAIRMAN BAKER: If not, thank you
44 Hannah for your report and for fielding those questions
45 and we will move on to Nicole Edmison, the Wildlife
46 Biologist for the Alaska Department of Fish and Game.
47 Nicole, are you on the line with us.

48

49 MS. EDMISON: Hi, Mr. Chairman, I am.

50

0089

1 Yes, thanks for the opportunity to present the
2 information. And I think some of the questions that
3 were just asked of Hannah might be addressed in this
4 presentation and, yeah, as she said the data she just
5 presented was very preliminary and we didn't really
6 have time to talk about that amongst ourselves
7 beforehand but -- but, yeah, thanks everybody for
8 letting me talk. And thank you so much to the Council
9 members for your reports. They're really insightful
10 and helpful and we're really grateful to hear from you.

11

12 So Eva can you direct folks to where my
13 presentation is in the materials.

14

15 MS. PATTON: Yes, thank you, Nicole.
16 And Council members, we just left off before lunch with
17 the CUA report from Hannah Atkinson and then there's a
18 yellow separation and you'll find next in your binder
19 is the Western Arctic Herd Overview, the WAH Caribou
20 Overview and you'll see with the grey heading and the
21 blue mountains in the background. So it's following in
22 order of your tab there.

23

24 MS. EDMISON: Thank you for that Eva.
25 And, yeah, I didn't -- I realize I didn't put slide
26 numbers on here so I'll make sure to read the slide
27 title, they all have different titles so when I change
28 slides I'll read the title.

29

30 So as you can see this is the Western
31 Arctic Herd Caribou Overview. I'm standing in for Alex
32 Hansen, he is on leave right now and this is sort of an
33 amalgamation of a couple different presentations he's
34 given at other meetings so many of you may have seen
35 some of these slides before and heard some of this
36 information and also Kyle did -- this is a repeat of a
37 few of the things he said.

38

39 So, yeah, you can see how we -- and
40 I'll start out with the most recent abundance numbers
41 here.

42

43 We did successfully do a photo census
44 in July, as Kyle said, and our number came out to be
45 188,000. And that's with a confidence interval of plus
46 or minus almost 12,000 so it's around 188.

47

48 2020 we weren't able to do a census.

49

50

0090

1 2019 there were 244 and as he said
2 that's kind of about a 23 percent decrease between 2019
3 and now.

4
5 So here is a long-term graph, I've
6 switched to the Western Arctic Herd abundance graph
7 slide. And these are population estimates that have
8 been conducted since the '70s and the most recent peak
9 occurred in 2003 estimating the herd at about 490,000
10 caribou. After the peak the herd has been on a decline
11 -- it was on a decline until 2016, and around that time
12 we saw some positive signs including a substantial
13 increase in adult female survival and calving rates and
14 calf recruitment. That just means calf survival
15 throughout the year.

16
17 And from that I'll go into the
18 additional biological information that we collect, not
19 just the census data. So you will have noticed that we
20 don't do a census every year but we do a lot of other
21 data gathering things every year almost to keep an eye
22 on what the herd is doing and figure out what metrics
23 are most useful to us in terms of management. So for
24 the biological data I'll start at the beginning, in the
25 scheme of life, at calving, that makes sense, right.
26 And so parturition rates, that just means the
27 percentage of calves that were born into the herd,
28 parturition rates this year were at -- or, sorry, last
29 year, in the spring the calves were at 68 percent and
30 that's below -- just below the long-term average of 70
31 percent. And then recruitment, that just means the
32 amount of calves that survive their first winter, and
33 the term short- -- short-yearling just means that
34 calves are nearly a year old, right. So short-yearling
35 recruitment is 17 calves to 100 adults and that's right
36 at the average. The long-term average. It's down from
37 the past couple of years. Oops, sorry I forgot to say
38 I'm on the recruitment slide now, and please feel free
39 to butt in if I'm going too fast or too slow or you
40 can't hear me or anything of if questions come up for
41 sure just let me know.

42
43 So yeah we.....

44
45 MS. ATORUK: Excuse me. Hello.

46
47 MS. EDMISON: Hi.

48
49 MS. ATORUK: I lost you, I don't know
50

0091

1 what page you're on.

2

3 MS. EDMISON: Yeah, I'm sorry, I didn't
4 put page numbers on, I regret that now and I'm on the
5 recruitment slide.

6

7 MS. ATORUK: What numb.....

8

9 MS. EDMISON: It's about the fifth
10 slide in.

11

12 MS. ATORUK: Do we have you here in the
13 meeting book?

14

15 MS. EDMISON: Sorry, what was that?

16

17 MS. ATORUK: Do we have you here on our
18 meeting book under the numbers or are you -- am I
19 supposed to look for another.....

20

21 MS. EDMISON: Eva, can you help me out
22 there, I don't have the meeting.....

23

24 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Barbara, this.....

25

26 MS. EDMISON: Sorry.

27

28 CHAIRMAN BAKER: This is Thomas. This
29 presentation is the one right after Hannah Atkinson's
30 that we were looking at before lunch and it's under Tab
31 5. It's towards the end of Tab 5 in your meeting book.

32

33 MS. ATORUK: Okay. Thank you. Gotcha.

34

35 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr.....

36

37 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman.

38

39 MS. PATTON:thank you, Mr. Chair.

40 And you'll see.....

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hold on, was that.....

43

44 MS. PATTON:you have a grey.....

45

46 CHAIRMAN BAKER:Mike Kramer.

47

48 MS. PATTON:a grey heading.....

49

50

0092

1 MR. KRAMER: Yes.

2

3 MS. PATTON:at the top.

4

5 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, I just
6 wanted to let you know I'm online.

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Mike.
9 Someone note for the record that Vice Chair Mike Kramer
10 has joined the call.

11

12 REPORTER: Will do. Thank you.

13

14 MS. PATTON: Welcome, thank you, Mike.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right. So, again,
17 we're on the report from Nicole Edmison with the
18 Department of Fish and Game and it's under Tab 5 in our
19 books. It's the one that's titled WAH Caribou Overview
20 and we're on the page with the grey heading,
21 recruitment. If there is no other questions, Nicole,
22 the floor is yours again.

23

24 MS. EDMISON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
25 Yeah, again, I apologize for not putting slide numbers
26 on here, that would have made things easier. I will do
27 that next time.

28

29 Right. So I think I explained this
30 slide. Yeah, so we're just right at the long-term
31 average, you can see the long-term average there, that
32 red line in the middle of the graph, and that's a
33 little bit down from the last couple of years but we're
34 doing okay there.

35

36 So next slide, adult survival. So we
37 mainly track adult female survival because as everyone
38 knows the females make calves and that's how the herd
39 grows and they're kind of linchpin there. So adults --
40 adult female survival is a little bit below the long-
41 term average of 81 percent, it's at 73 percent right
42 now, which isn't on the graph, I apologize for that,
43 it's not updated for this year. So survival occurred
44 through the decline and then it improved for a couple
45 of years in 2013 and '16 as you can see, and then it
46 was followed by a dip in survival in 2017, which has
47 continued until this time. We're up from a little bit
48 from that dip in 2017 which was only 64 percent, we're
49 up to 73 now but we're still below the average as you
50

0093

1 can see.

2

3 So the next slide, fall composition.
4 This is another metric that we look at. We do this
5 during the fall migration when we assume that the herds
6 are evenly mixed between males and females and all the
7 youngsters are there too so we can take a look at them.
8 As you can see the bull to cow ratios have held fairly
9 steady, above the lower management level of the -- of
10 the -- the Western Arctic Herd Working Group Management
11 Plan objectives, which I'll get into a little bit
12 later, but I'm sure many of you are aware of that
13 document the Working Group Management Plan that
14 explains a lot of the objectives and management goals
15 that we're working towards. So we're well above the
16 management plan objective of 3,200 -- 30 bulls to 100
17 cows, we're at 47 bulls to 100 cows this year. And
18 although I don't have it -- we weren't specifically
19 recording this but during that survey where we looked
20 at, you know, well over 10,000 caribou throughout the
21 herd and throughout the entire range of the herd during
22 the fall migration, we were able to see that all age
23 classes of bulls appeared to be represented very well
24 and the herd looked to be quite healthy. So that was --
25 that was looking pretty good back there in the fall.

26

27 The next slide is causes of mortality.
28 And you can see this is just a graph representing the
29 mortality of collared individuals. We can only see
30 certain of the mortality of collared individuals
31 because we don't know what happens to everything else
32 on the landscape once it -- once it stops moving
33 around. So we -- we group this into three basic
34 categories; predators, hunters and unknown. And it's
35 not a perfect representation, of course. One issue
36 being that timing between when an animal dies and when
37 we can actually get to the site where it died, it can
38 be a long time, and weather events can happen and
39 scavenging can happen so some of that information is
40 lost sometimes. So not perfect, of course, but it's
41 the best we can do given the geographic scope of where
42 these animals roam, right. So the unknown is just a
43 catch all class that includes mortalities that we're
44 just unsure about. And we're working on getting out
45 there sooner once we know an animal that has been
46 collared has died so we can get more information there.

47

48 Moving on to the next slide, population
49 trends. This is another graph. You'll see it starts

50

0094

1 in 1985 and it's kind of a messy graph but I'll explain
2 it here. So you can see on the left side in the green
3 section that's labeled growth, that's comparing cow
4 survival rates with calf recruitment rates and helps us
5 get a better understanding of the population
6 trajectory. So when cow mortality is low, not a lot of
7 cows are dying and calf recruitment is high, we're
8 getting a lot of calves from those cows, the relative
9 difference is positive which means we're getting growth
10 in the herd, right. So we can look at those two
11 metrics to get an idea of how the herd is doing and
12 that's really helpful in years when we don't conduct a
13 photo census. So, you know, it's just another one of
14 the tools that we're trying to use to keep an eye on
15 everybody out there and manage properly.

16
17 So moving on to the management affects
18 of this. This is a graph of a table from the Western
19 Arctic Herd Working Group Cooperative Management Plan
20 and these are the harvest recommendations that that
21 working group came up with and I think it was last
22 updated in 2019, anybody correct me if I'm wrong, I'm
23 fairly new here and I'm not sure of the timeline there.
24 So you can see the first circle that's light blue, it's
25 -- we are right now -- currently we are still in a
26 conservative declining management -- we're at a
27 conservative declining management level because the
28 last census had over 200,000 caribou. And it's also
29 based on through adult and calf survival and
30 recruitment. So the new population estimate from the
31 July photo census that we just conducted has moved us
32 into a different management level according to the
33 recommendations from the Western Arctic Herd Working
34 Group. So now moving forward the Working Group's
35 recommendations are going to have to be in this
36 preservative declining, yellow box, just under the
37 orange box with the darker blue circle. And we're in
38 that because of the lower population numbers. Also
39 there are lower calving rates and we're continuing to
40 see this lower cow survival rate.

41
42 So moving on to the next slide,
43 management level. That's basically just explaining
44 what I was just talking about in that previous table.
45 So presently we're in the conservative management level
46 recommendations and already, you know, encouraging the
47 voluntary reduction of calf harvest, prohibiting non-
48 residents from harvesting cows, restricting non-
49 resident bull harvest, of course, and encouraging
50

0095

1 voluntary reduction in resident cow harvest. Something
2 that isn't happening right now because of bull to cow
3 ratios is limited subsistence harvest of bulls --
4 because the bull to cow ratio has been above the
5 average and above that objective of 30 bulls to 100
6 cows. So moving forward, based on the July photo
7 census numbers and a couple of other metrics, the
8 Working Group will recommend no harvest of calves, I
9 don't think a lot of people are doing that, a limited
10 harvested of cows by residents through permit hunts and
11 while these are -- let me be clear -- these are some
12 recommendations that the -- that the Working Group
13 might support to the Board. And limited subsistence
14 harvest of bulls to maintain at least 30 bulls to 100
15 cows, to maintain that ratio, which we're doing fine on
16 that ratio, and also to restrict harvest to residents
17 only according to State and Federal law, and closures
18 of some Federal public lands may be necessary.

19

20 So these are kind of the nuts and bolts
21 of recommendations from this management plan and that
22 Working Group. They're just recommendations, it
23 doesn't set up any actual changes in regulations as
24 they are now. That's a longer process there as you all
25 know.

26

27 So moving on to the next slide, Western
28 Arctic Herd Management. These are the management
29 objectives that were set by the Western Arctic Herd
30 Working Group and bear in mind they were set when the
31 population was quite high. So I'm not sure how much
32 that plays into things but it's a good thing to keep in
33 the back of your mind. So we all know that the herd
34 has had a very long history of customary and
35 traditional use. There have been enough caribou for
36 the amount necessary for subsistence. The annual
37 harvest estimate is -- that's been a real struggle for
38 us and I'll get more into that in the next couple of
39 slides. Intensive management objectives, that refers
40 back to that colorful table that I had a couple of
41 slides ago that, you know, once we get to a certain
42 population level then management recommendations might
43 change. And harvestable surplus, approximately 11,300
44 bulls and cows combined, so about six -- the management
45 objectives are about six percent or less of the total
46 herd number.

