Structured Interviews and Avoiding Bias

Liz Koman, Landon Mock
I/O Personnel Psychologists
Strategic Talent Management
June, 2022
Overview

- What is a structured interview?
- Considerations for hiring interviews
- Key features
- Conducting the interview
- Bias
- Interview tips
- Takeaways
What is a Structured Interview?

- A type of job interview systematically asking about a candidate’s behavior and job-related competencies
  - In past experiences
  - In hypothetical situations
- Each candidate receives the same opportunity to demonstrate competencies
  - Standardized questioning
  - Standardized scoring process
Structured Interview

- Questions based on job-related competencies
- All candidates asked the same questions in same order
- Interviewers take detailed notes on responses
- All responses evaluated using the same rating scales and standards for acceptable answers
- Structured approach = more likely to identify high-performing employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High validity and face validity for applicants</td>
<td>Requires SME involvement to develop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple ratings/consensus leads to increased reliability</td>
<td>Resource intensive administration and rating process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legally defensible compared to unstructured, conventional interviews</td>
<td>Assessors must be trained in conducting and rating the interviews</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• **Competency: Interpersonal Skills** - Shows understanding, friendliness, courtesy, tact, empathy, concern, and politeness to others; develops and maintains effective relationships with others; may include effectively dealing with individuals who are difficult, hostile, or distressed; relates well to people from varied backgrounds and different situations; is sensitive to cultural diversity, race, gender, disabilities, and other individual differences.

• **Lead Question:** Describe a situation in which you dealt with individuals who were difficult, hostile, or distressed.

• **Probing Questions:** Who was involved? What specific actions did you take? What was the outcome?
## SI: Example Rating Scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proficiency Level</th>
<th>1- Low</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3-Average</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5- Outstanding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benchmark Definition</td>
<td>Handles interpersonal situations involving little or no tension or discomfort</td>
<td></td>
<td>Handles interpersonal situations involving a moderate degree of tension or discomfort</td>
<td></td>
<td>Handles interpersonal situations involving a high degree of tension or discomfort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 1</td>
<td>Example 2</td>
<td>Example 3</td>
<td>Example 4</td>
<td>Example 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioral Example</td>
<td>Refers employees to the appropriate staff member</td>
<td>Works with others on a cross-functional team</td>
<td>Establishes cooperative working relationships with manager</td>
<td>Facilitates an open forum to discuss employee concerns</td>
<td>Diffuses an emotionally charged meeting with external stakeholders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Considerations for Hiring Interviews

- Utilized to add consistency
- Hiring vs. rating and ranking
- Preserving vets preference
Key Features

- Choose competencies
- Question types
- Probe questions
Choose Competencies

• Ensure competencies are included in job analysis
• Structured Interviews are well-suited for assessing “soft skill” competencies, such as
  – Teamwork
  – Interpersonal Skills
  – Conflict Management
• Choose around 4-6 competencies to assess per interview
• Use one or more question per competency
  – Will depend on complexity of competency
Interview Questions

• Based on the “STAR” model
  – Situation or Task – Describes the context or background for the event or tasks involved
  – Action – Describes exactly what was done or what would be done
  – Result – Describes the consequences of the candidate’s actions
Question Types

• Behavioral
  – Draw from a candidate’s past experiences
  – Best predictor of future behavior is past behavior under similar circumstances

• Situational
  – Present realistic job scenarios or problems and ask how candidates would respond
  – People’s intentions are closely related to their actual behavior
Probe Questions

• “Follow up” questions
• Guide the candidate in providing sufficient information
• Each question has a list of acceptable probe questions
• Narrow in on candidates’ specific actions
• No yes/no questions
• Do not stray from pre-defined probes
BIAS
Types of Bias

- Confirmation Bias: The tendency to seek out information that supports something you already believe (you remember the hits and forget the misses). People will cue into things that matter to them, and dismiss the things that don’t (Ostrich effect).
- Anchoring Bias: Relying too heavily on the first piece of information they receive.
- Selection Bias: The way individuals notice things more when something has happened to make us notice that particular thing more.
- Observer Bias: Occurs when your evaluation of another person is influenced by your own inherent cognitive biases.
- Information Bias: Bias that refers to the idea that getting more information will help in better decision-making, even if the extra information is irrelevant to the actual subject at hand.
Types of Bias

- **In-Group Bias**: How people are more likely to support or believe someone within their own social group than an outsider.