47

48 So moving on to the next slide, Western
49 Arctic Herd management challenges. One big challenge

50

0096

1 has been a clear picture of harvest rate, mainly in the
2 local -- the Federally-qualified subsistence users,
3 it's been challenging, the RC907 and RC800 report
4 participation has been a bit low to provide a clear
5 picture of local harvest and the harvest model that
6 we've been using is too course to provide very
7 meaningful data for management on the scale that seems
8 necessary at current levels and an increased
9 understanding of harvest is key to understanding the
10 human caused impacts. And human caused impacts are one
11 of the only things that we can actually control so
12 that's kind of key in management.

13

14 Moving on to the next slide called
15 harvest model. So I mentioned this in the previous
16 slide, our harvest model is pretty vague. What we kind
17 of think we know in a long-term perspective, this goes
18 from 1999 to 2019, we're fairly confident about the red
19 parts here on this graph. Those are the reported
20 harvest and the grey part is -- it's grey on purpose,
21 it's a big grey area, another story there, we just need
22 that information to understand what the actual
23 population levels are -- what's affecting the actual
24 population levels and we all know that that's a myriad
25 of things, it could be many, many things and it is, I'm
26 sure. So, yeah, the truth is we don't have a great
27 handle on annual local harvest rates but we suspect
28 that they've gone down given the recent changes and
29 harvest availability in the last few years.

30

31 So the next graph his kind of a little
32 bit of a repeat of the previous ones. This is harvest
33 reporting. So you'll see the blue bars show the
34 reports that we've gotten of harvest, and that orange
35 line up by 12,000 that's our harvest estimate, that's
36 how many we think are being harvested, and that part in
37 the middle that's white, we don't know what happens
38 there. So as you can see we're missing some crucial
39 information and that makes management very tricky.

40

41 So moving on to the next slide, annual
42 variation. I think Kyle may have shown this slide or
43 some version of it in his presentation, I wasn't able
44 to see his. But this is kind of a difficult graph to
45 wrap your brain around but I think you'll appreciate it
46 once you look at it for a minute, it shows the -- it
47 shows what areas the caribou are wintering in
48 throughout these different years, from 1991 to 2002,
49 and you can see it's pretty variable there. Caribou

50

0097

1 are just pretty squirrely. They don't seem to have
2 much fidelity to a certain wintering spot or route
3 even. So we've been able to track caribou and these
4 patterns pretty accurately over the past 30 years
5 because of radio collars and GPS collars. And, yeah,
6 if you just have a little bit of time to look at this
7 graph now or whenever, you know, it kind of -- it
8 illustrates kind of a lot, in a somewhat messy but
9 interesting way. So this also -- another interesting
10 thing with this, the timeframe corresponds with the
11 onset of pretty notable changes in weather patterns in
12 the Arctic.

13
14 Moving on to the next slide,
15 availability. So this is kind of a smaller timeframe
16 snapshot of what I was trying to explain in the
17 previous graph. You know this is the difference in
18 winter range usage between the last two winters so I
19 mean you all already know what the caribou were doing
20 the last two winters, and last winter they were way up
21 in the Brooks Range and the winter before that they
22 were kind of spread throughout their range and some
23 were available down where villages are and stuff so
24 people were able to get caribou two winters ago but
25 last winter was pretty rough.

26
27 So moving on to the summary slide.
28 Biological concerns, of course, I'm just reporting on
29 the biological side of it, that's what we're supposed
30 to do here. Most of the biology lines up perfectly
31 with the traditional knowledge and, you know, we're all
32 kind of on the same page about a lot of things, it's
33 just trying to figure out how to manage it properly.
34 So biological concerns, we're hovering around a
35 critical threshold that will put us into a different
36 management strategy. The short-yearling recruitment is
37 around average, that's okay. Calving rates are below
38 average, that's something to think about. Adult cow
39 survival is below average also so that's another
40 concern. Harvestable surplus, we need data on that.
41 So biological conclusions which line up pretty well
42 with traditional knowledge and all the reports that we
43 got from Council members, calving rates and cow
44 survival rates are slightly below average. And non-
45 Federal -- no -- yeah, non-Federally-qualified user
46 harvest is a known factor in this and it's a fairly
47 small percent of total harvest. Fall migration is
48 heavily tied to temperature changes and snow events, as
49 Kyle talked about and as everybody, you know, hunters
50

0098

1 who have been out on the landscape know. Caribou
2 winter ranges continues to shift, again, yeah, Kyle
3 talked about that, everybody who's on the landscape
4 knows that. It's pretty obvious based on harvest
5 availability.

6
7 And, yeah, that's about all I have to
8 report. I'm happy to field any questions. I apologize
9 in advance if I can't answer them. Like I said I'm
10 fairly new to the region but I will do my best and
11 anybody else who might be able to answer a question
12 better, please don't hesitate to chime in. Thanks a
13 lot for your time.

14
15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Nicole.
16 Does anyone have any questions for Nicole's report.

17
18 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, this is
19 Mike.

20
21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
22 Mike.

23
24 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, hi, Nicole, this is
25 Mike Kramer. As I see is that our, you know, our
26 caribou herd is continuing to decline and within the
27 next several years we'll probably most likely see, you
28 know, cow harvest dropped. I mean in my experience I
29 believe that's the reason why the bulls are so high, is
30 because by the time they come through, you know, our
31 villages and the Kobuk River and the Noatak River, you
32 know, they've already been starting to rut when they
33 decide to come through. And I've asked Alex in the
34 past, you know, to tell me the truth, tell us the truth
35 that air traffic does have an influence on their
36 migration and he said, yes, you know, as soon as the
37 air traffic stops up there in the Upper Noatak and
38 wherever else that the caribou all of a sudden just
39 turn about face and just start marching south. And by
40 the time they get to the Kobuk River there's a thin
41 layer of ice and they're hesitant to cross that type of
42 ice -- that type of ice on the river. You know with
43 us, here in Kotzebue, and other villages south of us,
44 you know, harvesting cows that's just going to continue
45 to allow the cow -- bull to cow ratio to drop compared
46 to the bulls. And the reason why the bulls are so
47 high, according to what I think, is that, we're unable
48 to harvest them because they're still north. They
49 haven't come south. You know and the biggest, biggest
50

0099

1 pet peeve I have with guides and transporters, we, in
2 our culture, we allow the first ones to pass, always.
3 They lay that undisturbed scent trail south. But if we
4 have guides and transporters operating five miles north
5 of the Noatak River they're sending a disturbed scent
6 trail south and caribou want to travel on a -- you
7 know, they don't want to migrate on a disturbed scent
8 trail and that's one of the reasons why they're still
9 remaining north until after the air traffic quits.

10

11 You know my suggestion is that we have
12 to wait and we have to allow the first ones to come
13 through so why can't they, as transporters and guides,
14 you know, follow our culture and what we were brought
15 up, in our beliefs and, you know, we live to these
16 beliefs and we live to our cultural way of life. By
17 the time the caribou come through here in Kotzebue, the
18 only thing is good is maybe young bulls but the cows
19 and I believe they're harvested early enough in January
20 and into early part of February and then after that,
21 you know, I don't even attempt to go after cows anymore
22 because, you know, they're the bread and butter of the
23 herd.

24

25 But I believe that our next step should
26 be eliminate the guides and transporters.

27

28 No. 2. Land enhancement.

29

30 No. 3. Predator control.

31

32 I know we can't do anything about land
33 enhancement and predator control but we need to take
34 care of No. 1, eliminating guides and transporters.
35 You know I do hold the commercial services seat and I
36 haven't heard anything from anybody but I believe that,
37 you know, the couple of years are going to be very,
38 very critical on our caribou herd population
39 especially, you know, with us being even able to
40 harvest bulls when we're supposed to and I believe
41 that's why the ratio is so high on bulls is because we
42 can't get any. Up there by Kiana, a bunch of guys went
43 up river where they usually wait past the small channel
44 at the Y and they saw bulls mingling around back there,
45 none crossed, so they went back home. The next morning
46 they got up and the river was frozen so they didn't go
47 anywhere. Well, then the next day, on the third day,
48 the ice broke up and it got warm again, guys went up
49 there and they harvested caribou because the ice was

50

0100

1 broken up enough for them to cross.

2

3

4 I believe that we need to start taking
5 action now because of the past history of some Federal
6 agencies that we depend on has failed to listen and to
7 understand our concerns. And this subsistence
8 resource, it's a very critical, critical subsistence
9 resource, caribou, we live by caribou, we live by
10 moose, we live by sheep, you know, and all the other
11 animals that we harvest here in Northwest Alaska.

12

13 That's about all I have for right now,
14 thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Mike. Does
17 anybody have any other questions for Nicole.

18

19 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

20

21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead.

22

23 MS. ATORUK: You know when this first
24 started way back, when we first started coming on to
25 start with the Northwest Arctic Council with the
26 Federal side and stuff and we Coordinators attended the
27 Staff Committee meetings but we didn't have a voice but
28 we knew John Borbridge, he was sitting with the Staff
29 Committee so we started using him to speak through him
30 to say, ask us, please ask us and it finally came up to
31 the Chair there to ask us some questions. And I posted
32 that, I said, you know, it's always been our tradition,
33 our Native tradition up there to have the first two or
34 three, or how many ever caribou that are crossing, to
35 let them cross unless you are in dire and being hungry
36 but if you are going to do that you have to kill all
37 four, or how ever many are crossing because if one of
38 them go back that will hold the herd from coming
39 forward. The Southeast, that committee laughed at me
40 and he said that's just a belief. I stood up and I
41 said, it is not a belief, it is a fact. It's a known
42 fact that you don't know and understand, our people
43 live by this. Because the Federal people had no idea
44 about who we were, and how we lived, how we survived
45 and a lot of them still don't.

46

47 Now, on the State side they have some
48 understanding but then they won't go with us because
49 this CommSport area is where they make their monies,
50 money flows in, the Feds have the dollars.

51

0101

1 So we need to get by this somehow and
2 find a way to talk to both sides. Try to have a joint
3 meeting with the Federal and the State Boards, there's
4 always a glitch, big time, because they each have their
5 reports on each side to defend their stand. So if you
6 guys can find a way to do this and work with this, get
7 other Council members from the Northwest area like
8 Seward Penn and North Slope to defend you, to help you.
9 The State Advisory Committees know about this, they
10 understand about this, they lived it. I don't know who
11 are on the Advisory Committees anymore. All our good
12 Council members from the past that I worked with and
13 supported me as I worked as the Coordinator are in
14 retirement now and not there. Like Pete Schaeffer,
15 Walter Sampson, Sheldon Katchatag, Fenton Rexford,
16 Edward Itta -- the late Edward Itta, and all those
17 people they're not here anymore. We're on the stand
18 here now to make the voice for our people and let the
19 Federal and State people know that we do know and
20 understand all this and that is true. And thank you,
21 Mike, for your voice here.

22

23 Thank you much. Back on mute.

24

25 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.
26 Does anyone else have any questions for Nicole based on
27 the ADF&G report.

28

29 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, this is
30 Michael.

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead.

33

34 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, I'm not too sure if
35 we talked about moose on the State side or the Federal
36 side, but I wanted to try and find out when do they
37 plan on, and which area do they plan on doing their
38 next count.

39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: We haven't discussed
41 moose yet, that'll be after -- we're in the reports
42 right now on caribou and then will be the caribou
43 analysis and then after that will be the moose analysis
44 later this afternoon, Mike.

45

46 MR. KRAMER: Okay, I just wanted to
47 check on that. You know like Barbara said, all the
48 other guys that used to be there in the past, I'm one
49 of the guys that's still here from the past because
50

0102

1 back then I was a kid. I was the youngest person on
2 the Board for 10, 11 years. You know, Lance -- my
3 brother Lance used to be on the Committee also back
4 then and then he moved away and then I jumped in and so
5 I'm still here. I'm the only one that's left from the
6 past members, Council members, because Barbara was the
7 one that gave me an application and ever since then
8 I've been still here serving on the Council.

9

10 Okay, thank you.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Mike.
13 Nicole, I have a question, this is Thomas for your
14 slide harvest reporting.

15

16 MS. EDMISON: Uh-huh.

17

18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: There's a big gap
19 between what's reported and what's estimated to have
20 been harvested each year, is there a breakdown that you
21 readily have available of what was reported between
22 non-Federally-qualified users, the outside hunters and
23 local hunters for those years? Just because it looks
24 so steady across the board, is this number reported, is
25 that everything reported between local and non-local or
26 is that some combination of the two?

27

28 MS. EDMISON: Yeah, we do have that
29 information and this graph is showing everything that's
30 reported, both local and non-local, in-state, out of
31 state, everybody. Sorry, I misspoke here -- this is --
32 oh, no, I didn't, sorry, so many graphs I've made in
33 the past couple of months but, yes, I do have that
34 information that I could get to you at a later date if
35 you'd like and share with other people.

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, if that
38 could be sent to the Council that would be some good
39 information to see what -- I mean it's written out in
40 the other graph, but just to show just the hard number
41 of this is on average or this is the actual number of
42 what local hunters were reporting in 2017. I think
43 that would be a good piece of information just because
44 then the Council can see that and say, well, in my
45 community in 2018 we barely got this so trying to line
46 up where the numbers line up.

47

48 So, thank you. Are there any other
49 questions for Nicole.

50

0103

1 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, it's Wilbur.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
4 Wilbur.

5

6 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, Nicole, back maybe
7 fix, six years ago, calving, now that it's below
8 average, we had a bunch of guys like Raymond Stoney,
9 Glenn Miller and Jim Dau, we had a big problem on the
10 calving, when it went down so quick due to the eagles,
11 do they still go and are they taking a lot of calves
12 this year or something, because they say they had no
13 idea why -- or how much eagles are up there. But Glenn
14 Miller said that, bring me up there, I'll sit around up
15 there and take care of the eagles. So are they a
16 problem as predator? Thank you.

17

18 MS. EDMISON: I -- yeah, thanks, that's
19 a good question. I do believe eagles do prey on
20 caribou calves a bit but I can't speak to what numbers
21 really. And, you know, that might be a question for
22 someone who's been around a little bit longer. And
23 maybe that's a good cue to kind of segway into the
24 discussion for the WSA if there are no other reports to
25 give about it. I'm not sure. But very good question
26 and I'm sorry I can't elaborate on that more.

27

28 MR. JOLY: Mr. Chairman, this is Kyle
29 Joly.

30

31 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Was that Kyle Joly.

32

33 MR. JOLY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
34 This is Kyle Joly with the Park Service. Nicole's got
35 it right, you know, eagles -- Golden Eagles are
36 predators of caribou calves, just the neonates on the
37 calving grounds. And so the Brooks Range does create
38 some good habitat for them. But Fish and Game did do a
39 study on caribou survival calves, they did a three year
40 study and Alex Hansen was in charge of that. And the
41 caribou calves actually did survive pretty well, higher
42 than other herds, and so while there is some predation
43 of neonates on the calving grounds by eagles, it is a
44 fairly small percentage.

45

46 MR. HOWARTH: Okay, thank you. Thank
47 you so much. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

48

49 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you for that

50

0104

1 Kyle and Wilbur. Do we have any other questions for
2 Nicole at this time.

3

4 MR. ARMSTRONG: Just one, this is
5 Elmer.

6

7 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead, Elmer.

8

9 MR. ARMSTRONG: I know in the falltime
10 too, through social media I saw that, I think, someone
11 took a picture of a vulture in the Noatak River and I'm
12 not too sure about the stellar eagle too. I mean just
13 seeing that in our area is kind of odd and I think both
14 of them are -- I don't know if they're getting the
15 calves but just wanted to point that out.

16

17 Thank you.

18

19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Elmer.

20

21 MS. EDMISON: Yeah, that's -- that's
22 definitely something to think about and it kind of -- I
23 think that kind of points back to some of the changes
24 in climates and how that's changing the habitat and
25 things like that as well. In terms of vultures, I
26 wouldn't worry about them killing the calves, they eat
27 dead things. But just these other odd birds showing up
28 that aren't usually here, I think that's pretty
29 indicative of what's happening with climate change and
30 the changes that it's causing.

31

32 MR. SCHAEFFER: Mr. Chair.

33

34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, is that Bob.

35

36 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yeah, this is Bob. I
37 appreciate the statistic, you know, I think this sort
38 of puts everything in perspective when it comes to calf
39 survival, female survival, you know, but -- but it
40 doesn't change the fact that we're not getting bulls.
41 And I'm just kind of looking at it from a realistic
42 standpoint, you know, with the population dwindling
43 down to 56,000 in two years, I know some drastic
44 measures has to be changed and regulations have to be --
45 need to be made to accommodate, you know, the drop in
46 our numbers and I understand that. But, you know, I
47 think that I always revert back to the past when, you
48 know, the Fish and Wildlife Service had a professional
49 guy that went up and shot wolves for the winter, you
50

0105

1 know, to try to lessen the predation of the caribou
2 and, of course, that's impossible to do nowadays with
3 the environmental groups, Friends of the Earth and the
4 Friends of the Wolves and Friends of everybody and
5 everything else it would never happen again. But yet
6 on the other hand when you have high predation,
7 especially when, you know, the wolves and the bears are
8 at a population that are real high, you have very
9 little chance of positively affecting or even
10 protecting that herd. I don't expect anything to
11 change and I think we'll continue to see drops in the
12 herd because we're considered predators as well, so
13 high predation of that herd, you know, and -- and no
14 ability at all to try to cut down on the predators, I
15 just feel for that herd because I just know that they
16 have very little chance of survival and so -- and
17 anyway, you can -- you can tax the human being, on the
18 other hand, you can't tax the wolves and the bears and
19 the eagles and whoever else is feeding on the fawns.

20

21 So it'll be interesting to see what
22 actions that the Department of Fish and Game takes. I
23 know we're all going to have to sacrifice something in
24 order to try to save this herd.

25

26 But, anyway, I thought I'd mention
27 that, thank you.

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, thank you, Bob.
30 Any other questions for Nicole before we move on.

31

32 MS. SMITH: Yes, this is Hazel. I know
33 great strides have been made on how the census is
34 conducted. I think I remember them days when Jim Dau
35 and them used to take pictures and get magnifying
36 glasses and count that way and technology has brought
37 them a lot easier results now and I'm just wondering
38 what the State, is it going to continue its census into
39 the next year?

40

41 MS. EDMISON: Thank you, Hazel. That's
42 a very good question. Yes, we are going to do our very
43 best to do another photo census this coming summer and
44 we are hoping to, especially with lower herd numbers to
45 do it every year until numbers come back up. And
46 you're right, the technology has come a long way and it
47 makes it a lot easier, I can definitely say that first
48 hand having counted a lot of the caribou in the herd.

49

50

0106

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Any other questions
2 for Nicole.

3
4 MR. CLEVELAND: This is Vern Cleveland.

5
6 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
7 Vern.

8
9 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, I think what we
10 should -- or the question that is bothering me, the
11 hunter's report, do they actually report to the game
12 that they're catching caribou and if that's not
13 reported then you look at that cause of mortality, that
14 grey part is unknown and that could be the percentage,
15 some of it's pretty high, 37 percent. And how can we
16 get our folks, our hunters, our subsistence hunters to
17 report on what they catch, like caribou, moose,
18 whatever they hunt, you know, and report it. I know
19 the agencies started working on it about reporting --
20 if they're reporting to Fish and Game, if they're
21 afraid to report to the Fish and Game they can probably
22 go to the local IRAs and start doing that report to the
23 tribes and the tribes work with the agencies to get an
24 accurate count on what we're dealing with. Because
25 right now it's 188,000, it's drastically -- it's
26 alarming. It happened way back, way back early, maybe
27 30, 40 years ago and again -- now it's happening, it's
28 down to 188,000. You look at that population trend on
29 1991, boy, it's real healthy -- 1985 to 1993 actually,
30 '93 it went down, there was calf recruit -- cow
31 mortality. And look at it right now, look at it today,
32 it's all red. Where and how can we get this
33 information, or how can we get the mortalities to go
34 higher, or, you know, I mean to be green -- there is
35 something here we're missing, and is it subsistence
36 hunters or local hunters that are not reporting what
37 they catch and they should -- we should try and work
38 with the tribal government to see if you could get that
39 trend worked on so we could get a better and accurate
40 count of what -- where we're losing our animals that
41 way we'll know. We're pinpointing at, you know, them
42 hunters that come in, outside hunters that go up there
43 and hunt and there's like 200, 300 but I don't think it
44 would develop into like that, but the development part,
45 the resource development parts that are happening in
46 our area, look at it, it's just right there in front of
47 you guys, that population trend, that's when the Red
48 Dog Mine started, and looked it dropped up to today.

49
50

0107

1 And that development, it's hurting us.
2 You talked about atmosphere -- earlier someone talked
3 about atmosphere earlier, about going up in the air and
4 stuff like that and we know the climate is changing, we
5 know that, everybody knows that it's been over the few
6 years but if we get into a bind with low.....

7
8 MR. HOWARTH: Did we lose him.

9
10 MS. EDMISON: I think we lost him.

11
12 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
13 Yes, it sounds like Vern has gotten dropped. We can
14 give him some time to come back on and any other
15 Council members have a question in the meantime then we
16 can wait for Vern to come back on to respond.

17
18 Thank you.

19
20 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, this is
21 Michael.

22
23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Michael.

24
25 MR. KRAMER: Yes, Nicole, you know,
26 since our caribou herd has reached a critical state for
27 conservation, what is the plan for Park Service, Fish
28 and Wildlife, Fish and Game to be able to start doing
29 counts yearly because of the fact that our caribou herd
30 has dropped to a conservative level. Are they going to
31 continue to do it every two years? You never know,
32 next year it might drop to 70 or 80,000. So I think
33 that we need to put the number on the caribou herd's
34 population as priority one to where they get done every
35 year, or make an attempt to do them every year, you
36 know, we don't want to hear estimates. We want to hear
37 -- we want to see solid numbers, biological numbers of
38 what our caribou herd is doing and it's reached a
39 critical state that -- one day I ran into Thomas at AC
40 and, man, the shelves at Alaska Commercial Company here
41 in Kotzebue are bare, you know, and -- and everything
42 has gone up but, you know, we're still surviving but
43 having that critical subsistence resource is a
44 necessity to our people especially in the villages.
45 You know they get freight but a lot of times it's not
46 very much freight because of the fact that everything
47 was still held up down south off the coast of
48 California on ships. So I just wanted to know if it --
49 if you agencies see it as a critical situation to where
50

0108

1 we need to start doing a count every year.

2

3

Thank you.

4

5

MS. EDMISON: Yeah. Yeah, Michael.....

6

7

MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

8

9

MS. EDMISON: Sorry, what's that. I
10 was just going.....

11

12

MS. ATORUK: That was me, go ahead.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara.

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

Thank you.

0109

1 Back on mute.

2

3 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, it's Wilbur.

4

5 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, thank you,
6 Barbara.

7

8 MR. HOWARTH: It's Wilbur.

9

10 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead, Wilbur.

11

12 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, Vern is right about
13 getting entities involved. Yes, I've been getting, the
14 people that I know went out hunting and stuff and I got
15 a hold of practically all of them and get a count and
16 gave it to Fish and Game. So I did that last fall.
17 And I'm Chair for the IRA so I'll give you my word that
18 I could do it again, this coming up, next fall. And,
19 thank you, Barb.

20

21 Thank you.

22

23 MR. CLEVELAND: I lost -- I'm back,
24 this is Vern, thank you.

25

26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hi, Vern. Thank you,
27 Wilbur for your comment and thank you Barb. Vern,
28 would you like to finish what you were saying, what you
29 missed was we were saying -- people are agreeing with
30 you on getting other entities, like the IRAs involved
31 to help get local counts so that we can figure out
32 where these numbers are going and where they're coming
33 from. Was there anything else that you wanted to add
34 to that?

35

36 MR. CLEVELAND: Yeah, that's a trend,
37 you know, that's -- it'd be coming from the villages
38 and some of them can't afford to buy a hunting license
39 or stuff like that, you know, and -- and they're
40 hunters and I know they're not going to report so if we
41 could get this thing going to get with the tribal --
42 tribal member -- tribal council, maybe even the cities
43 to try and get an accurate count on what we're trying
44 to deal with because our tutu is going low. It's been
45 a thought with the Western Arctic Herd Working Group
46 but -- and to work with the tribal government to get
47 counts -- with counts -- because one time they came
48 here to do a count and everybody practically locked
49 them out, they wouldn't -- I wouldn't have even allowed
50

0110

1 them to come to my house because of, you know, I didn't
2 have a hunting license at the time, I was a young guy
3 and then, no, that's just a loss for them. And so, you
4 know, we got to get this trend going to get to our
5 people, to at least try to report what they catch and
6 that would be a big plus for us.

7

8 Thank you.

9

10 Have a good day.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, thank you, Vern.
13 Very good point you bring up and it's something that we
14 need to discuss more and follow up with and see how we
15 can get that trend going, as you put it. Any other
16 questions for Nicole.

17

18 (No comments)

19

20 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, thank
21 you, Nicole for your report, a lot of good information
22 and thank you for stepping in today while Alex is out
23 on leave. And with that we can move on. The next
24 thing I have in my packet is a train of emails from
25 Hannah Voorhees and she -- it might be Hannah Voorhees
26 that covers this, there's some names that we're
27 familiar with involved.

28

29 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair and Council,
30 this is Eva.

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Eva.

33

34 MS. PATTON: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair.
35 The Council had requested information from ADF&G, from
36 the law enforcement side and Hannah was doing --
37 conducting interviews with many people in response to
38 the Board's request for further information from all
39 stakeholders involved with this special action request.
40 And I believe we do have folks on from ADF&G that might
41 be available to answer questions from the Council
42 directly. I'll check in with Mark Burch online here
43 who that might be, if someone's available at this time
44 to respond to questions directly from the Council.

45

46 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

47

48 MR. BURCH: Hello, Eva, this is Mark.
49 I'm available. I don't know what questions I might be

50

0111

1 able to answer but I'm here. Thanks.

2

3 MS. PATTON: Thank you for that Mark.
4 And so Council, this was just for your reference and
5 information on the feedback was incorporated into the
6 analysis that Hannah Voorhees was working on but
7 appreciate Mark being online if there's any questions
8 the Council has specific to ADF&G on the law
9 enforcement side.