- **Cultural Bias**: An unconscious bias where we perceive other cultures as being unique based on a comparison to our own. It creates attitudes or stereotypes that can affect or influence our decisions in an unconscious way.

- **Fundamental Attribution Error**: Attributing someone else’s behavior to existing, unfounded stereotypes, while attributing that similar behavior in yourself to external factors.

- **Availability Bias**: The tendency to use the information we can quickly recall when evaluating a topic or idea—even if the information is not the best representation of the topic or idea.

- **Self-Serving Bias**: Assumption that good things happen to us when we’ve done all the right things, but bad things happen to us because or circumstances outside of our control.
Bias

• Bias due to knowledge of predictor information
• Bias due to group membership
• Bias in Ratings
Interviewer Tips

- Create a comfortable atmosphere
- Be an attentive and unbiased listener
- Take comprehensive notes
- Remain objective and fair
- Treat all candidates the same
- Be organized and prepared
- Look and act cordial, interested, and professional
Interviewer Tips

• Know the competencies, questions, rating scale, and example responses
• Focus on the candidates’ responses, not the candidate
• Take detailed notes on the responses, not the candidate
• Compare the responses to the example responses for each rating level using the rating rubric
• Remain objective
Interviewer Tips

• Ensure a positive atmosphere (in person or online)
  – Helps put candidates at ease
  – Encourages candidates to go into more detail
  – Promotes a positive image of the organization

• Build a positive atmosphere by
  – Greeting, introductions, and professionalism
  – Using candidates’ names (correctly)
  – Treating candidates with respect
  – Making eye contact
  – Thanking candidates for their time
Preparation

• All candidates should receive same amount of time
  – Allow time for introductions, instructions, responses to each question, an informal discussion about the position, and determining ratings for each question

• Ensure adequate facilities for interview
  – Should be quiet, comfortable, and accessible
  – Candidates should not come into contact with one another
Candidate Arrival

- Ensure someone meets the candidate at security desk and lead them to interview location (if applicable)
  - Adjust if virtual
- Greet the candidate and introduce yourself
- Explain the interview process
- Ask if the candidate has any questions
- Formally begin the interview
Questioning

• Ask the same pre-determined questions in the same order
  – Probes may be used if necessary
• Be aware of your body language and facial expressions
• Never ask about any non-relevant, potentially discriminatory information
Taking Notes

• Take detailed notes of the candidates’ responses
  – Summarize the content of actual responses
  – Be professional and non-judgmental
• Notes should not
  – Be evaluative
  – Refer to demographic characteristics of candidate
Wrap Up

• After the candidate has responded to all questions, conclude the interview
  – Thank the candidate
  – Ask the candidate to keep interview details confidential
  – Answer general questions about the position
  – Explain the next steps in the hiring process
  – Ensure they know how to exit the building or have them escorted out
Things to Avoid

- Don’t rely on first impressions
- Don’t focus on superficial factors
- Beware candidate order effects
- Disregard nonverbal behaviors
- Going off script
Things to Avoid

- “Similar to me”
- “Halo” effect
- Leniency/strictness
- Central tendency
Accessing Interview Items

- Keep interview items and rating scales secure
  - Do not provide to potential candidates
  - Keep printed materials in a secure location
  - Maintain digital files securely
  - Collect all materials at conclusion of each interview
Takeaways

• Standardize the interview process
• Ensure objectivity
• Professionalism
• Keep interview materials secure
Questions?

Landon Mock
Landon_Mock@ios.doi.gov

Liz Koman
Elizabeth_Koman@ios.doi.gov