10

11 Thank you.

12

13 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. Does
14 anyone from the Council have any questions for Mark
15 regarding the Department of Fish and Game and law
16 enforcement coming out of Fish and Game.

17

18 MR. CLEVELAND: This is Vern.

19

20 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
21 Vern.

22

23 MR. CLEVELAND: Mark, law enforcement,
24 and what did you say again?

25

26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Fish and Game.

27

28 MR. CLEVELAND: The law enforcement
29 with Fish and Game, fly around with planes and stuff, I
30 think they should get better spotters if they're going
31 to be flying around that. If you're a hunter and they
32 fly right over you and they didn't see anything, so my
33 thing. But law enforcement, does it know between a
34 subsistence hunter and a non-qualified user, right,
35 hunters, enforcing law on hunters, right, the
36 situation, is that what we're talking about?

37

38 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Vern, this is
39 Thomas. Basically if you have any questions or anyone
40 from the Council has questions for Mark about what Fish
41 and Game can do to help with the enforcement during the
42 hunting season this is an opportunity to ask those
43 questions now.

44

45 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

46

47 MR. CLEVELAND: Well, the law, go by
48 the law, whatever the law is stated, they got to go
49 through the law, if it's written down, it's written

50

0112

1 down. That's all they got to go through but, you know,
2 if you don't got it, you don't got it, if you don't
3 have your hunting license then you don't got it. This
4 is 2022 guys, 20th Century. We got to get with our
5 folks up to grade and how we do it and how we hunt and
6 stuff like that, you got to be upgraded to whatever
7 we've been -- the past is the past, we go to go with
8 the flow.

9

10 Thank you.

11

12 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Vern.
13 Barbara, did you have something.

14

15 MS. ATORUK: Yeah, I have a question.
16 You know when you turn 60 or whatever they give you a
17 lifetime permit to hunt, the State does, and I have
18 one. And while my husband was still here we were going
19 boating and I said we need to get permit, I guess, if
20 we run into moose or anything and he said that's a
21 lifetime permit you already have, you don't need to go
22 get one so we left without one and we ran into a moose.
23 We didn't get it because we were both in two different
24 worlds. But do you need to get a permit even if you
25 have that hunting license for life?

26

27 Somebody answer me.

28

29 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair.

30

31 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Wilbur.

32

33 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, Barb, we got the
34 hunting license for life, but, yes, we do -- well, I
35 did anyway pick up the caribou permit and the moose
36 permit, so, yeah.

37

38 MS. ATORUK: Even if you have hunting
39 license, lifetime.

40

41 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, I understand.
42 Yeah, Barbara.....

43

44 MS. ATORUK: Oh, my goodness.

45

46 MR. HOWARTH:even -- so they have
47 them at the stores here so I just went over and grab
48 one.

49

50

0113

1 MS. ATORUK: Yeah.

2

3 MR. HOWARTH: Something for you to fill
4 out when you're done hunting. Thank you.

5

6 MS. ATORUK: Yeah, exactly what
7 I'm.....

8

9 MR. BURCH: Mr. Chair, this is Mark.

10

11 MS. ATORUK: What I'm trying to say is
12 if you have that lifetime license to hunt, why would
13 you have to go and fill out for a permit to get moose
14 or caribou, you're an elder. We need to bring that up
15 to Board and if we should have a face to face meeting
16 including the IRAs presidents, face to face, have a big
17 meeting together including the Advisory Committees,
18 let's put this on the floor. They know what's going
19 on. They understand their regions, they understand
20 their areas, their environment and how far out they can
21 go from their villages so we need to put this all up to
22 faith and including everybody, the agencies, too.
23 Because a lot of the regulations they have is what they
24 did, I think, without even talking to the tribes out
25 here, without talking to the people. So we need to
26 open up that door again and become a strong Council
27 because the Staff Committee or the Staff that you have
28 OSM are working for you, you're the boss, you make the
29 request and they should be able to do it but a lot of
30 them will try to back off from it and look for other
31 excuses so they won't have to do it but then you need
32 to stand strong and do that.

33

34 Thank you.

35

36 Back on mute.

37

38 MR. BURCH: Mr. Chair, this is Mark.

39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Mark.

41

42 MR. BURCH: Yeah, I understand the
43 difficulty and we're certainly in a transition
44 situation as far as the overall approach wildlife
45 management. But the thing is, I think there's a
46 developing understanding, and I'm hearing it today,
47 that if we're going to manage by the numbers we need to
48 have some idea of what harvest is, and having permits
49 with dedicated reports is one way that we can improve
50

0114

1 our harvest information over time. So that's something
2 we're working toward. We know that it's not a perfect
3 system at this point but we are interested in working
4 with everyone, and in this case a moose permit,
5 everybody that hunts moose and wants to take any bull
6 in Unit 23 would need to have the permit, and that
7 would include somebody in wherever, in Fairbanks or
8 Anchorage or Kotzebue. And as we do that, with that
9 dedicated permit, we'll get better harvest information
10 over time and be able to better manage the moose
11 population, or in the case of the caribou permit the
12 caribou population. And we know it's going to take
13 time, we understand that. But as we can improve the
14 reporting, then we can give you better numbers and we
15 can better understand where the population is so we
16 can, hopefully, identify the harvestable surplus or the
17 amount available to be harvested so that we can ensure
18 that they -- that that opportunity is there for people
19 to be able to harvest for subsistence purposes.

20

21 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22

23 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, Mr. Chair.....

24

25 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

26

27 MR. HOWARTH:this is Wilbur.

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: I heard Wilbur first
30 and then Barbara.

31

32 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, Mr. Chair, that's
33 what I wanted to say about the license that we get
34 after we turn 60, and then these permits are just to
35 help the Fish and Game with the numbers, or the count,
36 so I didn't ut that in trying to explain to Barb.

37

38 Thank you.

39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Wilbur.

41

42 MS. ATORUK: Okay.

43

44 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Barbara, did you have
45 something.....

46

47 MS. ATORUK: Thank you, Wilbur. Yeah,
48 thank you Mark. Thank you, Wilbur. I live on the
49 hillside where I'm on the traffic of hunters coming in,
50

0115

1 going up and down, back and forth and I see, they are
2 young hunters. I know they don't have any permits.
3 That's why a lot of them are not being reported is what
4 I'm -- is where I'm coming from. I understand what you
5 guys are doing, it's for the best, but what I'm saying
6 is we need to reach out to the communities, to the
7 villages, to the IRAs to get this information, how much
8 is being harvested without names. That will make them
9 understand that this will not get them into trouble
10 because they do give out what they hunt and a lot of it
11 comes to elders.

12

13 So that's where I'm coming from. I'm
14 not trying to put anybody down but we need to work with
15 the tribe to see if they can help us with counting the
16 harvest out in the villages that is coming in, that is
17 being harvested without being reported.

18

19 Okay, thank you.

20

21 Back on mute.

22

23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.

24

25 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, this is
26 Michael.

27

28 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead Mike.

29

30 MR. SHIEDT: Yeah, Attamuk, I'm back, I
31 was in the hospital.

32

33 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk, go
34 ahead, Mike.

35

36 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, you know one of the
37 key things here is that we're talking about people not
38 turning in their harvest tickets. I think it would be
39 very educational and very worthwhile to start involving
40 our youth in high school, you know. Even if they start
41 -- if somebody could hold a training here for so many
42 teenagers in each village and teach them how to go to
43 every household and try and get, you know, these census
44 data, at least these harvest tickets -- how many of
45 they have taken. Maybe -- I mean maybe two to three
46 weeks before the season closes when they're due. I
47 think we need to start involving our youth and I've
48 always been an advocate on involving our youth in our
49 subsistence resources. And I believe that they should
50

0116

1 receive a credit for helping and attending and being a
2 part of this census in our caribou -- in our
3 subsistence resources, it's necessary. You know I've
4 been there in the days when there was Pete and Victor
5 and Walter and, you know, all the other guys that I
6 started with. Now there's probably only me and Attamuk
7 left. I think that's very viable that we need to start
8 involving our youth and that would be a great way for
9 kids to start understanding our subsistence resources
10 because maybe 10, 15 years from now I probably won't be
11 able to do this anymore. You know it's critical time
12 right now for them to start learning and understanding
13 our subsistence resources and the biologies of what our
14 Federal agencies talk about in their studies. It's
15 very, very critical. If we start involving them now
16 because in the past -- and, you know, down the future,
17 you know, I'm not going to be there anymore, other
18 people aren't going to be there anymore. Because, you
19 know, back in the day I was taught to be pretty tough,
20 you know.

21
22 I think that should be looked at on
23 every agency should be able to go to the high school.
24 I know that Kotzebue High School has a subsistence
25 class and I think that it should always be in every
26 classroom in the villages and using them as a good
27 resource to earn a credit for helping, you know, our
28 subsistence resources and helping out the community and
29 helping out for census, it's critical we start
30 involving them now.

31
32 Thank you.

33
34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you for that
35 Mike. It's very good insight on how we should start
36 developing things in our own communities. Do we have
37 any other questions for Mark from Alaska Department of
38 Fish and Game.

39
40 MS. SMITH: Mr. Chair.

41
42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Is that Hazel.

43
44 MS. SMITH: Yes, it is, it's Hazel. I
45 want to go back to the email on the first page, the
46 email to Mark Burch from Derrick Degrath (ph) about how
47 they spent almost every good weathered day available
48 engaged in patrol activities. To me, that tells me
49 they're out there, you know, only when there's good
50

0117

1 weather, well us residents are out there 24/7, 365 days
2 out of the year and for them to tell us that they don't
3 observe any systematic user conflicts, it -- it don't
4 fly good with me because the local residents see it and
5 then for somebody to come along and say, yeah, we go
6 out there every good weather day and we know we haven't
7 had good weather. I just wanted to point that out.

8

9 Thank you.

10

11 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hazel. Any
12 other questions for Mark.

13

14 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair.

15

16 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, was that Eva.

17

18 MS. PATTON: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair,
19 this is Eva. And if there are no further questions, we
20 do have up next then the overview of the analysis for
21 the Wildlife Special Action 21-01 for the caribou
22 portion of it. So there will be quite a bit more
23 information that Hannah Voorhees and our wildlife
24 biologist may address for the Council at that time as
25 well. So if the Council is ready we can provide that
26 analysis overview for the Council.

27

28 CHAIRMAN BAKER: It's 3:10 now -- this
29 is Thomas, it's 3:10 now, how does the Council feel
30 about a 10 minute break before we continue on for the
31 rest of the afternoon.

32

33 MR. HOWARTH: Yes, I would like that 10
34 minute break.

35

36 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, do we have
37 a motion for a 10 minute break.

38

39 MR. HOWARTH: So moved.

40

41 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Moved by Wilbur, do we
42 have a second.

43

44 MR. KRAMER: Michael seconds.

45

46 MR. CLEVELAND: Vern seconds.

47

48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Seconded by Michael
49 and Vern, all those in favor please say aye.

50

0118

1 IN UNISON: Aye.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Opposed, same sign.

4

5 (No opposing votes)

6

7 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you
8 everyone. It's now 3:12, so at 3:25 we can come back
9 and move on to the overview of the caribou analysis.

10

11 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, it's
12 Michael. Just to remind you I'll be going off at 4:00
13 o'clock, that's when I'll have to return back to work.

14

15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay, duly noted,
16 thank you Michael. And it'll be the same tomorrow,
17 correct?

18

19 MR. KRAMER: Yes, from 1:30 to 4:00.

20

21 CHAIRMAN BAKER: You got it. Thank you
22 for reminding me, Mike.

23

24 MR. KRAMER: Uh-huh.

25

26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay.

27

28 (Off record)

29

30 (On record)

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So we're just missing
33 Elmer and Calvin and for the sake of time since Mike
34 will have to step out at 4:00 I'd like to suggest we
35 just get rolling so, Eva, whoever is up next, I believe
36 that'd be Hannah Voorhees with the caribou analysis, I
37 suggest we just start now.

38

39 MS. PATTON: Yes, correct, thank you,
40 Mr. Chair. And you will find the analysis in your
41 meeting book tab under Tab 4 and it starts with your
42 caribou analysis. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

43

44 MS. VOORHEES: Good afternoon, Mr.
45 Chair and members of the Council. This is Hannah
46 Voorhees, Anthropologist with the Office of Subsistence
47 Management. Wildlife Division Lead, Lisa Grediagin and
48 Wildlife Biologist Tom Plank are also on the call
49 today.

50

0119

1 I'm here to give you an update on
2 Deferred Wildlife Special Action Request WSA21-01 and
3 seek your formal recommendation based on revisions to
4 the analysis that were conducted at the request of the
5 Federal Subsistence Board. Due to the complexity of
6 the issue this is a long presentation and I thank you
7 in advance for your patience and attention. I know it
8 would be easier in person.

9

10 This Council submitted temporary
11 Wildlife Special Action, WSA21-01 in February last
12 year. You requested closure of Federal public lands in
13 Unit 23 and 26A to caribou and moose hunting by non-
14 Federally-qualified users from August 1st to September
15 30th. For clarity and simplicity, the analysis has now
16 been divided into WSA21-01(a) for caribou and (b) for
17 moose.

18

19 (Teleconference interference -
20 participants not muted)

21

22 MS. VOORHEES: You can find both
23 analysis in your meeting materials behind Tab 4 and the
24 intent is for your Council to consider both and as,
25 Eva, mentioned this is an action item.

26

27 So first I'll be presenting on WSA21-
28 01(a) for caribou. When this Council submitted this
29 request you expressed concern about the late migration
30 of caribou through Unit 23, the effect that
31 transporters and non-local hunters are having on the
32 timing of caribou migration is of particular concern.
33 This request was also supported by the North Slope
34 Council.

35

36 In June 2021 the Board deferred WSA21-
37 01 to the 2022/23 regulatory year and requested that
38 the Office of Subsistence Management get additional
39 input on concerns related to caribou from multiple
40 entities. If asked, I can give you an overview of all
41 outreach conducted since deferral, otherwise I will
42 just give the following highlights.

43

44 Feedback from local subsistence users
45 came from Regional Councils, testimony received during
46 public hearings, correspondence submitted during an
47 earlier written comment period, the Western Arctic Herd
48 Working Group, and Subsistence Resource Commissions in
49 Unit 23.

50

0120

1 The third round of tribal and ANCSA
2 Corporation consultations was held on January 27th this
3 year. Since this is not in the analysis, I'll just
4 mention that you can request a summary of the January
5 27th consultation after this presentation.

6
7 OSM Staff summarized feedback on the
8 closure request and concerns related to caribou from
9 all these groups and considered it an essential
10 component of the revised analysis. New data such as
11 the updated population estimate for the Western Arctic
12 Caribou Herd
13 are also included in a new analysis. The Board meeting
14 on deferred Wildlife Special Action WSA21-01(a) and (b)
15 is scheduled for March 30th at 1:00 p.m., via
16 teleconference. The meeting will be open for the
17 public to listen in and a news release will announce
18 the call-in information.

19
20 At this time I'll be presenting the
21 analysis to you and then seek this Council's final
22 recommendation. But I'll pause and see if there are
23 any questions first.

24
25 (No comments)

26
27 MS. VOORHEES: If not, you can always
28 ask them later on as well.

29
30 So in terms of the regulatory context
31 for this request there is already a targeted closure to
32 caribou hunting by non-Federally-qualified users on
33 Federal public lands along the Noatak River corridor
34 and the Aggie, Eli and Squirrel River drainages. It's
35 worth noting that there are some zones where
36 restrictions on air traffic related to hunting caribou
37 and moose are already in place in Unit 23 and 26A.
38 There's a map of these restricted areas on Page 18 of
39 WSA21-01(a). Only local resident zone communities are
40 permitted to harvest caribou on National Parks and
41 Monuments in Unit 23 so a closure would not affect
42 these areas. Along with all residents, non-residents
43 of Alaska may currently hunt caribou in both Unit 23
44 and 26A under State regulations.

45
46 The biological background section
47 begins on Page 20 of the analysis. Nicole and Kyle went
48 over this information pretty thoroughly. I'll just
49 reiterate that the new -- the most recent photo census
50

0121

1 came out following the Board's deferral of WSA21-01
2 and, again, that number is 188,000 -- 188,000 caribou.

3
4 The timing of fall migration has become
5 more variable in recent years. Since 2007 there has
6 been a substantial delay before caribou crossed the
7 Kobuk and Selawik Rivers, but crossing the Noatak
8 River has remained average. A percentage of caribou
9 crossing all three rivers has also declined in recent years.

10
11 The proportion of caribou using certain
12 migration paths also varies year to year.
13 Additionally, caribou demonstrate low fidelity to
14 wintering grounds which have shifted over the past
15 decade from the Seward Peninsula to the Brooks Range.
16 Changes in wintering locations, herd size, vegetation,
17 and weather likely influenced these recent changes in
18 fall migration.

19
20 The harvest history section of analysis
21 begins on Page 37. In some discussion earlier the
22 Chair asked about reported harvest and the breakdown
23 between that reported by Federally-qualified
24 subsistence users and non-Federally-qualified users.
25 And I did want to direct you to Figure 8 on Page 39 for
26 that breakdown. So given the current population
27 estimate of 188,000 the harvestable surplus is
28 currently 11,280 caribou. While there's much
29 uncertainty in harvest estimate for this herd as we've
30 discussed, total harvest has generally been estimated
31 at 12,000 caribou per year. Historically, local
32 hunters account for approximately 95 percent of the
33 total Western Arctic Caribou Herd harvest. Local
34 community harvest parallels caribou availability rather
35 than population trends. Between 1998 and 2020,
36 reported harvest by non-Federally-qualified users
37 ranged from 131 to 657 caribou each year and 85 to 95
38 percent of non-local harvest occurs between August 25th
39 and October 7th.

40
41 I had intended to go over the
42 transporter and guide information a little bit but
43 Hannah Atkinson did an amazing job covering that. I'll
44 just note that you can find details for guide and
45 transporter activity on some of the other agency land
46 such as BLM and Fish and Wildlife Service on Page 39 of
47 the analysis. And I know this is information that the
48 Council has requested in the past so it was great that
49 we were able to hear that information from National
50

0122

1 Park Service pertaining to Noatak National Preserve in
2 particular. I thought a salient point with that
3 information was that most transported hunters are non-
4 residents of Alaska.

5
6 The results of OSM's outreach since
7 deferral begins on Page 55 of the analysis. OSM
8 documented input on caribou availability in Unit 23
9 communities in 2021 and many of the Council members
10 reiterated that information in your member reports, so,
11 thank you, we do depend on that information to a great
12 extent. In the region, overall, in 2021, we heard that
13 caribou arrived very late, if at all. Noatak and Point
14 Hope were successful in getting some caribou. In
15 Kotzebue and Noorvik, few to no caribou were available
16 locally. People from Kotzebue and Noorvik went on long
17 trips to Onion Portage and the Squirrel River area to
18 harvest but were not even very successful there. The
19 community of Kiana was able to hunt caribou in 2021 but
20 only very late. Caribou started to cross the Kobuk
21 River near Kiana and then freeze-up set in the next
22 day. Shungnak did not get caribou until very late,
23 around November 3rd. Caribou are not showing up in
24 August as is normal in Ambler. In Buckland and Deering,
25 caribou had not yet arrived by the time of the last
26 public hearing, November 17th.

27
28 Almost all of the residents who weighed
29 in on the requested closure since deferral were in
30 support. They testified that non-locals do not follow
31 the traditional practice of letting the leader caribou
32 pass, which can result in herd diversion and a small
33 number of hunters having a disproportionate impact on
34 subsistence for entire communities. Local residents
35 expressed frustration about having to fight for basic
36 access to their traditional foods. The local
37 subsistence users also emphasized the extremely high
38 cost of fuel and food in rural Alaska communities and
39 the parallel crises of the Covid-19 pandemic and a
40 resulting increase in food insecurity. There is
41 agreement between traditional ecological knowledge and
42 the scientific literature that changes in temperature,
43 wind direction, snow.....

44
45 (Teleconference interference -
46 participants not muted)

47
48 MS. VOORHEES:and vegetation
49 affects caribou migration. In addition, the Red Dog
50

0123

1 Mine appears to delay or deflect migration for at least
2 a portion of the herd and there's also agreement that
3 predation is playing a role. We also heard that there
4 has been a shift away from harvesting bulls because of
5 the timing of the caribou migration.

6
7 So whether caused by one, or a
8 combination of these factors testimony showed that the
9 reduced availability of caribou in Unit 23 is
10 significantly negatively impacted Federally-qualified
11 subsistence users, nutritional, economic, cultural,
12 social and spiritual well-being.

13
14 I would note, as it has been mentioned
15 earlier, that the Western Arctic Herd Working Group
16 members also gave input on this request and at their
17 December meeting the group voted to oppose WSA21-01.
18 In part there was concern about the moose and caribou
19 request being considered in one analysis but they have
20 been separated.

21
22 Now, I'll move on to OSM's preliminary
23 conclusion.

24
25 Following deferral and the revised
26 analysis, the OSM preliminary conclusion on WSA21-01(a)
27 is neutral. The analysis outlines two main actions for
28 consideration.

29
30 No. 1. Approve WSA21-01(a) with
31 modification to close caribou hunting to non-Federally-
32 qualified users in Noatak National Preserve and BLM
33 managed lands between the Noatak and Kobuk Rivers only
34 August 1st to September 30th 2022, or

35
36 No. 2. Reject WSA21-01(a) resulting in
37 maintenance of the status quo.

38
39 So first I'll give you OSM's points to
40 consider under the approve with modification option.

41
42 Testimony about lack of local caribou
43 availability in the Northwest Arctic converges with
44 recent evidence of Western Arctic Herd population
45 decline. The most recent population estimate indicates
46 that the herd has declined 24 percent from 2019 to
47 2021. This population decline may, indeed, be
48 contributing to lack of caribou availability in Unit
49 23. The herd is now being managed at the conservative
50

0124

1 declining level. Since December 2021 it's been
2 downgraded -- or it's been managed at a more
3 conservative level. It was previously at the
4 conservative declining management level and now it's at
5 the preservative declining level. And under the
6 Western Arctic Caribou Herd Working Group Management
7 Plan, recommendations at this level include closure of
8 the non-resident season under State regulations as well
9 as possible closure of some Federal public lands to
10 non-Federally-qualified users. Furthermore, the best
11 available data suggests that the harvestable surplus
12 may be being exceeded although there is uncertainty
13 there. Although the population decline affects the
14 herd throughout its range, closing Noatak National
15 Preserve and BLM managed lands between the Noatak and
16 Kobuk River would have the most direct benefit for
17 these communities in Unit 23 who have been unable to
18 continue their subsistence hunting for caribou as well
19 as for the herd itself.

20
21 The delay in caribou migration has
22 primarily occurred between the Noatak and Kobuk Rivers
23 based on local testimony and GPS collared data.
24 Closing lands north of the Noatak River within Noatak
25 National Preserve may also be necessary for the
26 conservation of healthy caribou populations as this is
27 where much of the non-local harvest is concentrated.

28
29 OSM does not support a full closure of
30 Federal public lands in Units 23 and 26A at this time.
31 Non-Federally-qualified users rarely harvest caribou in
32 the portions of Bering Land Bridge National Preserve
33 and Gates of the Arctic National Preserve within Unit
34 23, on the other scattered BLM lands in the unit or in
35 Selawik National Wildlife Refuge. Additionally, closing
36 hunting to non-Federally-qualified users on Federal
37 public land in Unit 26A is not warranted. Testimony
38 gathered through the analysis process shows that
39 Federally-qualified subsistence users in Unit 26A are
40 meeting their subsistence needs for caribou and are not
41 facing the same challenges as those in Unit 23.

42
43 Next, I'll give you OSM's points to
44 consider under the reject option.

45
46 Currently it cannot be demonstrated
47 that the requested closure alone would result in the
48 desired effect of restoring the historical timing and
49 extent of the Western Arctic Caribou Herd migration as
50

0125

1 other factors are likely at plan as well as we've
2 discussed today. If Units 23 and 26A are closed to the
3 harvest of caribou by non-Federally-qualified
4 subsistence users for August and September 2022, user
5 conflicts and disruption of caribou movement may
6 actually increase on State lands, particularly on those
7 State lands surrounding Upper Kobuk River villages.
8 Additionally, non-Federally-qualified users would still
9 be available to access and harvest caribou on gravel
10 bars below the mean high water mark and in navigable
11 waters within Federal public lands as these are under
12 State jurisdiction.

13

14 So while the Western Arctic Herd
15 Working Group's Management Plan recommends possible
16 closure of Federal public lands to non-Federally-
17 qualified users under the current preservative
18 declining management level, the working group did not
19 think immediate regulatory action was necessary, in
20 part, due to sufficient calf recruitment. I'll also
21 mention that their concern was largely placed on cow
22 harvest.

23

24 Additionally, non-Federally-qualified
25 user harvest accounts for only five percent of the
26 total estimated Western Arctic Caribou Herd harvest and
27 they could still harvest on State managed lands if
28 Federal lands were closed.

29

30 So as noted earlier, for clarity and
31 simplicity the analysis has now been divided into
32 WSA21-01(a) for caribou and (b) for moose. And I'll
33 now turn consideration of WSA21-(a) for caribou back
34 over to the Council. And please let us know if you
35 would like a summary of the January 27th tribal
36 consultation. Following your recommendation on
37 caribou, Lisa Grediagin will present the analysis for
38 moose. And we're available to answer any questions.

39

40 Taikuu.

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hannah.
43 Does anyone have any questions at this time on the
44 overview of the caribou analysis.

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Any questions at this
49 time for our caribou wildlife special action request.

50

0126

1 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Barbara.

4

5 MS. ATORUK: Well, you know, of all the
6 caribou reports that we've heard and the comments from
7 the Council, I'm hearing an echo of myself, but anyway
8 we -- something needs to happen with this, this special
9 action and it seems like, the way it sounds, the report
10 given to us right now, it's kind of against what we
11 want, if that's how I'm hearing it right. But
12 something needs to happen. Our count is down to
13 188,000, and there's got to be some other avenue for
14 this, what -- I think I missed the part where what
15 North Slope said about this, or they're leaving it up
16 or supporting us, so don't know, and Seward Penn, I
17 think should be involved too, because the caribou go
18 through and they head down in their area. From this
19 past experience this fall those hunters were all over
20 the place with Noatak, up Noatak, on the State side and
21 there's really nothing we can do with the State unless
22 some kind of miracle happens. And from what they're
23 saying is they're trying to work with us too and help
24 us. We need a face to face meeting some how, some time
25 and that's what my feelings are right now.

26

27 I don't know how other Council members
28 feel about it.

29

30 Thank you.

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.
33 Do we have any other questions of the caribou analysis
34 at this time.

35

36 MR. KRAMER: Yes, Mr. Chairman, this is
37 Michael.

38

39 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
40 Mike.

41

42 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, you know, the
43 Federal agencies always consider that, you know, it's
44 not critical. That's what they said about the sheep a
45 few years ago and now the sheep are so far low that we
46 doubt if they'll ever come up. I've learned from
47 Federal agency's mistakes that, you know, we need to do
48 something now because the last time we reacted later
49 was an emergency closure, you know, and it's going to
50

0127

1 be depending on this spring, summer's photo census on
2 the caribou to figure out what's going on again for
3 another year and we won't be able to see next year --
4 this summer's results until this time next year. What
5 if it drops another 50, 60,000, then what. What if it
6 drops 75,000, then what. It's going to be a reaction
7 after the fact. We have to take action now because
8 this is a very, very important subsistence resource to
9 our people. Our shelves at our grocery stores are
10 empty. You know, thank you to Kotzebue IRA for
11 providing food boxes for people here in Kotzebue and
12 hopefully other IRAs have followed also along with
13 that. You know, they stood people their people and
14 supported us through this hard time, this Covid
15 pandemic.

16
17 It's very critical that we take action
18 now, and not later.

19
20 I've already seen the reports from the
21 Federal -- or the Fish and Wildlife saying that it
22 wasn't critical either. It is critical. I don't want
23 to learn from other agency's mistakes anymore. It's
24 not worth the risk because now we can't harvest sheep
25 anymore. It's very critical. They need -- we're an
26 advisory Council, that's what we do, we advise, it's
27 what we see out there in the country that's making us
28 want to make this decision now and without, you know,
29 these agencies not listening to us what's our advice to
30 them, literally nothing. It's just a voice that's
31 heard. They're not listening to our advice, you know,
32 we're just people that go out there, and we're the
33 people that see it on a daily basis when we're out
34 there subsistence hunting for our families to put foods
35 in the freezers.

36
37 I don't think we should react later,
38 it's either now, you know, or we're going to lose a
39 very critical subsistence resource for the people of
40 Northwest Alaska, Nome, and other places. Yeah, I
41 don't want to see this mistake ever happen again.
42 Ever. Because it's critical.

43
44 Thank you.

45
46 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Mike. This
47 is Thomas. I wholeheartedly agree. And just going
48 over the overview that Hannah Voorhees provided along
49 with the way that we, across the board, as Council
50

0128

1 members and as people that live and subsist in this
2 region, we're all on the same page that something needs
3 to happen and just based upon, you know, what we've
4 heard today one of the issues that the Subsistence
5 Program, Subsistence Board, whoever it may be, is
6 having is we have been proposing a blanket closure on
7 all Federal lands in two very large game units. I keep
8 looking at my map in the harvest wildlife management
9 regulations that we were sent in our mailed packets,
10 the largest area that we seem to be having hunters
11 dropped off and based upon Hannah Atkinson's
12 presentation is in the Noatak National Preserve and
13 then in the map you can see the Noatak Controlled Use
14 Area along the Noatak River itself. But one of the
15 main problems is we have outside hunters being dropped
16 off in the Preserve and further north of it preventing
17 the animals, some people's beliefs, and my own
18 included, from coming down to the villages that are
19 south of the Noatak National Preserve.

20

21 What does the Council think of amending
22 Wildlife Special Action 21-01(a) for the caribou to
23 rather than just being everything under the sun of
24 Federal lands to closing Noatak National Preserve for
25 -- to see if we can do something to increase the number
26 of animals that are being harvested locally in order to
27 preserve the herd moving forward.

28

29 That was a bit long-winded, I don't
30 know if anyone followed that.

31

32 MS. SMITH: Mr. Chair, this is Hazel.

33

34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Hazel.

35

36 MS. SMITH: While we're thinking about
37 amendments, I will stand by what I see in the documents
38 in front of me, from law enforcement, that they go out
39 on good flying days, we haven't had that many good days
40 lately and they're observing no user conflicts, in
41 their eyes there's no user conflicts and they don't
42 bother to talk to the local people, we live out there
43 365 days out of the year and we see it, so it's --
44 these agencies are listening to law enforcement and law
45 enforcement is not out there 365 days out of the year.
46 They need to be out there as long as we are and they
47 will see what we see. And I'll still stand by that.

48

49 Thank you.

50

0129

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Hazel.

2

3 MR. SHIEDT: Attamuk here.

4

5 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Any other questions --
6 yes, Attamuk.

7

8 MR. SHIEDT: Yes, I know it's a hard
9 one but it's got to be done. How many times we
10 complain for a couple years that the caribou are going
11 down and the State will say they can't get a count and,
12 yet, we feel it because us Natives are the eyes of the
13 North, we feel what's out in our resources and we need
14 to close it in the Federal lands and we need to do it
15 now, not later. And I will say, Vern, as much as I
16 hate to say it, I'm not picking on you and Cyrus, but
17 you got to give your darndest with the State to the
18 Western Arctic Caribou Herd to close or take a
19 reduction in how many hunters could go out there. They
20 have numbers. The State and the Park Service, Selawik
21 Wildlife Refuge, how many hunters are going out there
22 to our lands to harvest. I think we need to reduce
23 them. And for the transporters and outfitters to
24 survive, we need to give them so many percent of each
25 for them, as much as I hate to say it, but we need to
26 ask them to stop, we got no choice because we are the
27 people of the caribou, we live on it, it's our souls
28 and it's our vitamin, it's our food. And yet when the
29 stores are short, and who could pay \$50 to \$35 for meat
30 at AC. Caribou, sure we all spend a lot of money when
31 we first go hunt but there'll be enough for most of the
32 year and we need to close it, we got no choice and we
33 need to involve the North Slope and the Nome area
34 because it's the migration of our caribou. We can't
35 close it in Unit 23 and keep it open in North Slope and
36 Bering Land Bridge area, what's good in one and open
37 the other because legally if -- if -- if Unit 23 is
38 closed I could go to North Slope and go hunt caribou
39 and get all I want, that's what I'm saying, it needs to
40 be all equal, we need to talk to Barrow and have face
41 to face meeting with them. I know it's Covid times but
42 there's time we have to make exception and sacrifice
43 and this is one.

44

45 I'll tell you right now, I never get
46 caribou, I just got lucky like some people, they give
47 me a couple and I'm -- I'm eating less but I'll tell
48 you one thing, somehow I'm expanding because I'm not
49 living off the caribou.

50

0130

1 And we need to do it. I mean we need
2 to have Barrow and Nome on this table and we need to
3 put real hard point to our representatives to close in
4 the State lands otherwise if they keep reducing instead
5 of come back in two years it might take eight years to
6 come back, we don't know. These are the things.

7
8 We sacrifice on sheep not taking them.
9 Example. We're going to sacrifice on caribou but the
10 State is not. Is the State living off the caribou, no,
11 they just want the money from the permits, \$26 million
12 a year. And we need to do it for our people. We're
13 here to try to help our people on the caribou,
14 everybody. But we need it and I'll say, Vern and
15 Cyrus, work your best, I know it's hard for -- to take
16 a reduction in the State, we did that before but that
17 was with Maniilaq, you -- sure it don't look good but I
18 wasn't there to look good, I was there for the people
19 so you guys got to do it whether you like it or not. I
20 mean this caribou thing is a touchy one and we can't
21 live without it, it's our diet.

22
23 What else is there to say, we could do
24 our best. Thank you.

25
26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk.
27 Any other questions or comments from the Council.

28
29 MR. SCHAEFFER: Mr. Chairman.

30
31 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, is that Bob.

32
33 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yes, this is Bob. I
34 have something to say. I think, you know, this -- this
35 hearings -- or this meeting started about, you know,
36 closing out that -- you know the area up in the Noatak,
37 you know, to sport hunters and I understood what they
38 were doing because I, too, have been out, living out in
39 the country and seeing the changes, you know, in not
40 only the caribou migrations but the changes in the
41 environment, a lot of different things that I've seen
42 that aren't there -- that weren't there -- at least in
43 my lifetime and I've been around for 73 years so there
44 have been massive, massive changes and I've noticed a
45 lot of them dealing with the animals in the area.

46
47 But what I wanted to say was that, you
48 know, I was pretty excited about the unanimous feeling
49 of everybody within the region to try to do something
50

0131

1 to preserve our herd, and we knew the numbers were
2 going down, we knew just based on what we see out there
3 that, you know, that it was getting harder and harder
4 to hunt the way we did before when the bulls came
5 first, and we were able to harvest bulls and it really
6 never affected, you know, the population. But, of
7 course, the last 20 years that's pretty much gone
8 simply because climate change is affecting us more in
9 this area than any place else in the state so -- but
10 what happened last year, it kind of surprised me when
11 the Subsistence Board voted not to act and in a
12 situation that I felt was critical. And for the first
13 time I saw the idea of user conflicts come out, you
14 know, and we saw the transporters getting online and
15 making sure that they contacted every hunter that they --
16 that they've taken out for the last 10 years and the
17 next thing you know we had 1,600 letters of opposition
18 to our recommendation to close portions of Federal
19 lands up in the Noatak, you know, for sport hunting.
20 But this is, you know, the sportsmen have billions of
21 dollars, you know, to fight something like this when a
22 group is really concerned about the welfare of a
23 resource, they'll throw a lot of money at it to make
24 sure that -- that this doesn't happen. And that's what
25 I saw happen, the Subsistence Board didn't act on it
26 and I just felt that that was just absolutely not for
27 us and it wasn't good for the resource.

28
29 The proof is in the pudding. The
30 counts are way down. And everybody's going to have to
31 sacrifice a little to make sure that they don't
32 continue to drop and the State has to vote up on this
33 thing too and, you know, restrict State lands to, you
34 know, to outside hunters and I know we're going to have
35 to take a beating ourselves but yet on the other hand
36 there's no other way to try to save this herd. We have
37 to make sure this year that the sacrifices will
38 increase the, you know, increase the herd's population
39 and we have no choice.

40
41 I believe that two of the Councilmen
42 here just talked about closing all Federal lands and
43 trying to get the State, you know, they have to do
44 something with those hunting areas on the State lands
45 as well. But I just felt that, you know, they're
46 boning up to big money lobbying and that's not good,
47 it's -- this is too critical of a situation now.

48
49 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
50

0132

1 MR. JOLY: Mr. Chairman, this is.....

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Was someone asking to
4 speak.

5

6 MR. JOLY: Sorry, Mr. Chairman, I
7 didn't mean to cut the Council person off, are they
8 done?

9

10 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Were you finished Bob?

11

12 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yeah, I'm pretty much
13 done, yeah, thanks.

14

15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Okay, thank you.
16 Who's wanting to speak now?

17

18 MR. JOLY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
19 this is Kyle Joly. I just wanted to thank all the
20 Council members for this really thoughtful discussion.
21 I really appreciate it. I think the urgency that's
22 been expressed is really important and I agree with it.
23 The thing that's come across my mind is that there's
24 two situations here.

25

26 One, is that, you have the changes in
27 migration which is impacting availability of caribou.

28

29 The other one is you have the decline
30 in population numbers. And they may be an intertwined
31 issue but they are two different issues.

32

33 And on the population side, I think one
34 of the most important things to consider is cow
35 harvest. So as you further deliberate, I think it
36 would be helpful to have kind of a holistic view of
37 what's going on and to try and find some solutions like
38 the previous Council member just said that, you know,
39 everyone pitches in a little to help conserve the herd
40 and, you know, that could include some closures and
41 that could include some changes to try and preserve
42 those cows.

43

44 So I just wanted to chip that in.

45

46 Thank you.

47

48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Kyle. Any
49 other questions or comments on the caribou analysis.

50

0133

1 MR. SCHAEFFER: Mr. Chairman, this is
2 Bob. Just -- just one more -- I totally agree and, you
3 know, I've always said the cow is the key, you know, to
4 keeping the herd to either a sustained herd and, you
5 know, I think we're going to have to make some really
6 hard decisions on our part, you know, when it comes to
7 cow, the take of cows. Because if we start taking
8 cows, there goes our herd, there's no way the
9 population will increase if we continue to take cows.
10 I mean that is one of the sacrifices that I was talking
11 about and, yet, on the other hand, you know, we don't
12 have access to the bulls when they do come through late
13 -- late again, you know, they're going to be inedible
14 for awhile until later and then, of course, they'll be
15 down in their wintering ranges when they get to it and
16 so it's one of the things that we have to adjust to, I
17 think, if we're going to make some real -- if we're
18 going to, you know, make some real tough decisions on
19 our part. And I think that's what it's going to take
20 to, you know, try to save this herd.

21
22 Anyway, I just thought I'd throw that
23 in, thanks.

24
25 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Bob. Any
26 other questions or comments.

27
28 MR. HOWARTH: Mr. Chair, it's Wilbur.

29
30 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Wilbur.

31
32 MR. HOWARTH: Yeah, I agree with what
33 Kyle just said and Attamuk, you guys really hit it
34 right on the nail, we -- we need to do something.
35 Because, yeah, comes winter or about this time of the
36 year there's a lot of hunting on the cows. We need to
37 stand up and say we can't be doing that, our herd is
38 low. But our communities need education on where we
39 stand right now on the count of the caribou.

40
41 Thank you.

42
43 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Wilbur.
44 Any other questions or comments.

45
46 (No comments)

47
48 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So at this time, just
49 so that we're clear, maybe Hannah or Eva, at this point
50

0134

1 do we need to determine what we would like to do, make
2 the final say for WSA21-01 part (a) or will that be
3 once we complete the analysis for the moose portion.
4

5 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair, this
6 is Eva. And, yes, the plan was to have the Council
7 make your final recommendation on this proposal at this
8 time, and take them one at a time since the moose
9 information is separate from the caribou information.
10 And this would be the Council's final opportunity to
11 make this recommendation to the Federal Subsistence
12 Board. And, again, as we discussed during our pre-
13 meeting, the Board will be making their final decision
14 at a public meeting held by teleconference on March
15 30th. So this is the opportunity for the Council to
16 make a final recommendation on this proposal.
17

18 Thank you.
19

20 MS. GREDIAGIN: Mr. Chair.
21

22 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. Yes.
23

24 MS. GREDIAGIN: This is Lisa Grediagin
25 with OSM. And I also just wanted to clarify for the
26 Council that the Seward Peninsula, Western Interior and
27 North Slope Councils will also be considering this
28 special action and making a final recommendation to the
29 Board but the Northwest Council just happened to be the
30 first Council to act on this request, you know, to meet
31 on it. So we don't know what the other Councils will
32 do because their meetings come after your meeting.
33

34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Right, thank you for
35 that clarification, Lisa.
36

37 So at this time what is the wish of the
38 Council regarding WSA21-01(a) with the caribou side of
39 things.
40

41 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.
42

43 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, Barbara.
44

45 MS. ATORUK: I make a motion to move to
46 support Special Action at this time.
47

48 MR. SHIEDT: Attamuk, I will second it.
49
50

0135

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: A motion by Barbara
2 and seconded by Attamuk to support, again, our WSA21-
3 01(a) with no amendments. Any further discussion or
4 are we ready for the vote.

5

6 MR. SCHAEFFER: I'll call for the
7 question.

8

9 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Bob calls for
10 question. So all those in favor of supporting WSA21-
11 01(a) say.....

12

13 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair. Mr. Chair.

14

15 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes.

16

17 MS. ATORUK: Let's do a roll call vote.

18

19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Good call, thank you,
20 Barbara. Hazel, are you on the line.

21

22 MS. SMITH: Yes, I am.

23

24 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, Hazel, as
25 our new Secretary, would you mind.....

26

27 MS. ATORUK: I'm.....

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER:going down the
30 list.....

31

32 MS. ATORUK:the Secretary.

33

34 CHAIRMAN BAKER:of names and
35 doing a roll call vote.

36

37 MS. ATORUK: I'm the Secretary.

38

39 CHAIRMAN BAKER: I'm sorry, but from
40 this morning I believe it was Hazel that was nominated
41 and.....

42

43 MS. ATORUK: Oh, that's right, you got
44 a new Secretary.

45

46 CHAIRMAN BAKER:voted for
47 Secretary.

48

49 MS. ATORUK: Who is the Secretary.

50

0136

1 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hazel Smith Harris.
2
3 MS. ATORUK: Okay, Hazel.
4
5 MS. SMITH: Okay, I'm ready.
6
7 Enoch Shiedt, Sr., how do you vote.
8
9 MR. SHIEDT: Yes.
10
11 MS. SMITH: Thomas Christopher Baker.
12
13 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thomas votes yes to
14 support.
15
16 MS. SMITH: Hazel Smith Harris votes
17 yes.
18
19 Michael Chad Kramer.
20
21 MR. KRAMER: Yes.
22
23 MS. SMITH: Calvin Donald Moto, II.
24
25 (No comments)
26
27 MS. SMITH: No reply. Wilbur Howarth,
28 Sr.
29
30 (No comments)
31
32 MS. SMITH: Wilbur.
33
34 (No comments)
35
36 MS. SMITH: Robert Joseph Schaeffer.
37
38 MR. HOWARTH: Sorry, this is Wilbur, I
39 vote yes in support.
40
41 MS. SMITH: Okay. Back to Robert
42 Joseph Schaeffer.
43
44 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yes.
45
46 MS. SMITH: Elmer Armstrong, Jr.
47
48 MR. ARMSTRONG: This is Elmer, I vote
49 yes.
50

0137

1 MS. SMITH: Vern Cleveland, Sr.

2

3 MR. CLEVELAND: Yes.

4

5 MS. SMITH: Barbara M. Atoruk.

6

7 MS. ATORUK: Yes, I'm in support.

8

9 MS. SMITH: Okay. We have nine voting
10 all voting yes. The only one that didn't reply was
11 Calvin Moto.

12

13 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
14 Hazel. So with that the Northwest Arctic Regional
15 Advisory Council approves supporting, once, again, our
16 deferred Wildlife Special Action WSA21-01(a) and if
17 there's no final comments or questions we can move down
18 to the moose analysis for WSA21-01(b) with Lisa.

19

20 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair, this is Eva.

21

22 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead, Eva.

23

24 MS. PATTON: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair.
25 If you can, please, to provide a brief summary of the
26 Council's justification. We have -- we have detailed
27 notes of all the Council's discussion leading up to
28 this vote, which supports your action, but if you could
29 just in quick summary, the Council's justification for
30 your vote.

31

32 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

33

34 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. So I
35 would say that our justification in supporting this
36 wildlife special action would be based upon information
37 that we've been presented throughout the day including
38 the herd population numbers, and how the herd, the
39 Western Arctic Caribou Herd seems to be declining much
40 faster than it has in the past, with the current number
41 being around 188,000 animals, the Northwest Arctic RAC
42 chooses to support this special action in an attempt to
43 do what we can in order to protect the herd in this
44 coming hunting season due to their being little other
45 ways for us to make a meaningful impact upon herd
46 harvest numbers.

47

48 Does anyone have anything they'd like
49 to add to that summary.

50

0138

1 MS. ATORUK: Well said, thank you.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.
4 Anyone else like to add to the summary.

5

6 MR. SHIEDT: Thanks, Thomas. Attamuk.

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Attamuk. I
9 would say, just looking at my own notes, is protecting
10 the continuation of subsistence in our region in making
11 sure that not only we're preserving the herd but we're
12 preserving our ability to subsist off these animals and
13 opportunities to subsist is why we're supporting this
14 special action.

15

16 MS. PATTON: Okay, thank you, Mr.
17 Chair.

18

19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, if there is
20 nothing else for 21-01(a) we'll move on to Wildlife
21 Special Action WSA21-01(b) the moose analysis with Lisa
22 Grediagin.

23

24 MS. GREDIAGIN: Yeah, thank you, Mr.
25 Chair, this is Lisa Grediagin. And I wasn't sure if
26 the ADF&G had a moose report they wanted to provide to
27 the Council before I start into the analysis.

28

29 REPORTER: And before we go there, this
30 is Tina, the reporter, if I could have everybody check
31 their lines, see if they're on mute, we're starting to
32 pick up a very consistent echo and that generally means
33 that there's many lines unmuted. So if we could all
34 just check that first.

35

36 Go ahead, Lisa.

37

38 MS. GREDIAGIN: Okay, yeah, earlier in
39 the meeting I thought ADF&G said Christie Osburn was
40 presenting an overview of the moose but, if not, I can
41 go ahead with the analysis.

42

43 MS. OSBURN: Hi Lisa and members of the
44 Chair [sic], this is Christie Osburn from Fish and
45 Game. I don't have any additional updated information
46 on moose, with the exception of some fall composition
47 data from this last November. All the other
48 information I have would have been the same as
49 presented at the October meeting. And so I'm happy to
50

0139

1 go over our fall comp data but otherwise nothing has
2 changed.

3

4 MS. GREDIAGIN: Okay, this is Lisa,
5 and, Mr. Chair, unless I hear differently from you I'll
6 just proceed with the analysis then.

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, please, go ahead,
9 Lisa, the floor is yours.

10

11 MS. GREDIAGIN: Okay, thank you.
12 Again, for the record my name is Lisa Grediagin and I'm
13 the Wildlife Division Lead with the Office of
14 Subsistence Management. I'll be presenting WSA21-01(b)
15 for moose for your recommendation and this portion of
16 the analysis can be found under Tab 4 of your meeting
17 materials binder so right after 21-01(a) caribou.

18

19 This was part of your original request
20 that Federal public lands in Unit 23 and 26A be closed
21 to hunting for moose and caribou by non-Federally-
22 qualified users from August 1st to September 30th due
23 to declining moose populations. In June 2021 the Board
24 deferred WSA21-01 to the 2022/23 regulatory year. At
25 that time the Board asked OSM to include comparisons of
26 moose harvest by survey area within Unit 23 in their
27 analysis. If approved, this special action would now
28 apply to the 2022 hunting season.

29

30 Changes implemented in both State and
31 Federal subsistence regulations since 2017 have placed
32 restrictions on moose hunting in Unit 23. Under
33 Federal regulations, the bull and cow seasons were
34 shortened in 2018 and the cow season was closed in
35 2019. In 2020, the harvest limit changed to one
36 antlered bull. Under State regulations the harvest
37 limit changed to one antlered bull in 2017 and the non-
38 resident moose season was closed in 2018.
39 Additionally, the State's RM880 permit is only locally
40 available in July requiring an extra trip for non-local
41 hunters, which limits their participation. In Unit 26A
42 there has not been a non-resident moose hunt since
43 2013.

44

45 The Unit 23 moose population has
46 declined substantially from an estimated 7,500 moose in
47 2016 to an estimated 5,600 moose in 2019. Bull/cow
48 ratios have also declined and low calf cow ratios
49 indicate a declining population. The unit 26A moose

50

0140

1 population is concentrated along rivers in the
2 southeastern portion of the unit. The population
3 remains low at around 400 animals but may be
4 rebounding. Since 2005, reported moose harvest in Unit
5 23 has averaged 142 moose. Since 2017, when ADF&G
6 closed the non-resident moose hunt, Unit 23 residents
7 have accounted for 76 percent of the reported harvest
8 and non-local residents, 24 percent. Total harvest
9 estimates for moose in Unit 23 range from 250 to 450
10 moose per year, which likely exceeds the harvestable
11 surplus. However, harvest by non-Federally-qualified
12 users has only averaged 27 moose per year since 2017.
13 Most, 86 percent of the reported harvest occurs during
14 August and September. The Kobuk River drainage, which
15 has the most moose in Unit 23 also experiences the
16 highest harvest pressure in the unit. In Unit 26A
17 total reported moose harvest averages only 3.5 moose
18 per year and harvest by non-Federally-qualified users
19 averages only one moose per year.

20

21 Since expanding into the Northwest
22 Arctic and then the North Slope region in the mid-20th
23 Century, moose have become an important secondary
24 resource for local residents. Declines in caribou tend
25 to increase reliance on alternative resources including
26 moose.

27

28 The Board directed OSM to compare moose
29 harvest by survey area. OSM utilized this data to
30 consider whether a partial Federal lands closure would
31 be appropriate. Please see Page 27 for this new
32 information.

33

34 Analysis of harvest by local and non-
35 local residents by major river drainage in Unit 23
36 revealed that the most moose harvest correlates
37 directly with moose abundance. The Kobuk River
38 drainage contain the highest moose population and
39 harvest levels by both user groups. Given the
40 substantial moose population declines across Unit 23,
41 low calf/cow ratios, declining bull/cow ratios, the
42 relatively high harvest pressure within the Kobuk River
43 drainage and the positive correlation between non-
44 Federally-qualified harvest and moose abundance, OSM
45 does not consider a partial closure in Unit 23 to be an
46 effective alternative. A partial closure would also
47 increase regulatory complexity and user confusion.

48

49 If this request is approved, only

50

0141

1 Federally-qualified subsistence users would be able to
2 harvest moose on Federal public lands in Units 23 and
3 26A in August and September this year. Approval of
4 this request could aid in the recovery of the Unit 23
5 moose population by reducing moose harvest by non-
6 Federally-qualified users. Closure to non-Federally-
7 qualified users during September may also reduce
8 disturbance to mating moose. While non-Federally-
9 qualified users are limited to bulls only, the bull/cow
10 ratios have declined across most of Unit 23. However,
11 non-Federally-qualified users only harvest around 27
12 moose each year from Unit 23 and it is uncertain
13 whether a closure would substantially reduce harvest
14 overall or simply increase it on State-managed lands
15 which could also increase user conflict and crowding on
16 State lands, especially those near communities and
17 Native-managed lands. If approved, people with family
18 connections in Unit 23, who are now residing outside
19 the region would not be able to harvest moose on
20 Federal public lands during August and September as
21 they are no longer Federally-qualified subsistence
22 users.

23

24 The OSM preliminary conclusion is to
25 support WSA21-01(b) with modification to close moose
26 hunting to non-Federally-qualified users on Federal
27 public lands in Unit 23 only.

28

29 So the justification for Unit 23 is
30 this request seeks to reduce moose harvest during the
31 peak of hunting season by non-Federally-qualified users
32 to protect a declining population that is important to
33 Federally-qualified subsistence users. There are
34 substantial conservation concerns that threaten the
35 viability of the Unit 23 moose population. Surveys
36 indicate substantial declines in almost every survey
37 area and population estimates are below State
38 objectives. Composition metrics are also poor as
39 bull/cow ratios have declined and calf/cow ratios are
40 low and are indicative of a declining moose population.
41 Additionally, the harvestable surplus may be exceeded.
42 Regulatory changes have been made to reduce harvest and
43 promote population recovery in Unit 23 under both
44 Federal and State regulations since 2017. However,
45 moose populations have continued to decline, approval
46 of this request could aid in the recovery of the Unit
47 23 moose population by reducing moose harvest by non-
48 Federally-qualified users.

49

50

0142

1 And, for Unit 26A. Currently, harvest
2 by non-local residents in Unit 26A is very low at an
3 average of only one moose per year, therefore, approval
4 of this request would probably not contribute to
5 conserving the moose population, it would be an
6 unnecessary restriction on non-subsistence users. The
7 Unit 26A controlled use area is already closed to the
8 use of aircraft for hunting moose from July 1st to
9 September 30th as well as January 1st to March 31st.

10

11 Thank you, Mr. Chair. Members of the
12 Council. That concludes my presentation and I'd be
13 happy to answer any questions, and my colleague, Hannah
14 Voorhees and Tom Plank are also online and available to
15 address any questions.

16

17 Thank you.

18

19 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
20 Lisa. Does anyone from the Council have any questions
21 or comments for this moose analysis for Lisa Grediagin.

22

23 MR. KRAMER: Mr. Chairman, it's
24 Michael.

25

26 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, go ahead, Mike.

27

28 MR. KRAMER: The question I have is are
29 they going to continue to do sectional surveys on a
30 yearly basis or is this going to -- since the
31 population has dropped pretty steadily, are they going
32 to try and double the areas that they're going to count
33 because of the lack of moose, and if not when is the
34 next -- or how often are we going to be doing these
35 counts and in which areas. You know that's a major
36 concern.

37

38 I know that I've seen in the past
39 trapping up below Ambler that, you know, the wolves do
40 take a lot of calves and a lot of moose no matter what
41 health they're in and, you know, also bears, they
42 predate -- predation on them pretty -- pretty hard.

43

44 I think that we need to do a full
45 closure on this one also other than local subsistence
46 users.

47

48 That's all I have.

49

50

0143

1 I'll be signing out here in a few
2 minutes, Thomas.

3

4 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you
5 for that reminder, Mike. Any other questions or
6 comments on this moose analysis.

7

8 MS. GREDIAGIN: Yeah, thanks for the
9 question, Mike, this is Lisa. And I think someone with
10 ADF&G or the National Park Service could probably
11 answer your question the best about the plan for
12 conducting surveys and which areas they do each year.
13 My understanding is that they just do one survey area
14 each year on kind of a rotating basis. But, again, if
15 anyone from ADF&G or Park Service can better answer
16 Mike's question, please go ahead.

17

18 MS. OSBURN: Hi, Mike, this is Christie
19 Osburn from Alaska Department of Fish and Game. Can
20 you guys hear me?

21

22 MR. KRAMER: Yes.

23

24 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, we can hear you
25 Christie.

26

27 MS. OSBURN: Yes, so through the Chair
28 to Member Kramer. We currently only do one survey area
29 a year and this is primarily because they're
30 logistically quite a challenge and fairly expensive to
31 conduct. Our next survey will be for the Lower Kobuk
32 area and so that will include most of the Kobuk and the
33 Squirrel River drainages, from Ambler down stream and
34 that'll be coming up this April. We're hoping to have
35 a number out, assuming we've got the weather, to
36 complete a survey. We're hoping we have a number out
37 by the end of April as to the updated abundance for the
38 Lower Kobuk.

39

40 That's all I've got for you.

41

42 MR. KRAMER: Okay, thank you. Eva,
43 could you make sure that we're emailed those numbers
44 when they do come out. This is Kramer, signing off.
45 Everybody have a good day and see you tomorrow.

46

47 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you for being
48 here Mike.

49

50

0144

1 MR. SHIEDT: Thanks, Mike.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: So with that any other
4 questions or comments about the moose analysis
5 before.....

6

7 MR. SCHAEFFER: Mr. Chairman, I
8 wouldn't mind commenting on this too. I think the
9 moose is in desperate -- same shape as the caribou.
10 You know I -- I -- and I account this mostly through
11 the predation, I -- I've been out in the country a lot
12 and it's not uncommon to find moose bones and hair all
13 over the place and -- and, you know, I think the wolf
14 population is out of control but I just feel for them
15 because as the snow gets deeper they have very little
16 chance of trying to escape a pack of wolves and I think
17 it's like that all over. And so, you know, I tend to
18 think that every has to do all they can to try to
19 preserve the moose. I know in talking with Eric
20 (Indiscernible) I -- we did -- tagging -- helped tagged
21 the moose calves it -- it's apparent that the calf
22 survival rate is way down as well. He mentioned -- he
23 just mentioned to me that one place he flew over with
24 his instrument and found the two moose that the female
25 had and went a little and saw a bear and then he came
26 back a little later and witnessed the bear killing both
27 the calves so, you know, when they want them they have
28 them and it's just that simple. And so it's just one
29 of those things where, you know, we have to -- if we
30 want the moose population to increase we have to give
31 as much help as we can and I think -- so that's why I'm
32 in total support of WSA21-01(b). I think it will help
33 tremendously.

34

35 Thank you.

36

37 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Bob. Any
38 other questions or comments at this time.

39

40 (No comments)

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, what is
43 the wish of the Council regarding WSA21-01(b).

44

45 MR. SCHAEFFER: Mr. Chairman.

46

47 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes.

48

49 MR. SCHAEFFER: I'd like to make a

50

0145

1 motion that we support WSA21-01(b).

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Motion made by Bob
4 Schaeffer.....

5

6 MR. HOWARTH: Second.

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER:do we have a
9 second.

10

11 MR. SHIEDT: Second.

12

13 MR. HOWARTH: Wilbur Howarth, second.

14

15 MS. ATORUK: I second it.

16

17 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Seconded by Barbara.

18 Can we get a roll call vote please, Hazel, to support

19 WSA21-01(b).

20

21 MS. SMITH: Okay, those in support of
22 WSA21-01(b).

23

24 Enoch Shiedt, Sr.

25

26 MR. SHIEDT: Yes, in support.

27

28 MS. SMITH: Thomas Christopher.....

29

30 MS. PATTON: Mr. Chair, and
31 Council.....

32

33 MS. SMITH:Baker.

34

35 MS. PATTON: This is Eva, can I just
36 please quickly clarify, was the Council wanting to
37 support WSA21-01(b) as written, or as modified by OSM,
38 just a point of clarification. Thank you.

39

40 MS. ATORUK: As written.

41

42 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara.

43

44 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yes, as written.

45

46 CHAIRMAN BAKER: As written, okay.

47

48 MS. PATTON: Okay, thank you so much
49 Mr. Chair and Council for that clarification.

50

0146

1 MS. SMITH: Okay, back to the vote of
2 WSA21-01(b) as written.

3
4 Enoch Shiedt, Sr., yes.

5
6 Thomas Christopher Baker.

7
8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes.

9
10 MS. SMITH: Hazel Smith Harris, yes.

11
12 Michael Chad Kramer just left.

13
14 MR. KRAMER: Yes.

15
16 MS. SMITH: Oh, you're there, Mike.

17
18 MR. KRAMER: Yeah, I'm just getting
19 ready to sign off.

20
21 MS. SMITH: Oh, okay, I'll mark you as
22 yes.

23
24 Calvin Donald Moto, II.

25
26 (No comments)

27
28 MS. SMITH: No response.

29
30 Wilbur Howarth, Sr.

31
32 MR. HOWARTH: Yes, in support.

33
34 MS. SMITH: Robert Joseph Schaeffer.

35
36 MR. SCHAEFFER: Yes.

37
38 MS. SMITH: Elmer Armstrong, Jr.

39
40 MR. ARMSTRONG: Yes.

41
42 MS. SMITH: Vern Cleveland, Sr.

43
44 MR. CLEVELAND: Yes.

45
46 MS. SMITH: Barbara M. Atoruk.

47
48 MS. ATORUK: Yes, in support.

49
50

0147

1 MS. SMITH: Okay. We have all yes,
2 nine vote yes and one no response.

3

4 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you,
5 Hazel. And so with that Northwest Arctic Regional
6 Advisory Council moves to support WSA21-01(b) as
7 written and the justification being fairly similar to
8 the justification of WSA21-01(a) in that this is our
9 attempt to do all that is within our power to protect
10 the moose population of our area as well as to continue
11 the opportunity for subsistence of the moose.

12

13 Would anyone like to add to the
14 justification for supporting this.

15

16 (No comments)

17

18 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Hearing none, Eva, is
19 that sufficient for a summary.

20

21 MS. ATORUK: Mr. Chair.

22

23 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, Barbara.

24

25 MS. ATORUK: Can we go on recess for
26 the rest of the -- and start tomorrow morning starting
27 at 9:00?

28

29 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Yes, I was going to
30 ask the Council if they'd like to do that once we
31 finished this WSA21-01. Eva, is that sufficient for
32 the summary and justification so we can move on.

33

34 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
35 Council. Yes, appreciate that and, again, I have your
36 detailed notes from the discussion leading up to the
37 Council's motion as well, which will be included in
38 your final justification to the Board.

39

40 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, thank you.

41

42 MS. PATTON: And -- okay, thank you,
43 Mr. Chair.

44

45 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Was there something
46 you were going to say Eva.

47

48 (Teleconference interference -
49 participants not muted - yelling)

50

0148

1 MS. PATTON: I was going to ask the
2 Council, Mr. Chair.....

3

4 REPORTER: I can't hear you Eva so
5 whoever's yelling online, probably having an outside
6 conversation, could you mute your phone please. I'm
7 having a hard time hearing the speaker.

8

9 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
10 Council. I was just going to confirm if there's any
11 further comments regarding the moose -- the Unit 26A
12 portion of the proposal, if there's any further
13 justification for support of that.

14

15 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

16

17 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Eva. I
18 don't believe there's any further comments and if
19 anyone else from the Council has anything they'd like
20 to add to the 26A portion they can.

21

22 MS. ATORUK: Yes, you did say that,
23 sir.

24

25 CHAIRMAN BAKER: I'm sorry, what was
26 that Barbara.

27

28 MS. ATORUK: Yeah, you did say that,
29 you said the justification would be the same as the (a)
30 one. Thank you.

31

32 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Thank you, Barbara. I
33 would say that the justification would go for both,
34 Eva.

35

36 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
37 Thank you, members of the Council.

38

39 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right, so at this
40 time it's now 4:43 and I believe Barbara made a motion
41 to recess until tomorrow morning, does anyone want to
42 make a second to that.

43

44 MS. SMITH: Second. Hazel.

45

46 CHAIRMAN BAKER: Seconded by Hazel.
47 All those in favor of recessing until tomorrow morning
48 at 9:00 a.m., please say aye.

49

50

0149

1 IN UNISON: Aye.

2

3 CHAIRMAN BAKER: And those opposed,

4 same sign.

5

6 (No opposing votes)

7

8 CHAIRMAN BAKER: All right. Well,

9 hearing none we'll go ahead and recess until tomorrow

10 morning at 9:00 a.m. Thank you everyone for joining us

11 and hope to hear, again, from everyone in the morning.

12 Have a nice evening.

13

14 MR. HOWARTH: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15

16 MS. ATORUK: Okay, good night.

17

18 MR. HOWARTH: And thank you, Eva.

19

20 MS. PATTON: Thank you.

21

22 MS. ATORUK: Thank you, Eva.

23

24 MS. PATTON: Have a good evening and

25 get some good rest and thank you all, thank you to the

26 Council.

27

28 MS. ATORUK: Okay, thank you for

29 calling me.

30

31 (Laughter)

32

33 (Off record)

34

35 (PROCEEDINGS TO BE CONTINUED)

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

0150

C E R T I F I C A T E

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
) ss.
STATE OF ALASKA)

I, Salena A. Hile, Notary Public in and for the state of Alaska and reporter for Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC, do hereby certify:

THAT the foregoing pages numbered ____ through ____ contain a full, true and correct Transcript of the NORTHWEST ARCTIC SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING, VOLUME I taken electronically on the 14th day of February 2022;

THAT the transcript is a true and correct transcript requested to be transcribed and thereafter transcribed by under my direction and reduced to print to the best of our knowledge and ability;

THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or party interested in any way in this action.

DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 25th day of February 2022.

Salena A. Hile
Notary Public, State of Alaska
My Commission Expires: 09/16/22